



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Justice

ANNEX NO. I

Additional Information

Attached to the 6th Periodic Report Concerning

THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INTERNATIONAL
CONVENTION ON THE ELIMINATION OF ALL FORMS
OF DISCRIMINATION AGAINST WOMEN (CEDAW)

According to the List of Issues under the Simplified Reporting Mechanism

2017

Table of Contents

Question 6	3
Question 7	8
Question 8	13
Question 9	15
Question 10	16
Question 12	24
Question 13	29
Question 14	35
Question 17	37
Question 18	42
Question 19	43
Question 20	47
Question 21	51
Question 22	57
Question 23	66
Question 24	69

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

GOI- The Government of Israel

AAW- the Authority for the Advancement of the Status of Women

ADBN - the Authority for Development and Housing of the Bedouins in the Negev

DIPO- Department for Investigation of Police Officers (under the auspice of the Ministry of Justice)

IDF - Israel Defense Forces

IPS- Israel Prison Service

LAA- Legal Aid Administration

MOEI- Ministry of Economy and Industry

MOE – Ministry of Education

MOH- Ministry of Health

MOJ- Ministry of Justice

MFA- Ministry of Foreign Affairs

MOLSASS- The Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs and Social Services

MOI- Ministry of Interior

MPS- Ministry of Public Security

NATU- The National Anti-Trafficking Unit

PIBA- The Population and Immigration Authority (under the auspice of the Ministry of Interior)

Question 6 – Access to justice

Steps taken by the LAA to address challenges with regard to women's access to courts, including Bedouin women

- **In June 2016, a branch of the LAA was established in Rahat, the largest Bedouin city in the Negev.** This branch is designated to provide legal assistance to the Bedouin population from Rahat and the surrounding area. The branch was opened to raise the level of accessibility to the court system by Bedouin applicants, especially women, who, due to the prevailing character and norms, and economic obstacles, were generally less likely to approach the District Branch of the LAA in Be'er-Sheva. Between June 2016 and December 2016, 130 Bedouin women received legal assistance in the Branch in issues of personal status, national insurance rights, and other civil matters.
- **Increasing awareness and accessibility:** in order to increase awareness and to enhance the accessibility of Bedouin women to legal aid and legal rights in general, several joint meetings and day seminars took place by the LAA in cooperation with social workers from Rahat, NGOs (for example with a social worker from "Yadid" NGO) and LAA representatives. The meetings aimed to expose the social workers to the LAA's work so they would refer women in general, and Bedouin women in particular, to the District LAA. In addition. The LAA takes part in different meetings and sessions that are conducted in cooperation with members of the Academia and women' NGOs, for example, a meeting was convened between *Itach – Maaki* (Women Lawyers for Social Justice) NGO, MOH representatives, State Attorney's Office representatives, MOE representatives and more, together with a professor from the Academia. this joint dialogue dealt mainly with two (2) topics: ways and means to eradicate physical and economic violence against Bedouin women and the exhaustion of rights. The discussion focused on the various services that may be provided to women in distress, both in domestic violence contexts (for example, obtaining a restraining order) and in the general contexts of addressing the various authorities and exhaustion of their rights.

- **Strengthening cooperation between the LAA and NGOs:** The LAA and *Itach* have agreed to cooperate, in general, and in particular with regard to cooperation in major court cases, with the understanding that joining forces can benefit all parties, in light of the unique knowledge and understanding that *Itach* has on cultural sensitivities among different populations. More collaborations were formed with *Ma'an* – The Forum for Arab Women's Organization in the Negev - NGO, as well as with *Sidreh* – an Association operating in the Bedouin locality of Lakiya. Furthermore, the Southern District initiated contact with the Authority for Development and Housing of the Bedouins in the Negev in order to create collaboration to make legal aid more accessible to the Bedouin population in general and to Bedouin women in particular.
- **Enhancing the accessibility of legal aid for women who are victims of prostitution:** a joint project of the Southern District of the LAA, with "*Bishvilech*" (For You) NGO. The LAA and the NGO has agreed to collaborate in order to outreach legal assistance to women in prostitution. According to this mutual understanding, women in prostitution who approach *Bishvilech* and are in need of legal representation will be referred to the LAA, and a member of *Bishvilech* will serve as a mediating figure and will assist the LAA attorney, so that the legal representation would be optimal. This arrangement stems from the understanding that professional guidance from lawyers is sometimes not enough and there is a need for a mediating figure to help in the process of exhaustion of rights and for a more holistic approach in order to better understand the needs and challenges regarding this population.
- **Legal Assistance to women who are victims of domestic violence:** The LAA maintains professional contact with the various shelters around the country and legal representation is provided in cooperation with the shelter's management, with emphasis on the unique needs of these women and their children. The cooperation applies also to shelters housing Arab, Bedouin and ultra-Orthodox women.
- **Legal Assistance for victims of trafficking:** The LAA has been representing victims of trafficking in persons and victims of slavery, since 2004. The legal

assistance is granted free of charge, and the victims are exempt from the economic eligibility test as set by the *Legal Aid Law* 5732–1972 (hereinafter: *Legal Aid Law*, which is usually required in order to prove one's entitlement for free legal aid services. The LAA services to the victims are provided in torts and monetary claims against the offenders and in procedures in accordance with the *Entry into Israel Law* 5712-1952 (hereinafter: *Entry into Israel Law*).

- **"Access to justice counter"**: This is an LAA counter which is located inside the courts and aimed to provide *ad hoc* legal aid (at the first stage). This counter allows accessibility to preliminary legal counsel to unrepresented people from different populations. The legal representation provided at this counter is mainly to women, often in cases incorporating legal assistance with protection orders and prevention of harassment restraining orders. Following a successful pilot of this project, the counter was approved on a permanent basis and the project was expanded to additional cities in Israel, among them, Nazareth.
- **Legal Assistance to victims of sexual offences**: Section 3 of the *Limitations on the Return of a Sex Offender to the Surroundings of the Victim of the Offence Law* 5765-2004 allows a victim to file an application to obtain a court order limiting the residence or employment of a sex offender in proximity to the place of residence or place of employment of the victim of the offense. According to a recent amendment, free legal representation would be provided by the LAA to victims of sex offenses, while the victims would be exempt from the economic eligibility test as set by the *Legal Aid Law*. The Law strives to alleviate the hardship of the victims, and prevent them from any further difficulties and psychological harm that is likely to be suffered by victims of sex offenses from frequent encounters with the perpetrators who abused them.
- **Legal Assistance to women in judicial proceedings regarding child support and custody**: The eligibility tests under the *Legal Aid Law* and Regulations distinguish between civil legal proceedings and family matters proceedings, so that in matters of personal status, the means testing depends only on the financial state of the person applying for legal aid, and not

according to the income of the family unit as a whole as in civil proceedings. As a result, many single parent women are eligible for legal assistance by the LAA in such proceedings.

- **Guidance and representation for victims of fatal offences (murder and manslaughter) –"Sana Program":** Since 2011, the LAA has been taking part in the "Sana" program – a government program to assist victims of fatal offences in cooperation with the MOLSASS. The program provides legal assistance and support to families during the legal procedure and helps them to exhaust their rights according to *Crime Victims' Rights Law* 5761-2001 (hereinafter: the "*Victims' Rights Law*"). Among these victims there are many women whose loved ones were murdered as a result of domestic violence, mothers who have lost their children as a result of being murdered by their spouse, as a result of unrelenting violence or due to other cases of violence such as robbery, neighbor disputes etc. In addition, within this program, the victims are entitled to a financial grant of up to 5,000 NIS (1,250 USD) to aid them with the initial bereavement costs, and receive individual counseling for two (2) years.

Community Courts

The premise at the basis of the Community Courts is to address the underlying factors that lead to committing the offence. The community courts model that was chosen in Israel treats various relevant problems of the defendants, while fully comprehending that the community plays a vital role in treating and rehabilitating populations at risk. The Community Courts deal solely with criminal proceedings while focused on the cooperation between courts of first instance and officials in the law enforcement authority, the welfare services, sometimes the education authorities, and the community. Its aim is to reduce the effect of repeated criminality, and the creation of solutions for problems that lead to crimes.

The deliberations in the Court include the formulation of rehabilitation plan for the defendant, tailored to her/his needs and circumstances. Generally, if the defendant completes the program that is offered to her/him, the Court might dismiss him/her from facing imprisonment, according to the Court discretion. If she/he does not

complete the program successfully, the judge will sentence her/him, similar to any defendant.

Question 7

Implementation of United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325

Government Resolution No. 2331

This Government Resolution (December 14, 2014), entitled "*Promoting gender equality and integration of gender thinking*" instructed the organizational reconstruction of the Authority for the Advancement of the Status of Women (AAW) so that it would meet its following main tasks: Policy planning - promoting gender equality and the formulation of strategic plans both for the public and private sectors, promotion of opinions regarding gender aspects of legislation, government resolutions and budget, initiating and managing inter-ministerial projects, creating a knowledge center in its field of authority, training, guidance and advocacy to implement gender thinking, including a change of mind, language and organizational culture in relation to gender equality and integration of gender mainstreaming among policymakers, both in the public and private sectors and the promotion of equal representation, prevention of discrimination and empowering women, including women of minority populations.

