The State Commission of Inquiry into the Mount Meron Disaster

Interim recommendations in preparatio for the Hillula in 5782

Commission Members:

Supreme Court President (Ret.), Justice Miriam Naor - Chairman of the Commission

Rabbi Mordechai Karelitz - Commission member

Major General (Res.) Shlomo Yanai - Commission member

Appointed by the Supreme Court President, the Honorable Esther Hayut

Pursuant to Israel Government Resolution no. 7 dated 20.06.2021

Jerusalem
Kislev 5782 - November 2021

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

The State Commission of Inquiry into the Mount Meron Disaster

Interim recommendations in preparatio for the Hillula in 5782

Table of Contents

Introduction 5

Background - The Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb and the Lag BaOmer Hillua at Meron 7

The Issues at Hand 9

Recommendations 8

A. Appointment of a Minister in Charge 9

B. Improvement of Infrastructures and Removal of Safety Hazards 10

C. Preventing Unusual Crowd Density at the Hillula 11

C(1) - Increasing the area available to the audience 11

C(2) Channeling the Audience at the Hillula 12

C(3) Encouraging Audience Turnover at the Mountain Area 15

D. Dispersion of the Audience at the Mountain and Preventing Abnormal Density at Safety Foci 15

D(1) The Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb Mark 15

D(2) Bonfire Lighting Ceremonies 16

D(3) “Upsherin” 16

D(4) Distribution of Food and Beverage 16

E. Timetables 17

Comments in Conclusion 18

Appendices 20

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

Introduction

1. During the Lag BaOmer Hillula, on Iyar 18 5781 (30.4.2021), a horrendous disaster took place at the site of Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb. The disaster claimed the lives of forty-five men and children, and led to the injury of over 150 additional people. At the out start, we wish to convey our deepest sorrow once again for the families of the deceased and wish the wounded a full recovery.

2. On 20.6.2021, the Israeli Government resolved, pursuant to section 1 of the Commissions of Inquiry Law, 5729-1968 (hereinafter: the "Commissions of Inquiry Law"), to establish a Commission of Inquiry to investigate the event and for preventing the occurrence of similar events[1].

3. On 27.6.2021, based on the Government resolution and by virtue of the power vested in her pursuant to section 4 of the Commissions of Inquiry Law, Supreme Court President the Honorable Justice Esther Hayut, appointed the inquiry commission members [2].

4. In the Government resolution on the establishment of the Commission it was stated, inter alia, that "if necessary, the Commission would consider publishing an interim report in order to enable proper preparation for the next Hillula event"[3]. The aforementioned wording assumes that a Hillula would take place at the site of the Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb on the upcoming Lag BaOmer, 5782. In this regard, we recommend considering the nature of the event on the first traumatic anniversary of the disaster.

5. In light of the horrible disaster that occurred in 5781 and the urgent need for changes that would reduce the risks to the participants' wellbeing, we are submitting at this time principled recommendations for safe preparation for the Hillula in 5782. We see it important to publish the recommendations as soon as possible, in order to enable the implementing entities sufficient time for preparation.

6. Over the few months since the Commission was established, we collected material from various entities, analyzed it as well as requested and obtained supplements. Additionally, we conducted two visits on site and heard the testimonies of more than fifty witnesses who appeared before the Commission. Although the Commission's work is still in progress, it is already now clear that the Hillula is a complex event, with many details, which includes the involvement of many parties. Various witnesses have testified before us that planning and preparing for the event commence many months prior to its date.

7. The interim recommendations were drafted in accordance with the stage we are

[1] Resolution 7 of the 36' Government "Establishment of a state commission of inquiry regarding the tragedy that took place at the Lag BaOmer Hillula at Meron Mountain" (20.6.2021).

[2] Letter of Appointment dated 27.6.2021.