Implementing Gender Perspective (Gender Mainstreaming) in Government Ministries

Pursuant to the above Resolution, the AAW introduced the Gender Mainstreaming Guide, which was distributed to Government Ministries' Director Generals, and provides guidelines on how to implement policies for gender equality in various aspects in Government Ministries. The Guide includes, for example, guidelines for re-examination of plans and budget planning from a gender perspective. The Guide stipulates the recommended stages of implementation as well as examples for ways to assimilate gender mainstreaming.

Gender Mainstreaming in Local Authorities

Please see the response to Question #15.

An Inter-ministerial Team for National Action Plan

Pursuant to Section 6 of the abovementioned Government Resolution, an inter-ministerial team was established in 2014 to formulate a comprehensive action plan for the advancement of gender equality. Representatives from fifteen (15) Government Ministries and support units were appointed to the team. The team held nine (9) meetings between May and November 2015, and it was greatly assisted in its work by an action plan that was prepared by *Women Leaders for Peace and Security* NGO. Their plan, published under the title "*Comprehensive Action Plan for the Implementation of UN Security Council Resolution 1325*," was submitted to the Knesset and the Government in 2013. The NGOs that initiated the project are "Itach-Maaki -Women Lawyers for Social Justice", "Shavot"-The Center for the Advancement of Women in the Public Sphere at the Van-Leer Jerusalem Institute, and the Agenda-Hasdera-Uru social change organizations.

Zero Tolerance Policy to Sexual Exploitation by Security Officials

Prevention of Sexual Harassment in the Israel Defense Forces (IDF)

Strategic plan for eliminating sexual harassment in the IDF

Victim Support Center ("Mahut"): The Victim Support Center was established in 2012 in a centrally located army base. The Center provides assistance and counseling (including psychiatric) to applicants on the following issues: sexual violence, domestic and intimate partner violence, as well as applications regarding unplanned pregnancy. The Center also provides support and psychological treatment for applicants who have fallen victims to events which occurred in civil life, as well as previous events. Applying to the Center does not require as a pre-condition the filing of a complaint, nor does it require a referral by a doctor or a commander. The Center's applicants receive close personal support and assistance by a female officer, and information is provided to the victim with regards to options that are available for her/him (filing a complaint, receiving psychological treatment, etc.); The Center offers a 24/7 professional response. In addition, the Center provides legal aid by a reserve military advocate while guaranteeing confidentiality. Information received from the AGI shows that in 2016, there has been an increase in the number of applicants to the Center, in comparison to the previous years.

Information: awareness raising activities in the IDF, including an information leaflet distributed to every new soldier; obliging units to provide information, via their commanders, on the subject of sexual violence prevention, during basic training, command courses, and officer training; In every Senior Commander Training there is an obligation to include training on prevention of sexual violence; a mandatory biennial session class on prevention of sexual harassment headed by an officer ranking Lieutenant Colonel or higher; campaigns on the subject of treating and preventing sexual harassment; training of sexual harassment prevention supervisors in the units, in the different directorates, commands, and authorities; The Office of the Chief of Staff's Advisor of Women's Issues distributes periodic circulars on current issues regarding the prevention of sexual violence (date rape drug, violations of privacy etc.). Units must place the Victim Support Unit (Mahut) contact details sticker; develop an interactive educational software, designed for IDF soldiers and officers including an exam on this issue; awareness raising and routine update of senior commanders in all branches, commands, and directorates.

Enforcement and Monitoring: This includes updating General Staff Order 33.0145 ("*Prohibition of Sexual Violence*") periodically, as needed; gender aspects review and evaluation within the framework of the Personnel Directorate Review which is held once every two (2) years; compiling a periodic status report on sexual violence cases, and presenting it to the Chief of the General Staff and to the General Staff forum.

Command Reaction, Adjudication, and Sanction: Forwarding all information regarding complains on sexual violence (while maintaining confidentiality of the complainant's personal information, should she/he choose it) received by the Office of the Chief of Staff's Advisor of Gender Issues (AGI) to the relevant Military Advocate's office, in order to examine the circumstances and gather the legal position in the appropriate cases; providing professional assistance to the Military Prosecution in highly sensitive cases of sexual violence throughout all the case procedure including the investigations and arrest; In cases where a military police investigation is launched, the investigation materials are inspected by the District Attorney who decides whether or not to file an indictment before the Military Court or, alternatively, issue orders or recommend on initiating disciplinary procedures; managing legal procedures in Military Courts; In cases where the victim is not interested in filing a

complaint with the Military Police, there is a possibility of undertaking a "disciplinary conversation" by a senior commander, subject to approval by the AGI; Providing a designated training course for commanders in the rank of brigadier general or higher, who are Senior Judicial Officers, on adjudicating in sexual violence cases within a disciplinary procedure; consultations with respect to the possibility of bringing professional military personnel convicted in Military Court or disciplinary procedures before the Involuntary Discharge Commission.

For elaborated statistics see Table No. 1, Annex II.

Prevention of Sexual Harassment in the Police

In 2013, the unit of the Inspector General Consultant for Women Affairs (CWA) was established within the Police, headed by a senior female officer, with the rank of a Brigadier General, who is a member of the senior commanding staff forum of the Police. This unit, *inter alia*, supervise the issue of sexual harassment prevention and serve as a single police contact for all those serving in the organization, both with respect to information and prevention, and with respect to accompanying complainants from the moment of complaint until the procedure concludes. Response from the officers in the unit is given to every complainant in every hour.

The Police distributes extensive information within the organization, including during workshops that includes simulation games by professional actors, focusing on "grey areas" in sexual harassment and publishing updated regulations. An information letter about the unit was also distributed to all police personnel. Currently, the unit is developing a unique information program towards better treatment of additional aspects, beyond the judicial and legal ones, with the support of experts in the field.

In June 2015, a clear and comprehensive order was published regarding the ways to tackle sexual harassment within the organization. According to this order, the duty to report, which previously applied only to commanders and treatment professional in the organization, applies to every policeman/woman, in order to extend enforcement in this field. (Order 06.02.20 "Prohibition on sexual harassment, sexual injury and harassment in the Police, prevention and manners for treatment").

On May 2015, an apparatus of consultant for women affairs commissioners in the various units was established, in the field of sexual harassment. The apparatus includes roughly 120 commissioners from the different police units and provides available, immediate and professional response in their units. The apparatus is professionally subordinated to the CWA unit. All commissioners were trained to provide them with the tools they need to perform their role.

Data on Complaints of Sexual Harassment in the Police

Between 2014-2016, 126 policewomen complained to the CWA of sexual harassment by policemen, out of those, 65 complaints were transferred to the Department for Investigation of Police Officers (DIPO) (for information regarding handling complaint by the DIPO see Question 7 of the Report). 42 cases were closed by the DIPO, and 46 cases were transferred by DIPO to the Police Discipline Department.

In addition, between the years 2013-15, the Discipline Department in the Police took administrative means (dismissal, forced leave, suspension, warning, transfer from position and more) against police officers for sexual harassment towards police staff or civilians, as follows:

2015 - 31 cases, out of which nine (9) were dismissed.

2014 - 26 cases, out of which seven (7) were dismissed.

2013 - 18 cases, out of which six (6) were dismissed.

In addition, disciplinary means (trial in the discipline court, reprimand, training) were taken against policemen (regarding cases for disciplinary treatment which were transferred from DIPO, as follows:

2015 - 17 cases

2014 - 7 cases

2013 - 18 cases

For elaborated statistics see Table No.2, Annex II.

Question 8

The Authority for the Advancement of the Status of Women (AAW)

Since 2016, the AAW is an important unit in the Ministry of Social Equality (previously in the Prime Minister's Office) and focuses on: establishing, encouraging and promoting policies and activities to promote the status of women, gender equality, eradicating the discrimination of women, countering all forms of violence against women, supervising issues relating to gender equality in Government Ministries, raising public awareness of gender issues, submitting opinions regarding gender on bills to the Knesset, serving as a focal point for gender related data and information and promoting international relations on gender equality. In recent years, the AAW has been given a mandate to lead government activities with regard to preventing exclusion of women from the public sphere, and is charged with the national hotline on preventing exclusion of women from the public sphere, raising the number of women who are active in the municipal level, including leadership and empowerment training.

Ministerial Committee on Gender Equality – examples of recent sessions

On March 14, 2017 the committee held a meeting regarding the Council of Europe Convention on preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence. The session included representatives of all relevant Ministries and several NGOs.

On May 9, 2017 the Committee held a meeting titled "*Equal parenthood - How do we get there?*" The committee invited special guests - the Swedish ambassador to Israel, and an expert on the topic of maternity leave. During the meeting the Swedish photo exhibition "Swedish dads" was presented.

On February 28, 2017 the Committee held a meeting addressing the topic of labor laws enforcement regarding women from disadvantaged populations.

On February 21, 2017 the Committee held a session marking the LGBTQ community's rights day, and a held a follow-up discourse regarding challenges and issues in one-gendered parenthood of women.

On February 6, 2017 the Committee held a joint meeting with the Knesset Special Committee for Children's Rights, on the issue of teenage-girls and young adults at risk in the Arab society.

On January 5, 2017 the Committee members toured the "Neve Tirtza"- Israel's women prison.

Cooperation with Civil Society Organizations

Many aspects of the plan to implement the Security Council Resolution 1325 were based on the general action plan developed by the civil society, as mentioned above; In 2012, a public female leadership course was held with several NGOs; The AAW also cooperates with the annual Women Film Festival held in the city of Rehovot since 2004, in conjunction with local organizations, holding designated gender events.