[3] In section 2(e) of the Government Resolution

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

at. In this regard there is structured tension between the need to elaborate and explain the recommendations and the obligation to grant anyone who may be adversely affected by the Commission's work his day in Court, as legally required. We knowingly opted to grant at this stage priority to the duty imposed on us to grant anyone who may be adversely affected by the investigation or its outcome the possibility to defend himself. Therefore, our recommendations shall be brief and focused, and shall mainly discuss the near future. The recommendations do not indicate the liability of anyone for the disaster and it may not be deduced from our suggestions that anyone who acted otherwise in the past - had erred. The question of the various parties' liability, both those who have already testified before the Commission as well as those who are destined to testify before it, shall be examined later on. If necessary, warning shall be given to those who may be adversely affected, and they shall be given the possibility to defend themselves as provided in section 15 under the Commissions of Inquiry Law. We shall address all these, as well as the recommendations for the more distant future, later in the Commission's work.

8. At this time, as aforementioned, we are submitting solely the recommendations required for preparing for the 5782 Hillula. Naturally, these recommendations do not exhaust all the issues the Commission shall engage in later on, or the Commission's findings, conclusions and recommendations.

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

Background - The Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb and the Lag BaOmer Hillula at Meron

9. The Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb at Meron Mountain is a Jewish religious site that draws a mass of visitors annually. According to tradition, the Rabbinic Sage Shimon Bar Yochai and his son Rabbi Eleazar are buried at the site. It appears that the importance and meaning of the Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb for the people arriving at Meron cannot be overstated, all year round and especially on Lag BaOmer. On this date Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai passed away, and according to tradition, on Lag BaOmer, prior to his death, many secrets of the Torah were revealed to him.

10. Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai is one of the few persons the Talmud discusses as being "experienced in miracles". The visit to the Tomb raises a special sense of sanctity and ascension with many, and it was already stated that “at the cave of rocks you stayed, where you acquired your glory and splendor”[4] as well as “his teachings protect us, they illuminate us, he will speak well of us, our Master Bar Yochai"[5] .

11. The custom of lighting up bonfires on Lag BaOmer symbolizes the special light of Torah that was revealed by Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai, and hundreds of thousands arrive on Lag BaOmer to pray and participate in the Hillula celebration, song and dance. Additionally, it is an ancient custom to conduct the “upsherin” ceremony on Lag BaOmer - the first haircut for a child at the age of three, and it is mentioned in Jewish literature that Ha'ARI of blessed memory took his son for an “upsherin” at Meron as customary long ago. Many wish to continue tradition by this custom.

12. There is evidence of the existence of the Hillula on Lag BaOmer at Meron already over 400 years ago, during which a broad public went up to the complex built around the Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb for prayer, celebrations, dances and lighting a bonfire. Over the last two centuries the lighting ceremony was granted to the Rebbe Israel of Ruzhyn and his successors and descendants, the Rebbes of Boyan. The Rebbe of Boyan or his proxy lit a fire that was built on the roof of the Tomb [6].

13. Over the years the traditional lighting was conducted by the Rabbis of Tzfat as the Rebbe’s proxies, and over the last thirty years the Rebbe of Boyan, Rabbi Nachum Dov Brayer, great grandson of the Rebbe of Ruzhyn, lights the traditional lighting. Over the last 20 years, additional lightings were added, and over the years their numbers have grown.

14. The Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb is acknowledged as a holy place pursuant

---

[4] Taken from Bar Yochai Poem

[5] Taken from a poem you say well done, Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai

[6] “Oded Bar “Between Tradition and Innovation: The Anniversary of the Redemption of Tzfat and the Hillula at Meron, 5709” Reflections on the Revival of Israel (Issue Series, Vol. VII) Beyond the Halacha, 284 (2014)

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

to the Protection of Jewish Holy Places Regulations, 5741-1981, which were promulgated by virtue of the Protection of Jewish Holy Places Law, 5727-1967.

15. This long-standing tradition, as well as its importance and meaning for those arriving at Meron, were in our hearts upon establishing the recommendations for the upcoming Hillula. At the same time, we continuously saw the too heavy to bear price before us, which the disaster that occurred at the 5781 Hillula claimed.

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

The Issues at Hand

16. The Commission's work indicates that in order to safely conduct a Hillula in 5782, several main issues must be addressed.

    First, this is a complex event involving many entities, including Government officials, the Israel Police, the National Fire and Rescue Services Authority, the National Center for the Development of Holy Places, VaAdat HaHamisha, the various Hasidic dynasties, first aid organizations and others. Preparation for the event requires overall vision, coordination and collaboration among all those involved.

    Second, the site used for the Hillula is awash with harmful hazards that endanger the safety of visitors at the site, both routinely as well as during the Hillula, as a large audience arrives at the site.

    Third, the Hillula event draws a very large audience, and a dense crowd is formed around the entire mountain, and especially at certain points of time and certain points of interest.

17. The recommendations below are intended to provide a solution for the said issues regarding the Hillula event in 5782, without setting a precedent for the years to come. We should note and emphasize, we saw it fit to present interim recommendations only to enable adequate preparation for the Hillula in 5782, as the timetables do not allow waiting on this issue for completion of expert opinions, completing additional inquiries or completion of the Commission's work. Nothing more than that specified in the recommendations is to be deduced, and the Commission's work is still continuing after them.

18. Once we stated all this, we shall refer to the recommendations themselves.

Recommendations

A. Appointment of a Minister in Charge

19. As aforementioned, the total material that was placed before the Commission indicates that many different entities take part in planning, preparation and operation of the Hillula every year.

20. Given the multiple entities involved in it and the characteristics of the event and its complexity, we recommend that the Israeli Government would appoint one of the Government ministers who would be in charge of the upcoming Hillula.

21. We recommend that the minister in charge would appoint an executing party, with appropriate know-how and experience, who would organize and manage the

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

Hillula per his instructions and subject to his guidelines.

22. We recommend that the minister in charge would define, upon commencement of preparations for the event, the duties and the areas of responsibility of the relevant government offices and those of the other parties involved, as well as the work interfaces between them.

23. We further recommend that the powers of the minister in charge would include:

    a. Setting out an outline for the Hillula, all in accordance with these interim recommendations;

    b. Setting out a plan for preparations for the Hillula;

    c. Setting forth timetables for preparation for the Hillula;

    d. Use of the budget dedicated to the Hillula;

    e. Instructing all parties on all required for preparing for the Hillula;

    f. Tracking and monitoring implementation of his instructions and progress of the preparation;

    g. Decision on disputes among the various parties, should any arise;

B. Improvement of Infrastructures and Removal of Safety Hazards

24. We have learned from the reports and opinions of safety experts on the existence of dangerous facilities and many safety hazards on the Mountain site. As far as we know, since the disaster, activities were carried out for removal of some of the safety hazards and improvement of the infrastructures. However, the work has not been completed as of yet.

25. It is required to conduct an up-to-date safety survey at once, which considers also the latest changes made on the area. It is required to remove and dispose of all of the hazards and dangerous facilities on the Mountain site. Should there be a legal prevention to do so, it is required to carefully fence the place of danger and prevent access to it.

26. Additionally, the safety experts are required to prepare a plan for improvement of the infrastructure in the safety aspects, which could be implemented up to the date to be set forth by the minister in charge, in a manner that would ensure its completion within sufficient time before Lag Ba0mer 5782. It is possible to include in the plan temporary measures, such as temporary stairs, emergency passages, safety fences and the like, all pursuant to an up-to-date safety survey and the

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

instructions of safety experts and subject to obtaining suitable permits and per the provisions under law.

27. Shortly prior to the Hillula date it is required to conduct an additional safety examination, in order to ensure that every measure that was established complies with the safety provisions, that there are no more safety hazards, and that the entire area meets the safety requirements. In the safety examination it is required to consider the event's characteristics and movement of the expected audience there.