Israel makes a concerted effort to involve civil society in the process of preparing its periodic reports to the UN Human Rights Committees, to every extent possible. For example, letters are sent to relevant and leading NGOs, inviting them to submit comments prior to the compilation of the reports and a general invitation to submit remarks is also posted on the Ministry of Justice web site. Civil Society contributions are given substantial consideration during the drafting of the Report.

Since 2012, the Ministries of Justice and Foreign Affairs have been participating in a joint project which aims to improve cooperation between State authorities and civil society organizations, specifically relating to the reporting process to the UN Human Rights Committees. This joint project was initiated by the Minerva Center for Human Rights at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem's Faculty of Law.

In 2017, the Ministries of Justice and Foreign Affairs, has initiated the "*Round Tables*" project. The project consists of six (6) sessions, which took place in different academic institutes around Israel – South, Center and North. The sessions are a unique platform for a discourse between NGO members, academics and representatives from the Government, on core human right issues on the following topics: LGBT Rights, Israelis of Ethiopian decent, Bedouin population, Women's rights, Rights of people with disabilities and Social and economic rights in the periphery.

Question 9

State Attorney's guideline on prosecution policy in marriage of a minors' offence

Enforcing marriage of minors' offence, is highly complex, since in many cases the marriage are held privately and the authorities are only made aware of it *ex post facto* sometimes, only after the minor has become an adult, when the marriage can be registered in a religious court. Thus, the Prosecution (in accordance with the Guideline) is taking into consideration a number of factors when deciding on whether or not to file an indictment on charges of marriage of minor due to its sensitivity and complexity. According to the Guideline, the criminal procedures will be initiated first and foremost against the person who officiated the marriage ceremony or assisted to officiate them. This also applies to the parents or guardians of the minors. In regard to the married spouses, the prosecution should distinguish between the adult partner and the minor one. Against the minor, no indictment will be filed. Against an adult, an indictment would be filed only when the age difference is at least two (2) years, and as the age difference between the adult and the minor increases, the tendency of the Prosecution to indict the adult will increase accordingly. In addition, the Prosecution would also consider the following circumstances: did the minor give her/his free consent to the marriage; the level of damage the minor had suffered from as a consequence of the marriage; whether the couple manages a standard family life; the existence of related offences; the minor's age at the time of the marriage and the age differences between the minor and the adult; whether or not the spouses' application for marriage permit was denied in accordance with the *Marital Age Law*; the period of time that elapsed since the marriage.

Attorney General Guideline - Eliminating Polygamy

The Guideline stresses that cultural customs may no longer serve as a defence for the polygamy offence. If the evidence is sufficient, an indictment will be submitted, disregarding the individual's background or the woman's consent for the marriage. In addition, according to the Guideline, the Police, PIBA etc. shall establish an effective procedure of cooperation in order to share the information with the State Attorney's Office, when a suspicion of polygamy occurs. Finally, the judicial court administrations (general, rabbinic and Sharia) have agreed to create internal

procedures to share information regarding polygamy with the State Attorney's Office, when such suspicion arises. The Guideline further includes practical instructions regarding the Prosecution, and instructs the Prosecution to ask for a custodial sanction. Aggravating circumstances of the offence include, *inter alia*, a substantive age difference between the man and the women; a coercion component; additional criminal offences that supplement to the polygamy offence, and more.

Implementation and control over means to eliminate early marriage, underage marriage, coerced marriage and polygamy by the Police

Israel Police deals with the implementation of the enforcement of the *Marital Age Law* 5710-1950 (hereinafter: the *Marital Age Law*), specifically given the rise of the marital age from 17 to 18 years, echoing the legislator's intent to treat this offence more severely.

The Police appointed contact officers for this issue in all districts, to guarantee effective work that can address all entities that notify the Police of cases of violation under this law. These officers hold periodic meetings with representatives of the Population Registry, to ensure that they receive the relevant information for enforcing the Law. Furthermore, the Police reports annually on this matter to the Knesset.

In addition, the Investigations Department holds seminars for the units of investigators from all districts in the Police which include lectures reviewing the implementation of the Law and the enforcement means of this offence.

Question 10

Raising Awareness, Education and Training

The Police

The Police fully recognize the importance of treating this complex field and provides unique and adjusted responses to domestic violence offences. First and foremost, the Police have a unique apparatus of investigators and investigating officers to handle domestic violence and sexual offences. In addition, designated training courses on domestic violence and sexual offences are regularly conducted on this issue to all investigators and patrol officers.

Domestic violence investigators who are part of the **Special Apparatus** have professional training, both with respect to conducting professional investigation to learn the truth and with respect to honoring the rights of the victim, understanding their needs and respecting their dignity and privacy. The training course includes lectures about culture-sensitive investigation which includes different features of the population, different origins and communities, tours in battered women shelters and assistance centers and a substantive course on the typology of the violent spouses and gender-based violence.

The **General investigators** who are not part of the apparatus, as well as patrol officers, undergo a course that includes guidelines for handling domestic violence offences and principles of primary treatment in case of domestic violence. In addition, police prosecutors undergo training which includes contents on domestic violence.

Investigations of sexual offences: Every police officer who is part of the investigation of sexual offences apparatus, goes through two (2) sessions of designated training courses every year at the National Police Academy. Each course lasts six (6) days, and includes a one-day tour in one of the Centers operated by the NGO Association of Rape Crisis Centers in Israel (ARCCI); lectures regarding relevant issues and sensitivities of the ultra-Orthodox population, LGBT and more. Lectures are conducted by a variety of representatives - from the MOLSASS, MOH, Israel Prison Service (IPS) and more. General Police training of new police officers also includes selected sessions on sexual offences, domestic violence and gender-based violence.

In addition, an annual one-day conference takes place for the apparatus of domestic violence investigators and sexual offence investigators in the National Police Academy, together with the AAW and ARCCI.

Awareness-Raising by the AAW

The AAW distributes, year-round informational brochure with the contact details of all the relevant hotlines and support centers in cases of domestic violence and gender-based violence, in Hebrew, Arabic, Russian, Amharic, French, English and Spanish.

The Authority focuses an annual awareness campaign near the international day on combatting violence against women, intended to raise public knowledge and awareness of this abhorrent phenomenon.

On November 24, 2016, for the first time, a state-sponsored event was held in the President's residence, honoring the battle against gender-based violence. The Minister of Social Equality presented an award to five (5) awardees who have contributed greatly to this battle: the Association of Rape Crisis Centers in Israel (ARCCI) – an NGO providing support to victims for 26 years; the NGO Women's Spirit (Ruach Nashit) – supporting the economic independence of women, especially rehabilitating battered women ; the NGO Bat Melech - Empowering religious and ultra-Orthodox women to break the cycle of violence; Mrs. Hadeel Abu Habla - the director of the shelter for battered Arab women; The NGO Tmura Center – the Israeli Anti-Discrimination Center, judicially handling cases of battered women.

In the years 2012-2014, the AAW led a campaign titled "Ending Violence", reaching out to men to approach helplines and receive professional help to change their patterns of behavior and reduce the level of violence against women. The campaign upturned the number of calls to help lines by 15 times. The campaign was also available in Arabic on several popular websites.

Countering Sexual Harassment at work place - the AAW

The AAWS works to eradicate the phenomenon of sexual harassments as mandated by the *Authority for the Advancement of the Status of Women Law*, below are several examples:

- Notices concerning the Prevention of *Sexual Harassment Law* have been sent to thousands of employers in the private sector.
- Monitoring is carried out to check the appointment of an officer for the handling of sexual harassment complaints, in workplaces in the public and private sectors, as well as in educational institutions. In accordance with the abovementioned provisions, since 2015 the AAWS has been collecting annual reports from academic institutions, on the implementation of the *Regulations for the Prevention of Sexual Harassment*.
- The AAWS maintains a central database on sexual harassment prevention officers consisting of over 3,000 names as of the end of 2016.

- A central database regarding professional bodies for the training of sexual harassment prevention officers is maintained, pursuant to the Law. The database has been published on the AAWS website with the aim of facilitating for the employers direct contact with these bodies,
- The AAWS has issued a Code of Conduct for the Prevention of Sexual Harassment in five languages, and these are sent out to all workplaces on a regular basis. This code of conduct is available in public notice format that can be hanged on the wall and also in an individual booklet format (for distribution). The Code of Conduct contains the main points of the provisions of the *Prevention of Sexual Harassment Law*, and the employers are required to post it in a prominent, conspicuous place.
- The AAWS has issued an explanatory kit on the prevention of sexual harassment - this is professional and effective instruction tool, accessible to every employer. The kit includes short films and explanations presenting sexual harassment situations taken from the workplace and educational institutions, for the use during explanatory activities held at the workplaces.
- The AAWS holds regular national conferences and seminars on the subject of sexual harassment and ways of eradicating this phenomenon. Likewise, the AAWS's employees deliver lectures on the subject at workplaces.
- In conjunction with the Civil Service Commission, a circular on the prevention of sexual harassment is distributed annually to all civil servants along with their salary slips.
- In two (2) focused campaigns conducted in 2007 and 2011, respectively, female employees of the AAWS joined supervisors from the Ministry of Economy and Industry in a drive for enforcement and the dissemination of information in both the public and private sectors, in collaboration with the Enforcement Division in the Ministry of Economy and Industry, aimed at boosting awareness and collecting up-to-date data regarding the implementation of the Law's provisions. In the lead-up to and during the campaigns, an information drive was conducted over the radio, a communiqué was issued to the employers, visits were made to workplaces, and Codes of Conduct, explanatory kits and information booklets were distributed.