C. Preventing Unusual Crowd Density at the Hillula

28. The Commission's work so far shows that one of the main challenges at the Hillula is the crowd density of the visitors. In order to conduct the Hillula safely, it is required to take measures that would ensure that no unusual crowd density would be established on the Mountain area and at certain points of interest within it. For doing so we recommend:

    (1) Increasing most of the area available to the audience during the Hillula;

    (2) Channeling the audience at the Hillula, in a manner that at no given time there would be unusual and congestive crowd density;

    (3) Encouraging audience turnover at the Mountain area.

    Ultimately, these steps are intended to bring about a situation where anyone who wishes to arrive at the Mountain on Lag BaOmer and stay there for a reasonable time, would be able to do so.

C(1). Increasing the area available to the audience

29. In order to ensure that no excessive crowd density is formed during the Hillula, it is required to first and foremost, and to the extent possible, increase the available area at the Mountain for use by the visitors.

30. We recommend evacuating all those holding areas on the Mountain unlawfully. We shall not note individual cases as we are not the Court and the persons concerning the issue did not voice their arguments before us. Therefore we shall settle with a general recommendation to take all the legal measures necessary to evacuate those holding areas on the Mountain unlawfully, and to do so as soon as possible, so that the areas to be cleared may serve the audience already on Lag BaOmer 5782.

31. Additionally, we recommend refraining from allowing setting tents, structures

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

and overnight stay at the Mountain during the upcoming Hillula, and refrain from allocating areas to "family' compounds" The Mountain area is limited and providing parts of it for temporary residence reduces the area available to the entire public, and as a result contributes to the density. In this regard we should note that a petition where petitioners claimed of the existence of a legal right to hold the land was recently rejected by the High Court of Justice, after the petitioners withdrew the petition upon the Court's suggestion.[7] In the State's response to the petition it was explicitly stated that following the disaster on Lag BaOmer 5781, it is possible that the arrangement set out in the "Procedure for Allocating Areas to Families during the Lag BaOmer Event at the Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb site at Meron" published by the National Center for Holy Places in February 2021, would be changed. We indeed recommend refraining from acting pursuant to this Procedure at the upcoming Hillula, and refrain from allocating areas to "family compounds."

C(2). Channeling the Audience at the Hillula

32. Besides increasing most of the Mountain area available for public use at the Hillula, we recommend taking measures that would regulate the audience's entry to the area of the Hillula, so that at any given time the scope of the audience at the Mountain would not exceed the number of participants the Mountain area can contain safely. In order to do so, we recommend setting a maximal "target number" that complies with the safety requirements and regulates the arrival at the Mountain according to the designated target number. Regulation would be conducted by controlling transportation, as shall be specified below.

33. As aforementioned, we recommend setting a "target number" - the maximal number of people that can be safely contained at the Mountain area at the same time. The target number is derived from the available vacant area for public use at the Mountain and the relevant safety instructions regarding dense occupation, including instructions on exits and escape openings.

34. We cannot set the "target number" at this time. In order to do so, it is required to complete the evacuation of the area as stated, conduct inspections and measurements on site and calculate the maximal audience occupation considering all safety requirements. We should note that the material brought before the Commission and testimonies heard by it, indicate that the maximal number of people that could be safely contained at the area at the same time is approximately 20,000.

[7] HCJ 2538/21 Tife'ert Yahadut Sfarad Association v. The National Center for Holy Places (11.10.21).

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

35. The safety experts, as aforementioned, should set the up-to-date target number, after conducting the operations required for increasing the available area, and after up-to-date measurements and calculations, and also considering the number of emergency exists required by the safety experts.

36. Per our request, the Planning and Organization Department at the Israel Police made assessments (approximate) of the available area at the Mountain and measurements thereof. The measurements indicate that the available area, per initial approximation, for public use stands at 22,900 square meters. Additionally, the area of the public entry paths to the Mountain stands at 6,900 square meters. [8]It should be emphasized that a final determination of the available area would be made by safety engineers who would take into account topographical and engineering characteristics, as well as other constraints on the Mountain area.