- Courses for professional training of sexual harassment prevention officers are held throughout the country in collaboration with the Local Government Center, MASLAN (Support Center for Battered and Sexually Abused Women, Negev), and others.
- In 2016 the AAW completed the formulation of the "Voluntary Code of Conduct for the Prevention of Sexual Harassment at the Workplace," led by the "Support Centers Union for Victims of Sexual Assault in Israel," in collaboration with the Israel Standards Institute, and the Ministry of Economy and Industry. The Code is an innovative initiative relating extensively to topics not discussed in the Law, its aim is to change the organizational culture in Israel to a safer and more respectful workspace - a space that will promote equality between men and women employees, strengthen the female employees' sense of security, and allow for better integration of women into the labor market.

State Attorney's Office and Legal Aid Administration Lawyers

The State Attorney's Office lawyers also undergo professional training to deal with offences of domestic violence and sexual offences within the family and against women in general. Some seminars are conducted by the Institute of Legal Training for Attorneys and Legal Advisers in the Ministry of Justice (the "Institute") and quite a few are designated to address issues of sex offences and violence against women, both on a national and on a district level. Others are held by the Haruv Institute (founded by Schusterman Foundation Israel (SFI). Additionally, seminars conducted in the prosecution units and guest lectures are routinely dedicated to this topic.

Moreover, the Jerusalem District Legal Aid Administration works in close cooperation with the Center for Treatment and Prevention of Domestic Violence in Jerusalem. This includes conducting think-tanks headed by judges who run joint seminars for lawyers and social workers from the two (2) organizations and cooperation on specific cases which require both therapeutic and legal attention.

Protection and Assistance for victims of domestic violence

A place in a battered women's shelter will be provided to woman who is a victim of domestic violence, in need of a shelter and is willing to enter the shelter. A policeman will accompany the woman to a shelter if necessary. In addition, police procedures,

inter alia, include an instruction according to which in high-risk cases, the police officer must update the police officer in charge of the circumstances of the case before the victim who filed a complaint leaves the station.

The MOLSASS Emergency Hotline ("118")

The hotline which was established in 2004, continues to operate 24/7 in four (4) different languages. The emergency hotline has extensive staff and also three (3) social workers who are in charge in cases of domestic violence.

For statistics regarding applications for the hotline, see Table No.13, Annex II.

The MOLSASS Centers for prevention and assistance in domestic violence

The centers operate within the community in various cities and provide assistance in different aspects - protection, constructing intervention programs, rehabilitation and more. The assistance is provided to men, women and children and can be provided in an individual session or group session. According to current data, there are 100 centers today in Israel, four (4) of them are designated for the ultra-Orthodox society and 24 are designated centers for Arab communities. In 2017, centers operated in nine (9) Bedouin localities in the Negev.

In 2015, 14,136 applications were submitted to the Centers. 9,230 families were treated, 65% of the applicants (6,921) were women, 26% (2,778) were men, and 9% (987) were children and teenagers – a total of 10,686 people treated by the centers. Most of the treatments provided by the Centers were in an individual treatment setting (62%) and the rest were group therapy or combined treatment. Most referrals came from the Police (42%), while others were referred by the welfare departments in the municipalities or other channels.

There are 24 designated Centers and units for the Arab community, including the designated centers for the Bedouin community in the Negev. In addition there are eight (8) centers who work in cities with mixed populations. In 2015, 1,207 Arab families were treated in the Centers.

Shelters for victims of domestic violence

Israel has fourteen (14) shelters for women who are victims of violence, all of them are accommodated for children. Two (2) of the shelters are designated for Arab women, two (2) other shelters have mixed populations and have Arabic-speaking staff, two (2) shelters are intended for ultra-Orthodox Jewish women and two (2) others accommodate women with special needs and women with disabilities in association with the MOH. Women typically reside in the shelters for a period of 3-6 months.

According to recent statistics from 2015, 738 women and 989 children resided in the shelters; 600 of them were new referrals and the rest have continued their stay from 2014. 44% of them are Jewish, 6% are without religion, 33% Muslims and 8% Christian. An increase was indicated in the number of Druze and Muslim women in the shelters.

Note that the shelters also accommodate foreign residents. Roughly 10% of the women who resided in the shelters in 2015 were non-residents; 18 women were residents of the Palestinian Authority and 24 had no legal status in Israel.

According to information from the MOLSASS, which regards to 576 women, the majority of women were referred to a shelter due to an abusive spouse (including husbands) while others were abused by other family members: extended family- 5%, nuclear family- 9%, father - 3%, brother: 4%, divorcee: 5%.

41% of the women in the shelters were Arab, which indicates on a 2% growth from 2014.

For disaggregated information – See Diagrams No.1-3, Annex II.

Transitional Apartments for victims of Domestic violence

The purpose of transitional apartments is to meet the need of a continued treatment framework, upon leaving the shelter and before adjusting to independent life.

The treatment's goals include providing a rehabilitation framework, helping the women and their children managing an independent lifestyle, and acquiring a variety of skills including vocational training and education, social skills and assistance in

judicial proceedings. The target population are women who need a long healing and rehabilitation period and that finished their stay at a shelter and are not in danger. The women and children stay at the transitional housing between six (6) months to a year. The shelters are operated by NGOs who won a governmental tender. Most women living in transitional housing are at the ages of 18-25. 19% of the women are Arab, 23% are secular or traditional Jews, 13% are ultra-Orthodox Jews, 16% are new immigrants (olim) from the former Soviet Union and 29% are new immigrants from Ethiopia. (*in total there are 18 apartments, however this data regards 12 apartments that are supported by the MOLSASS). In 2015 there were 18 transitional apartments across Israel (including a house in an Arab village), occupied by 45 women and 97 children.

"Shlav" - Rehabilitation Apartments for men who received restraining order

The "Shlav" apartments are aimed to rehabilitate and assist men who are barred from entering their home according to court order due to the risk they present to their family members.

These apartments are part of a treatment program for abusive men who received a restraining order following an ongoing civil or criminal procedure. The apartments are for men from all over the country. The goals of the houses are reducing the men's danger level, helping during crisis time, integrating in meaningful treatment regarding domestic abuse and a controlled return to the community. The apartments are designated for men who present motivation to change, and are not drug or alcohol users, nor do they present general criminal behavior patterns. The men are referred to these houses by different treatments frameworks, Family Matters Courts and through self-referral.

In 2015, 54 men were referred to the Shlav apartments.

Assistance in Housing

The Ministry of Construction and Housing (MOCAH) maintains a special procedure concerning women who are victims of domestic violence and provides them with assistance they require in accordance to a 2002 special procedure. The procedure determines eligibility for assistance in rental fees to women who meet one of the

relevant criteria. Eligible women receive assistance for three (3) consecutive years, without being required to file a new request each year. Living in a shelter is not a necessary requirement. During 2016, 1,051 women received this type of assistance.

In addition, Section 3B of the *Public Housing Tenants' Rights Law* 5758 – 1998, sets a special arrangement for women who reside in shelters for victims of domestic violence, according to which, their eligibility to reside in a state-funded public apartment will not be harmed as a result of leaving the apartment and staying at a shelter for battered women.

Question 12

Identifying Victims of trafficking – special procedures

The 2012 Israel Prisons Service (IPS) Referral Procedure

In 2012 a procedure for identifying trafficking victims was established in the IPS, charged with operating the detention facilities, where people who entered illegally from the Egyptian border are held for a limited time, with the help of social workers working in prisons, enabling timely referral of victims to the LAA towards their transfer to the shelters as well as conducting criminal investigations by the Police. According to this procedure, every IPS staff who serves in a detention facility, and suspects that she/he have encountered a victim of trafficking, is obligated to report this to the social worker, who is obliged to deliver the information to the LAA. If this is found to be the case, the victim is referred to a shelter. All Prisons Service staff in Giv'on and Saharonim are familiar with this procedure and operate accordingly.

The Detention Review Tribunal Referral Procedure

The Detention Review Tribunal (hereinafter: the "Tribunal"), which is under the auspices of the MOJ and is designated as a sub-division of the Attorney General's Office, is charged with performing legal scrutiny of the detention orders that are issued by the Supervisor of the Border Control Administration. The tribunals are not authorized to dismiss deportation orders. The *Entry to Israel Law* is the sole authority

of the tribunals and the tribunals are only authorized to affirm, amend or cancel a detention order.

The *Entry to Israel Law* lists the reasons for the release from custody of a detainee. In accordance with this law, every foreign resident in custody is brought before the Tribunal no more than **four (4) days** from the beginning of her/his detention. The Tribunal notifies the Police Trafficking Coordinator (PTC) of cases they suspect are trafficking related, and to the LAA. The LAA provides the alleged victim of trafficking with a lawyer and the PTC, according to certain criterions, decides whether to recognize the detainee as a victim of trafficking. Relevant information to the identification process can come from different sources, for example: The Hot Line for Refugees and Migrants NGO, UNHCR, the PIBA etc.

Once a detainee is identified as a victim of trafficking, she/he would be released from detention and, after obtaining their consent, transferred to the shelters for victims of trafficking.

Note that a translator is present in all hearings in the Tribunal, and if there is no translator available - the court session would be postponed. That is unless the detainee speaks the same language as the judge (some of the judges speak Arabic as mother tongue), or in case that the detainee speaks English. The Tribunal and its personnel see the translator as a fundamental component of the process, since it allows for a better, more effective identification of the victim of trafficking.

Like all administrative acts in Israel, the Tribunal's decision is subject to judicial review. An appeal regarding the Tribunal's decisions may be filed as an administrative appeal to the Administrative Courts.

The Police

According to Government Resolution No. 2806 (1.12.02) as well as Government Resolution No. 2607 (2.12.07), in any case which raises the suspicion that a person is a victim of trafficking, for prostitution or slavery, the matter is brought before the Police Trafficking Coordinator (PTC). The PTC establishes whether there is any initial evidence (*prima facie* evidence) indicating that the person is such a victim. In

the event that the PTC determines that such an evidentiary threshold has been met, the victim is referred to a shelter.

It is irrelevant in this respect, whether the victim is a witness in a criminal investigation, or cooperating with the Police, as such persons are referred to shelters upon their recognition, unconditionally, regardless of this issue.

The criteria being used is primarily based on the information relayed to the Police concerning victims of trafficking and may originate from several sources: the Detention Review Tribunal, the HRM, the UNHCR, the MOI, the LAA, Police intelligence, NGOs, a complaint by the victim her/himself or any other source.

The shelters for victims of trafficking

The GOI treatment program for victims of trafficking includes varied frameworks that are not all identical in their nature, but rather constitute a diverse set of solutions, intended for victims of different needs and in different rehabilitative stages. It includes the following:

1. *Ma'agan* - a shelter for women victims (thirty-five (35) places)
2. *Atlas* - a center for men victims (thirty-five (35) places)
3. A transitional apartment complex for women victims (eighteen (18) places)
4. A transitional apartment for men victims (six (6) places)
5. The Day Center

The Shelters provide full medical care to the victims, education, empowerment and leisure programs, as well as psycho-social services.

For example, in Ma'gan shelter, the following enrichment and social activities were provided in 2016:

- **English lessons** – in 2016 at the request of the residents, English classes were held at the shelter. They were held twice a week during the first three (3) months of the professional training project on behalf of the Center for International Migration and Integration (CIMI) organization, and then

continued as enrichment activities funded by the Keshet NGO. **Eleven** (11) women attended the classes regularly in mixed groups: Amharic-speaking women shared classes Russian-speaking women which also contributed to the social bonding at the shelter. The emphasis in these classes was on fostering spoken language skills, specifically in everyday life.

- A weekly sports club at a nearby community center, for the women who do not work for various reasons.
- Once every few months a lecture or fun activity was held at “Ma’agan”: among others, the residents took a trip to Haifa for International Women's day in March, went bowling in June, and went out for a day of fun at a five (5) star hotel at the Dead Sea in September.
- Once every four (4) months a “Garden Day” takes place at the shelter when the shelter staff worked with the women in planting flowers and vegetables in the garden at the shelter courtyard.
- During the summer months the women enjoyed a subscription to the community pool.

Protection on Women with Disabilities

Persons with disabilities (PWD) are protected by the *Penal Law* from abuse, violence and exploitation as any other persons, without any discrimination. In some violence and sex offences, there are aggravating circumstances if the victim is a "helpless person". Measures for protection of PWD are defined in Section 368A of the *Penal Law*. This Section defines "helpless person" as "a person who because of her/his age, illness or physical or mental infirmity, mental impairment, or any other cause, cannot provide for the needs of her/his livelihood, health or welfare". The Law defines a duty to report certain violence and sex offenses against those who are included in this definition. The duty to report is imposed according to Section 368D on any person who has reasonable grounds to believe that such a crime was committed recently by a person in charge of a minor or a "helpless person". A professional (physician, nurse, educator, social worker, social welfare employee, policeman, psychologist,

criminologist, paramedic, director or staff member of a residential facility or institution in which minors or persons under care live) has a duty to report if in the course of her/his professional activity or responsibility she/he has reasonable grounds to believe that such a crime was committed. The person who is in charge of the "helpless person" also has a duty to report in these circumstances. Violation of this duty constitutes an offence punishable by three (3) months imprisonment or six (6) months if the offender is a professional or has responsibility for the helpless person.

The *Investigation and Testimony Procedures (Adjustments for Persons with Mental or Intellectual Disability) Law 5766-2005*, is an innovative Law, enacted in December 2005, that requires specific procedural adjustments in severe criminal cases, as stipulated in its Addendum. The Law applies to police investigations and court testimonies involving persons with autism, mental or intellectual disability, if they are suspected of committing a severe crime, witness a severe crime, or are victims of one.

Different adjustments are granted to persons with different disabilities according to the Law. At the investigative stage, persons with intellectual disabilities and autistic persons are entitled to be investigated by a specially trained social worker, outside of Police premises, and not by police personnel. Persons with mental disabilities are investigated by the Police, but they are entitled to have another person present, who may assist the investigator to avoid disability-related misunderstandings. As a rule, investigations of persons with these disabilities must be videotaped. Only in exceptional cases may they be audio-recorded or documented in writing instead. A special kit for augmentative and alternative communication methods which would be admissible in court has been developed. The special investigators have been trained to use such a kit, and they operate it in collaboration with specialized speech therapists. In courts, many different adjustments are available, including augmentative and alternative communication methods, a friendlier environment in the courtroom, an exemption from confronting the accused, questions framed in a way that assists recollection, and an expert testimony that explains the meaning of the witness's words and conduct to the judge. The Law has been in force since December 2006, and is implemented in practice by specially trained social workers at the MOLSASS when intellectually disabled and autistic persons are involved in investigations or court testimonies. Such investigations are also conducted in Arabic, by specially trained

social workers, and in other languages when needed, with the assistance of interpreters.

In addition, the Police have a designated branch for victim of offences rights, and the branch's representative are in regular contact with welfare offices and relevant NGOs in cases involving persons with disabilities, to ensure the safeguarding of their rights throughout the process.

Question 13

Efforts to eliminate trafficking in persons

The following are a number of examples of the many measures employed to combat all forms of trafficking in persons.

Training: the NATU and others conduct regular training sessions for government officials who might come in contact with victims of trafficking. A particular effort has been made in 2016 to hold training sessions for a wide-range of officials who have not yet received training. For example, border control officers on Israel's southern entry points (Eilat), due to the unique challenges that characterize this multinational junction.

Cooperation with NGOs: Israel continues to encourage fruitful cooperation between NGOs and enforcement authorities. For example, a joint work protocol is being formulated with the aim of tackling the prostitution of minors. An additional cooperation led to the formulation of an information leaflet "Take note" on identifying victims of trafficking.

International Co-operation: Israel continues to take an active part in global efforts to combat trafficking. For example, in 2016, NATU hosted two (2) study visits – one (1) of a delegation from Albania (concerning Israel's mechanisms for victim compensation) and another of a delegation from Moldova (on Israel's efforts in combatting trafficking in organs). A representative from The State Attorney's Office participated in international conferences on organ trafficking and the National Coordinator participated in the OSCE Conference on Combating Trafficking in

Human Beings for the Purpose of Forced Criminality, amongst other international collaborations.

Data -Identification of victims

In 2016, 24 women were recognized as victims of trafficking or slavery. In addition, 26 men were recognized as victims of trafficking or slavery during 2016.

Data - Investigations, prosecutions and convictions

Investigations into offences committed against foreign workers:

In 2016, the Police initiated 31 new investigations into trafficking-related offenses against foreign workers.

Investigations into offences of trafficking for the purpose of prostitution and related offences

In 2016, the Police initiated 279 new investigations regarding trafficking for the purpose of prostitution and related offenses, as follows:

Nature of Offense	Number of New Investigation Cases Initiated in 2016	Number of Suspects
Pandering for the purpose of prostitution	48	122
Trafficking in persons for the purpose of prostitution	1	2
Inducement to engage in prostitution	13	51
Managing or renting a property for the purpose of engaging in prostitution	166	356
Advertisement of prostitution services	46	97
Causing a person to leave her/his country for purpose of prostitution	5	17

Source: Israel Police 2016

An overview into the investigations into offences of trafficking for the purpose of prostitution and related offences from 2002-2016

Year/ Offense	Penal Law Section	02	03	04	05	06	07	08	09	10	11	12	13	14	15	16
Trafficking in persons for the purpose of engaging them in prostitution	377A	67	53	50	19	34	21	10	6	4	6	13	2	0	2	1
Holding a person under conditions of slavery for purpose of sexual services	375A	No data available									1	2	2	4	3	-
Abduction of a person for the Purpose of Trafficking	374A	No data available									7	3	2	5	0	-
Causing a Person to leave her/his country for purposes of prostitution	376B	No data available									4	10	1	7	4	5
Pandering for the purpose of prostitution	199	28	38	74	63	36	84	56	85	75	54	41	40	42	44	48
Inducement to engage in prostitution	201+ 202	27	9	22	5	7	12	7	10	7	8	15	13	17	15	13
Managing a property for the purpose of engaging in prostitution	204	215	338	445	223	196	185	219	260	456	293	186	202	101	102	166
Abduction for causing bodily harm or sexual offense	374	14	22	11	13	24	17	15	20	22	16	10	12	9	0	-
Advertisement of prostitution services	205(A -C)		No data available						18	27	8	68	65	54	47	46
Total		351	460	602	323	297	319	307	399	591	397	348	339	239	241	279

Source: Israel Police, 2016

The decline in the volume of cases of trafficking in persons for the purpose of prostitution reflects the success of the combined efforts of all parties in previous years.