37. We recommend that calculation of the crowd occupancy at the open area would be conducted in the spirit of the criteria set by the Security and Licensing Department at the Israel Police in accordance with item 7.7e of Business Licensing Order (Businesses Requiring Licensing), 5773-2013: (amphitheater, other venue for holding cultural, entertainment and sport events for 500 or more participants). We draw attention to the criterion according to which the occupancy coefficient at the standing view area would be calculated according to a ratio of 1 square meter per person and the criteria regarding passage areas, exit openings and escape routes in an open location.

38. Towards the date of the Hillula and during that time, we recommend taking measures that would ensure that the audience at the Mountain at any given time would not exceed the "target number" to be determined. In order to do so, we recommend regulating the arrival of the audience at the Mountain area, through a transportation plan and national transportation that would regulate the number of visitors throughout the Hillula hours. The idea of regulation through transportation as a central tool for controlling the number of people staying at the mountain at the same time, is not new and arises from the documents presented to us and the testimonies we heard.

39. We recommend that arrival by vehicle to the Hillula at Meron Mountain would be in buses and shuttles from regulated parking areas for this purpose only (as it has been in recent years).

40. From what we have learned, the authorities have data on the number of buses, shuttles and vehicles arriving at the area. The data are obtained not only regarding

[8] Maps dated 8.11.2021 are attached as an appendix to our recommendations. It was clarified to us that this is a geographic measurement, which does not address engineering data, such as slopes.

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

the date of the Hillula itself, but rather also in respect of a certain period prior to it. These data, together with the data on the transportation leaving the Mountain, enable approximate estimation of the number of people staying at the Mountain at any given time. The data, know-how and experience that have accumulated over the past few years within the transportation and shuttles domain enable preparation in advance of a national shuttles'[9] plan that would enable regulation of the arrival at the Mountain so that the number of people staying there would comply with the target number to be set forth.

41. According to the data presented to the Commission and the testimonies heard by it, it is indicated that in 2019 approximately 125 thousand participants arrived at the Hillula at the Mountain by public transport, approximately 40 thousand by private organized transportation and approximately 35 thousand private cars . As aforementioned, the data enable establishing a shuttle plan that would distribute the visitors over all hours of the Hillula, in a manner that anyone wishing to do so would be able to arrive.

42. This would be enabled by selling tickets in advance and according to the targets of the plan and required coordination of the time of arrival of the private transportation at the parking lots, from which they leave for Meron Mountain. Arrival of private vehicles at the parking lots designed for this would be enabled only from 22:00 (or a later hour to be determined).

43. The Ministry of Transportation and the Israel Police shall be entrusted with the preparation of the plan for transport and shuttles to the Mountain, execution thereof and controlling it. Needless to say that the implementation of this complex plan in such large scopes requires exercising discretion and adjustments in real time (such as a temporary delay of shuttles on the way to the Mountain).

44. We recommend considering a combination of technological measures that would assist in best estimation of the number of people staying at the Mountain area at a given time.

45. In addition to arrival by transportation and shuttles from the parking lots, visitors arrive on foot from the Town of Meron and also from nearby towns. In this regard we should note that the appropriate authorities are required to supervise and ensure that accommodation and stay in these towns would be solely at places designed for residence and accommodation pursuant to the law.

[9] The Ministry of Transportation's proposal, per our request, for a principled plan for managing the shuttle layout to Meron Mountain on the date of the Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Hillula, dated 9.11.21.

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

C(3). Encouraging Audience Turnover at the Mountain Area

46. The number of people wishing to arrive at the Hillula is much larger than the number of participants that the Mountain can safely contain at the same time. In order to enable anyone who wishes to arrive at the Hillula, and as a supplementary step to the recommendations regarding regulation of the arrival of the public, we recommend encouragement of turnover of the visitors at the Mountain area.