Prosecutions and Convictions in 2016

	Trafficking in Persons for the Purpose of Prostitution and/or Related Offenses	Trafficking in Persons for the Purpose of Slavery and Forced Labor and/or Related Offenses	Trafficking in Organs and Related Offenses
Indictments	6 cases (11 defendants): • Trafficking and related offenses: 1 case (2 defendants) • Related offenses only: 5 cases (9 defendants)		Trafficking in Organs: • Trafficking and related offenses: 2 cases (7 defendants)
Convictions (including cases from previous years)	21 cases (43 defendants): • Trafficking and related offenses: 4 cases (6 defendants) • Original indictments for Trafficking and related offenses resulting in convictions in related offenses only: 2 cases (2 defendants) • Related offenses only: 15 cases (35 defendants)	2 cases (5 defendants): • Original indictments for Trafficking and related offenses resulting in convictions in related offenses only: none • Related offenses only: 2 cases (5 defendants)	2 cases: • Trafficking and related offenses: : 2 cases (7 defendants) <u>Note:</u> the indictment is under the <i>Organ Transplant Law</i> 5768-2008

Amongst the judicial decisions rendered this year, the Supreme Court gave a precedential decision in which it ruled that the offence of holding a person under conditions amounting to slavery can be committed even when no violence or physical barriers have been placed on the person's freedom (*Ibrahim and Basma Julani v. The State of Israel* (Cr. A. 6237/13)).

Assistance and Protection to Victims

Israel provides services to assist victims of trafficking, none of which are contingent upon cooperation with law enforcement, as follows.

Medical services: Victims of trafficking who reside in a shelter receive complete medical care free of charge. Since 2016, psychiatric care also began to be provided regularly, in the shelters, by a psychiatrist. Victims who do not reside in a shelter are

entitled to free emergency medical treatment, even if they do not hold medical insurance.

Legal Aid: Legal aid is granted free of charge to victims of trafficking in persons and slavery. They are exempt from the economic eligibility test usually required in order to prove one's entitlement for free legal aid. Legal aid is provided in civil proceedings such as tort and monetary claims against offenders and in procedures related to legal status in accordance with the *Entry into Israel Law* 5712-1952.

Shelters: See Question 12 above.

Work permits: Victims residing in the trafficking victims shelters receive special work visas allowing them to work during their stay in the shelter. All victims are entitled to a year of rehabilitation with a general work visa, and victims who choose to testify in criminal proceedings are entitled to this visa throughout the proceedings. Following the finalization of the procedures, they are entitled to a year of rehabilitation with the same visa. The shelters assist with placing the victims in suitable and safe places of employment.

Forfeiture fund: In 2016 the forfeiture fund for trafficking and slavery began its operations. The fund has allocated budgets to victims for purposes of rehabilitation and protection, and to bodies and NGOs providing victim aid and combatting trafficking.

Prominent Case Law

***The State of Israel v. Alyssa Zamlan and Boris Raden* (S.Cr.C. 40993-07-16 Haifa District Court)**

In July 2016 an indictment was filed against two (2) Defendants, attributing to them six (6) counts of offenses, including causing a person to leave her/his country to engage in prostitution; trafficking in persons for the purpose of prostitution and attempted trafficking; holding a place for prostitution; pandering; threats; and money laundering offenses.

The Defendants used the Internet to recruit women from former Soviet Union countries to come to Israel and engage in prostitution. Furthermore, Defendant 1

approached a Ukrainian citizen to recruit women for prostitution, in return for monetary compensation for each woman recruited. Defendant 1 held thirteen (13) apartments in which the services were provided, and arranged for prostitution services to be provided in hotels in Jerusalem; and caused 15 victims to leave their country and come to Israel where they were exploited for sexual services. Defendant 2 assisted Defendant 1, mostly as a security guard at the apartments.

As many of the women have left the country, much of the authorities' knowledge on the facts of the case was due to Defendant 1's correspondence with the victims that was found on her phone.

In November 2016, Defendant 1 was sentenced to 20 months imprisonment; suspended sentence; fine and cash forfeiture. Defendant 2 was sentenced to six (6) months imprisonment to be served in community service; suspended sentence and a fine.

The State of Israel v. Leonid Shtrimer and Assaf Ben-Ari (S.Cr.C. 24041-12-15, Tel Aviv District Court)

In another case, an indictment was filed against two (2) defendants for trafficking in women. Defendant 1 contacted women from Russia and the Ukraine online, and motivated them to arrive to Israel in order to provide commercial sexual services, promising them high earnings as masseurs and to reside at luxury apartments, while Defendant 2 kept and managed the apartments and was the one to inform the women of the terms of employment, which included a "fine" if they are late to arrive at the flat. For some of the women, the said offer included the Defendants' "examining" them and requiring them to perform sexual acts on them. On September 7th, 2016, as part of a plea bargain the defendants were sentenced. Their punishment included four (4) years imprisonment, a fine of 5,000 NIS (1,330 USD), and compensation to the complainants: Defendant 1 is to pay 29,000 NIS (7,730 USD) to the complainants, each according to her share; Defendant 2 is to pay 40,000 NIS (10,670 USD) to the complainants, each according to her share. Both defendants appealed the verdict before the Supreme Court (Cr.A. 8057/16), and their hearing is scheduled for July 20th, 2017.

Question 14

Concrete steps taken following the report of the inter-ministerial team for prevention of exclusion of women from the public sphere

As an initial step, a designated email box was opened (Hadarat-nashim@justice.gov.il) to which governmental agencies and other public entities could approach and submit a complain about incidents of exclusion of women.

Segregation in cementers: On March 5, 2013 the Ministry of Religious Services amended the terms to the burial company licenses; an additional section was added to the license terms providing that the company must comply with the instructions of the Ministry of Religious Services, which prohibits the manifestations of separation between man and woman. On February 27, 2013 the Ministry of Religious Services issued Director General's Circular setting sanctions against anyone acting contrary to those provisions, including taking action against the burial company. Moreover, the MOJ and Ministry of Religious Services began working together with the purpose of eradicating the phenomenon of gender separation at cemeteries, including by surprise visits and joint handling of public complaints received on the matter.

Within the framework of a civil claim which was conducted against the cemeteries in Rehovot and Jerusalem with respect to the mounting of gender separation signs (C.C. 38824-07-14 *The Reform Center for Religion et. al. v. Chevra Kadisha Gahsha Kehilat Yerushalayim*) the Attorney General asked to express his position whereby such signs constitute a direct violation of the provisions of the Director General's Circular binding the burial society, and also a breach of the *Prohibition on Discrimination Law* 5761-2000 and the Attorney General's above-mentioned inter-ministerial concluding report. During the hearing, the parties accepted the settlement outline proposed to them, regarding the removal of the existing signs and mounting electronic screens in their place, which would generally be unlit, save for the request of a family interested in doing so. Furthermore, in the funeral order form, it will be explained to the grieving family that separation will only be carried out according to their wish (and effectively the default is no separation). This outline obtained the support of the Attorney General in his position paper submitted to the Supreme Court.

Exclusion in health clinics: the MOH issued a guideline for the HMOs which prohibits exclusion of women and gender separation at HMO branches. The MOH demanded that the HMOs provide for its review a report on incidents of gender separation: separate clinics, separate entrances and separate waiting areas for women and men. Moreover, the guideline prohibits the existence of modesty signs (any sign calling, instructing or demanding modest dressing) and demanded that they be removed. A similar guideline was issued to hospitals on July 2, 2014. This process was completed by the review and handling of specific public complaints in cooperation with the MOH.

"Mehadrin bus lines": in 1999 public transportation lines named "Mehadrin bus lines" operated in Israel for the use of ultra-Orthodox communities which included separate seating arrangements for men and women so that women would sit in the rear of the buses and men would sit in the front. In H.C.J. 746/07 *Naomi Ragen v. Ministry of Transportation*, the High Court of Justice ordered the establishment of a forum to examine the scope of the phenomenon of segregated bus lines. In 2011 the judgment in the High Court Case of *Ragen* was rendered and adopted the recommendations of the Committee that **an arrangement consisting of coercive components is illegal since it is discriminatory and humiliating to women. Following this decision, the Ministry of Transportation conducted 1,369 reviews in buses lines during 2011-2012 to monitor this issue.**

Conferences and events: The Attorney General approached several municipalities and asked that they cancel or change the frame of public events where there was gender segregation or women's singing was prohibited.

On March 30, 2014, the Government adopted Resolution No. 1526 on the issue of "preventing the exclusion of women in the public sphere", reaffirming the State's obligation to gender equality and the advancement of the status of women in Israel from all strata of society and in as many areas as is possible. The Resolution recognizes the fact that exclusion of women in the public sphere is a grave practice characterized by discrimination against women, which requires active governmental action for its eradication. Such practice is inconsistent with the principle of equality, one of the founding principles of the State of Israel, and also Israel's international obligations to act by various means to prevent gender discrimination. The AAW

circulated the Resolution to all mayors and heads of local authorities, demanding that they ensure that exclusion of women does not occur in ceremonies, public events, funerals, public transportation, or any other places in the public sphere.

On November 29, 2015 Attorney General's Guideline 1.1700 was updated and stated that wherever possible, a civil servant must ensure that in an event or activity, consideration was given for the purpose of ensuring a diverse and balanced presentation of views, different interests and relevant sectors. As part of this, providing sponsorship for an event comprised of likely discriminatory measures, raises difficulty.

In May 2015 the Attorney General's Guideline no. 1.1502 was updated on the "appointment and composition of public consultative committees and their methods of action"¹ as well as Attorney General's Guideline 1.1503 on "due representation for specific sectors"². Both Guidelines deal with expanding due representation for women, with reference to section 6C1(b) of the *Women's Equal Rights Law* 5711-1951.

Question 17

Gender Education

Follows are several examples of gender programs:

- "Equal talk" program is intended for male and female pupils in the curriculum for 5th-6th grades and 8th-9th grades about gender and sexual equality.
- "Chain" program - the program is mentorship activity by the high school girls to the younger junior high girls. The girls are given "their own space", a room enabling discourse between girls and creating a support network between the girls. In this program, high school girls are being trained to serve as guides and mentors of junior high girls. The older girls receive tools for working with other girls, and learn to identify signs of stress, distress and unique social dilemmas for girls. Activity in the feminine space is supported by a designated schoolteacher. In addition, the group of girls' deals with unique tasks related to sexual equality:

¹ <http://www.justice.gov.il/Units/YoezMespai/HanchayotNew/Seven/1.1502.pdf>

² <http://www.justice.gov.il/Units/YoezMespai/HanchayotNew/Seven/1.1503.pdf>

celebrating the Women's Day, teaching lessons in the school and increasing awareness. The program's essence is to create a unique space for each girl, that will constitute "an address" for girls in the school space. This feminine space is based on the sisterhood model, and "a room of one's own" perception; it is meant to provide unique solution, lacking in the general framework, to girls who are not always noted or receive the proper attention. The program is supported by a national advanced course of 30 yearly hours, in which teachers from the school are trained to coordinate the unique program. The program has been operating for seven (7) years; in 2015-2016, about 350 pupils participated in the program, in thirty (30) different schools.

- "Light from the east" program - the program deals with pioneering women from Sephardi and Middle Eastern Jewries leaders, having social influence and leaders in their fields. It includes Twenty eight (28) women that are a model of cultural leadership. The programs raises gender issues for discussion and sheds light on gender and sectorial stereotypes. At the same time, it refrains from construing traditional gender identities fixing inequality in education and society. This process is complex and sensitive, and therefore the program is founded on feminist pedagogy - dialogue and cooperation that rely on the knowledge basis the participants bring, to create innovative knowledge.
- "Aliyah, identity and gender" program - this curriculum joins together female artist coming from different countries. In their art they deal with identities unique to them or different identities in Israeli society. These identities are sometimes excluded from the cultural and social center, and they express the challenges of immigration artist women face when immigrating to Israel (making "Aliyah").

Math and Science education for girls

Encouraging girls in schools in the mathematics field

The Department for Gender Equality works in cooperation with the Science, Technology and Mathematics Supervisor in the MOE towards training teachers (1,300 until 2016) to gender-sensitive teaching. In the 2016-2017 school-year, a lecture titled: "teachers - agents of change for promoting gender equality in mathematics" was given to 120 secondary school teachers and about 35 secondary school district instructors, 30 elementary school district instructors and 20 teachers in training. Also,

about 60 secondary school teachers participated in seminars about gender and science and learned of overt and covert techniques for promoting pupils of both genders. In addition, there are different programs to encourage girls in school for non-traditional fields of education, for example “*give me five*” - the goal is to double the number of pupils studying mathematics in highest level - five (5) units in general, specifically, increase the number of female pupils. Further examples are detailed below.

Within minorities population

The MOE invests extensive efforts in the Arab education system, in order to assist the pupils in assimilating into the labor market. Alongside the theoretical studies, with emphasis on scientific-technological subjects, the Unit for Gender Equality conducts branched value-based activity directed to boys and girls from Druze and Arab populations. The programs, aimed for pupils from 6-12 grade, challenge cultural perceptions and social constructs with respect to gender roles, to remove cultural and social barriers and enable self and professional fulfillment for all. It is operated in the Druze, Arab and Bedouin Community.

Matriculation exams data for 2014 demonstrate that among the Arab school system, higher percentages of girls study all the scientific-technological subjects in the advanced level (5 units). Moreover, the percentage of excellent female pupils out of all pupils is higher than the percentage of excellent male pupils out of all pupils, in most of these subjects. This trend is opposite of the existing trend among the Jewish population, and the national level in general.

Pupils who took the five (5) units matriculation test in scientific-technological subjects - by gender (Arabic speakers) (2014) – See Annex II

Encouraging Science and Technology Education

The MOE and MOSTAS are dedicated to encourage studying in the technology and science field. In addition, the MOE offers annual scholarships for students studying for second and third degrees in a number of fields, in order to promote the Ministries objectives and allow young people to be positively exposed to these fields. In 2015, the MOE provided about 150 scholarships, of which more than 33% were awarded to women. Further examples of designated programs for encouraging girls in science:

- ***“Girls pioneer in science and technology”*** - The program is intended to intermediate school female pupils, teaching science and technology in the 8th and 9th grades.
- ***“Cracking the glass ceiling”*** - joint venture of the MOE, the Alliance Israelite Universelle organization and local municipalities. The program is focused on girls in disadvantaged cities - strengthening their self-efficacy, have them meet successful women who can serve as role models for them, and direct them to choose scientific subjects as a preparation to their academic studies and future careers.
- ***“Future female scientists”*** - together with the MOSTAS, this program is aimed at encouraging girls in disadvantaged cities to choose exact science subjects.
- ***Programs for promoting equal opportunities to both genders in science, together with local authorities*** (Modi'in, Netanya, Haifa, Ra'anana, Be'er-Sheva) jointly with the supervision of the teaching of science and technology. Programs targeting an increase in the number of female pupils in the scientific technological leadership program when moving from elementary school to junior high and from there to high school.
- ***“Future female scientists”*** - together with the Ministry of Science, Technology and Space, aimed at encouraging girls in disadvantaged cities to choose exact science subjects.
- ***Collaboration with the Center of Education Technology in the “mindset” initiative, to promote girls in physics***, in the framework of PHYSIXX enterprise.
- ***“Paths to university”*** - together with the supervision over science and technology and the Tel Aviv University. An experimental program to make the Academia more accessible to female students and encourage them to study science and technology.
- ***Distributing the female scientist posters*** - as model for inspiration and identification for girls to a future career.
- ***Using activities*** developed in the Unit – it encourages the female students to choose a future career in these areas. This, while providing critical view of the customary perceptions in society with respect to these areas, and increasing the girls' self-efficacy.

Programs for Teachers

The Ministry holds seminars and operates program intended for teachers, these include: seminars to science and technology teachers, a national seminar to mathematics teachers aimed at promoting excellence in mathematics (“*Doing their math – about girls in mathematics*”) (January 2017), Constructing an online advanced training website and content for teachers aimed at advancing girls in the fields of mathematics, science and technology, together with the CET; Assimilating the use of gender-sensitive teaching among teachers of mathematics, science and technology in the course of meetings, advanced training and conventions; Holding seminars to science and technology teachers together with the supervision over science and technology and the Haifa and Jerusalem Science Museums.

Arab and Bedouin Women and Girls

Government Resolution No. 3708 – The Bedouin population

The following are the main programs that were approved within the Resolution: increasing the number of literacy classes from kindergarten to high school, increasing the attendance of pupils and reducing dropout rates, operating a project titled "Education towards Career", recognizing and diagnosing learning impediments, expanding technological education and other education for detached youth and adults, expanding the activity of youth organizations and summer camps within the Bedouin localities, promoting the construction of classrooms and educational facilities, operating centers and programs intended to promote and encourage excellence, expanding the operation of the Excellence Promotion Program among high school pupils, operating a program to prepare 12th grade pupils for integration into the academia and the labor market, empowering and developing personal leadership abilities, upgrading the scientific-technological education in the Bedouin population, and more.

Equal Budgeting

The policy of the Ministry of Education (MOE) is to provide an equal budget to all schools, in accordance with clear and transparent criteria, while providing additional budgets to certain populations, both for educational and socio-economic reasons.

Thus, for example, the budget invested in the education of a pupil in the Jewish education system is 14,715 NIS (3,870 USD) and in the Arab education system is 15,375 NIS (4,046 USD). In the higher secondary education, the investment in a Jewish pupils stands at 24,344 NIS (6,406 USD) and in the Arab pupils - 18,667 NIS (4,912 USD).

The Ministry launched a five (5)-year plan for gap reduction and for the promotion of equality in primary and intermediate education, which is intended to substantially increase the budget of Arab schools. This program includes additional teaching hours for the Arab population with a budget of 1 Billion NIS (260 Million USD) over five (5) years, and additional substantial resources for enrichment activities of 100 Million NIS (26 million USD) in 2016 and 188 Million (49.5 million USD).

Question 18

The Five (5) -Year Program ("Maharim")

2016-2017 was the concluding year for the "*Five (5) year program*" which was established by the Council for Higher Education (CHE) and Planning and Budgeting Committee (PBC) in 2012. This is a unique program, aimed at integrating the ultra-Orthodox population in the academy.