47. In this regard, we recommend shortening the time of stay at the Mountain, both by selling round-trip tickets to the Mountain, which are limited in time, as well as by limiting the time of stay at the Mountain for the private transportation. We recommend informing the public in advance of the transportation and shuttles plan, in order to enable it to prepare accordingly. Additionally, we recommend conducting broad publicity operations explaining, that the plan is intended to enable a broad public to the extent possible to fulfill its wish to arrive at Meron and stay on at the Mountain for a reasonable time.

D. Dispersion of the Audience at the Mountain and Preventing Abnormal Density at Safety Foci

48. We recommend taking measures for dispersing the public within the Mountain area, for preventing abnormal density at safety foci. In order to do so, we recommend exercising methods for channeling the public. Additionally, we considered the main points of interest at the Hillula: the Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb Mark, the bonfire lighting ceremonies, “upsherin” and distribution of food, and these are our recommendations in their regard.

D(1). The Rabbi Shimon Bar Yochai Tomb Mark

49. A main crowd density center during the Hillula is the Mark of the Tomb and its surrounding area. A large audience wishes to enter the building and pray at the Mark. This data, along with the unique characteristics of the building, establish a significant safety challenge, which requires special attention. Thus we recommend regulating the audience located at the Mark at any given time.

50. In order to do so, it is required to determine, assisted by experts, the maximal visitors’ occupancy at the Mark complex, both in the women's compound and the men's compound, considering the available area at each compound, the exit openings, and pursuant to the provisions of the law. Accordingly, it is required to monitor the number of people staying at the Mark and ensure that it does not exceed the maximum audience occupancy at any given time.

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

In order to enable entry to the Mark for anyone wishing to do so, it is required to encourage audience turnover during the peak hours. The testimonies we heard indicate that for this purpose, at the women's compound use was made of a regulated walking path that led to prayers' movement and turnover. We propose considering a similar path also at the men's compound. It is recommended to be assisted by ushers from among the Ultra-Orthodox community and provide them with suitable training in advance.

51. Additionally, we recommend adapting several places close to the Mark, so that they would be shaded and comfortable for both men and women, where they may pray for a longer period of time.

D(2). Bonfire Lighting Ceremonies

52. We recommend that in 5782 only one central bonfire would be lit during the Hillula, on the roof of the Mark, by the Rebbe of Boyan. We further recommend that the lighting ceremony would be brief, as was customary in the past.

53.53. We should emphasize, and here we look forward to the more distant future, that we respect the wishes of many people, from among various groups, to conduct additional lightings. We already deliberated upon the importance of the place for those arriving at it, and the multiple lightings over the last two decades. We shall address this later during the Commission's work; however, we assess that conducting additional lightings outside the Mountain area is something that requires making suitable compounds fit and obtaining third party agreements, and cannot be executed prior to Lag BaOmer 5782. Hence, we recommend, as aforementioned, that this year only one central lighting would be conducted.

D(3). "Upsherin"

54. We recommend adapting places for "upsherin" events at the Mountain area. These are relatively limited events in time and place, which could be conducted at places that are not at density locations, such as in Compound 4 or Compound 7 on the map attached to our recommendations.

D(4). Distribution of Food and Beverage

55. We recommend not to enable distribution of food this year (except for beverages) at the Mountain area during the Hillula. This would not only increase the area available to the public at the Mountain and reduce the duration of stay, but also reduce the danger of falling and slipping on garbage.

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

E. Timetables

56. Meeting the timetable to be set forth is a necessary condition for proper and safe preparation for the upcoming Hillula event, knowing that time is short and there is much to do. It should be assumed that most of the processes and preparations would be conducted at the same time.

57. We recommend that the minister in charge would be appointed immediately.

58. We recommend that the Government would budget the Hillula event 5782 as soon as possible, this in order to enable commencement of execution of the infrastructure improvements and removal of hazards as early as possible.

59. We recommend that the outline of the event and the safety requirements would be finalized no later than one month following publication of our recommendations, in order to enable maximal time for preparations and actual execution.

60. We further recommend to complete implementation of the safety requirements, including the required evacuation and repair of the safety malfunctions, up to approximately one month prior to the event.

61. We also recommend completing the operational plan permits up to one month prior to the event.

62. Finally, we recommend completion of all preparations for the Lag BaOmer 5782 events up to ten days prior to the Hillula.

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

Comments in Conclusion

63. In conclusion we would like to emphasize that nothing of that stated above is to derogate from the general duties imposed on the various parties to act, each in their own domain, in preparation for the event and ensuring the wellbeing of the participants and their safety. In addition, the aforesaid is not to derogate from the powers under law to issue instructions for coping with the corona virus if the need arises.

64. Although the attempts to legally regulate issues concerning mass events have not yet succeeded, this does not mean that we have to "reinvent the wheel." We noted above the criteria set forth by the Security and Licensing Department at the Israel Police in accordance with item 7.7 of the Business Licensing Order (amphitheater, other venue for holding cultural, entertainment and sport events for 500 or more participants). There are additional relevant normative sources, and it would be correct to act in their spirit. As part of these we should note IS 5688 - Safety in Mass Events (although it is not binding), as promulgation of two out of its three parts had been completed long ago, as well as the "Operational Preparation for Mass Events" of the Operations Division of the Police[10] as well as the Safety at Public Areas Law, 5723-1962 and the regulations by virtue thereof.

65. We have learned that the parties involved work for a long time prior to the event on safety inspections, preparation of operational plans, practicing emergency drills, etc. The duty to do so remains intact and the interim recommendations do not reduce the importance of the overall preparation for the event.

66. We are aware that our proposal constitutes a significant change for those who annually arrive at the Mountain. Therefore, broad publicity operations are required, and we recommend that the public leaders be involved, particularly the leaders of the Ultra-Orthodox public. The changes and steps we recommend are intended to protect public safety and wellbeing, in the sense of "Take utmost care and guard yourself diligently," as well as to enable anyone who so wishes to arrive at Meron Mountain on Lag BaOmer. In the same manner as one person wishes to go up to the Mountain and pray at the Mark - so do many other tens of thousands of persons wish to do so. Dispersion of the crowd during all hours of the Hillula and limiting the time of stay at the Mountain, while considering others, would enable anyone who so wishes to arrive at the Hillula and stay there for a reasonable time. This is deemed the Mitzvah of "thou shalt love thy neighbor as thyself."

67. This, it appears, is the time of willingness of all parties involved in organizing the

[10] Operations Directorate Procedure no. 221.110.03"Operational Preparation for Mass Events" (29.7.2020)

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

event, and that of those participating in it, including the leaders of the Ultra-Orthodox public, leaders of the Hassidic dynasties, and the tens of thousands of participants attending the event. We hope that the Government will have full cooperation in implementing the recommendations at once, already this upcoming Lag BaOmer.

Miriam Naor
Chairman of the Commission
Supreme Court President (ret.)

Rabbi Mordechai Karelitz
Commission member

Major General (Res.) Shlomo Yanai
Commission member

Jerusalem,
Kislev 5782
November 2021

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021

Appendices

Appendix “A” - Division into Compounds



Removal of land cover- not for public use

Meron Events 2021
Division into Compounds

Compound	Name	Area in sqm
1	Boyan small	2,700
2	Shuvu Banim	1,900
3	Toldos Aharon	3,000
4	Toldos Avrohom	2,300
5	Remainder of the Mountain	7,900
6	Tomb Mark	1,200
7	Family compound	3,900

The entire Mountain compound, including the Tomb Mark and the family compounds	Area in sqm
	22,900

The figure was drafted on 8.11.2021 based on an up-to-date aerial photo as of 2020 and a visit on site that was conducted on 17.10 with representatives on behalf of the Northern District. Approved by the Northern District on 8.11

Appendix “B” - Path of Public Entry Marked in Red



Removal of land cover- not for public use

Path of public entry marked in red	Area in square meters
	6,900

הנהלת בתי המשפט, מזהה סער: 4700-1047-2021-000770, התקבל ב - 24/11/2021