The program marks an important cornerstone in this field, it established a new model for the financing of the institutions and the students by their field of study, and for the first time there were growth targets set for increase in ultra-Orthodox students in the Israeli academia. The goal which was set for the program was to integrate the ultra-Orthodox population into academic frameworks which are adapted for them; This is due to their unique cultural characteristics and the gaps in their knowledge that makes it difficult for them to integrate in the general academic frameworks. As part of the plan, ultra-Orthodox frameworks were established near universities and colleges and were under their responsibility. A 2016 evaluation of the program reveals that it was successful and exceeded most of its goals.

In 2014, the number of ultra-Orthodox students in their designated frameworks was 9,483. The majority of participants in the program are women, which constitute 67.5% of the students (6,393 students).

Question 19

Salary Gaps

In 2014, the gender pay gap was 33% in gross average income per month, and 16% in gross average income per work hour. According to the 2016 Diversity Index, the gaps are varied, depending on the field. For example, the highest rate of women representation is in the field of insurance, but it is also the field with the highest level of wage gap between women and men. In the field of production, distribution and television and radio broadcasting, the level of wage gap between women and men is the lowest. In the financial services field, the wage gap among women and men in small companies is roughly 50%, and in large companies and organizations the rate is between 30 and 35%. In the computer programming field, the wage gap in small companies is approximately 44%, compared to 30% in large companies. The index is constructed of two (2) classifications: representation, and wage equality. The source of the data used for the index is the "Income Tax of Employee Positions File" of 2014. (For information on the Diversity Index, see below).

Gender Salary Gaps Survey

In 2015-2016, the Equal Employment Opportunities Commission (EOC) at the Ministry of Economy and Industry (MOEI) conducted a first-of-a-kind survey in Israel, which examined the prevailing perceptions and standpoints of employers regarding gender salary gaps. The survey revealed some challenges; however the awareness towards them is crucial in order to improve equality in the labor market. For example, findings showed that 85% of the employers in the public and business sector believe that there is no difference between a salary of a man and a woman and only seventeen percent (17%) of the employers have examined if there are gender differences in the compensation levels in their workplace; this may explain the lack of awareness to the gender salaries gaps. On the other hand, with regard to initial wage, findings showed that almost half of the employers (47%) set the initial wage based on fixed criteria in advance, such as education, former position, etc., and only 36% of them do so based on individual negotiation with the employee; personal negotiation is more likely to create wage difference and thus, the tendency towards a fixed-in-advance criteria is positive. With regard to salary raise, the tendency is opposite -

about half the employers (46%) reported that they tend to set the timing and amount of raise based on individual negotiation with the employee. Though only 9% of the employers take active initiatives for reducing salary gaps, 56% of employers noted commitment to gender equality as part of their organization's vision or its values and 81% of employers indicated that they consider themselves as the responsible factor to narrow down salary differences.

“Worth the Same” - Promoting Equal Pay

This three (3)-year project (2012-2015) is a joint venture of the EOC and three different NGOs ("Shatil", the Israel Women Network (IWA) and Adva Center), funded by the EU. The aim of this Venture is to reduce gender pay gaps in the Israeli labor marker. The Venture operates in various channels and comprehensive strategies, while utilizing the relative advantage of each NGO. The main objectives of this Venture are: Developing knowledge of salary differences in Israel and abroad; increasing awareness of employers to the pay differences and the need to narrow them; coordinating collective action by employees by raising awareness and providing tools to cope with wage differences in workplaces; motivating policy-makers and the State authorities to effectively fight the pay differences in the market through legislative amendments and regulation that would allow to increase enforcement to prevent discrimination in pay and promote preventative enforcement; intensifying the public discourse on the matter of pay gaps, specifically among employers, employees and decision-makers.

Salary Gaps Calculator

One of the products that were developed by “Worth the Same” is the Salary Gaps Calculator. This is an innovative tool for gender-related analysis of the organization's pay data. The Calculator is based on an Excel format and enables the user to learn about the nature, scope and location of gender-based salary gaps with just a few clicks. The calculator includes findings regarding pension salary, gross pay and different added components. Complementary to the Calculator, is the Employer's Guide which provides a step-by-step support for inspecting the pay differences in the organization, analyze the pay differences, interpret the findings and formulate an

action plan to narrow the gaps, if needed. The Calculator can be downloaded by any employer in the EOC's website and the Guide is available in three (3) languages.

Business Diversity Index

The Diversity Index is a measuring tool developed by the EOC, the Central Bureau of Statistics and Tel Aviv University. The Diversity Index enables the indication of the level of diversity among employees in the private sector. The calculation is based on both representation and equal salary. It focuses on five (5) groups of population: women, Arabs, Israeli citizens of Ethiopian decent, people above the age of 45, and ultra-Orthodox citizens.

Women in Hi-Tec companies

In 2016, the MOEI has initiated a venture with the aim to enhance the involvement of women in the Hi-Tec industry. The MOEI published a tender, seeking to map the relevant companies and NGOs that are suitable to take part in this project. The proposed venture seeks to orientate and encourage the involvement of women in the Hi-Tec industry in various ways, including: Offering benefits for women who chose a carrier-path relevant for Hi-Tec field, such as personal mentoring throughout the years of studies, assistance with job finding, encouraging employers to promote women in Hi-Tec companies, and more.

The Equal Employment Opportunities Commission (EOC) at the MOEI

As detailed in the previous report (paragraph 388), in 2008, the Equal Employment Opportunities Commission (EOC) was established under the auspice of the Ministry of Economy and Industry (MOEI). The EOC is in charge on pursuing equality in the labor market through civil prosecution, raising awareness and research.

The EOC Complaints Procedure

The EOC is handling individual complaints regarding discrimination in the labor market on different backgrounds. In 2016, the EOC handled 636 complaints. 63% of them were complaints by women. Statistics indicate that compared to 2015, in 2016 there was an increase in the number of complaints regarding sexual harassment, while

there was 8.7% decrease in the number of complaints regarding pregnancy discrimination.

Measures taken to combat sexual harassment in the workplace

The Civil Service

The authority to handle sexual harassment cases in the Civil Service in individual cases is vested in the Disciplinary Department and the Investigations Department. The Department of Gender Equality focuses in the prevention level of sexual harassment and also serves as a mediating entity between the Discipline and Investigations Departments (the complainant approaches first the supervisor of gender equality; the Supervisor takes all the details and forward the complaint the Disciplinary and investigation Department); the Supervisor accompanies and monitors the Gender Equality Supervisors in handling individual complainants.

The Disciplinary Department conducts an investigation and following the investigation it decides whether to (a) close the case following an initial report (b) conduct a disciplinary procedure (c) recommend on a disciplinary hearing by the Civil Service Disciplinary Court. At the same time, the complainant can turn to a civil or criminal procedure according to the *Prevention of Sexual harassment Law*. Note, that a disciplinary procedure has substantive implications on the employee; for example: she/he has to report on such procedure taken against them in every tender she/he applies; it is a consideration in vacation approvals, Best Employee Certificate, professional promotions and more.

On May 22, 2016 the Commissioner published guidelines establishing the right of sexual harassment victims, to be informed of decisions and developments made in its case. This defines the duty of the Gender Equality Supervisor to inform the victim in every stage of the case, whether an investigation procedure will take place, alternately a dismissal in the case.

For recent statistics, see Table No. 20, Annex II.

Raising Public Awareness

In the framework of the information and raising awareness conducted by the EOC, the EOC team holds panels, conventions and many lectures with the purpose of reaching

diverse audiences, including employers, senior managers and employees. The EOC team holds over 100 lectures each year to different audiences in Israel and abroad. The purpose of the lectures is to make the existing knowledge concerning equal employment opportunities, in general, and the EOC work, in particular, more accessible. For example, in collaboration with Alfano Company, a series of lectures was held to an audience of Arab women whose working conditions are below the standards, and an audience of unemployed women as well as potential employees. The goal was to increase their awareness to the equality legislation, and giving them relevant tools to cope with the barriers in the labor market.

Question 20

Mechanisms to Ensure the Safe Work Environment of Foreign Workers

Bilateral Agreements

In the last few years the State of Israel has been promoting the signing of bilateral agreements with countries of origin for the recruitment of foreign workers in the agricultural, caregiving and construction fields. The State allows recruitment in the agriculture and construction fields only through regulated bilateral agreements or arrangements with countries of origin. These agreements are designed, *inter alia*, to prevent the charging of illegal intermediary fees and exploitation of foreign workers.

So far, Israel has signed in the agriculture field, an agreement with Thailand for the recruitment of agricultural workers and several arrangements with Sri-Lanka for the recruitment of a limited number of seasonal workers. In the construction field, Israel has signed agreements with Bulgaria, Moldova, the Ukraine and China. Israel has also signed and implemented two (2) pilot programs with Nepal and Sri-Lanka for the recruitment of a limited number of foreign caregivers. Additional negotiations in this field are underway with other countries.

The PIBA Hotline

Within the framework of the bilateral agreements that Israel entered into, the PIBA has contracted the Center for International Migration and Integration NGO(CIMI) to administer a hotline for foreign workers, who arrived in Israel as part of these agreements, to reply and take care of their questions and complaints.

Upon their arrival to Israel, every foreign worker receives a card which includes the details of the hotline and the various officials they may contact whenever necessary. The hotline receives complaints in foreign languages during working hours, and has an option to leave a recorded message 24 hours a day, their complaints are registered and transferred to the relevant bodies for further inquiry. The hotline employs nine (9) translators to six (6) languages, including: Thai, Bulgarian, Russian, Nepalese, Sinhalese and Romanian.

In the last three (3) years the hotline received a total of approximately 5,400 applications, 78% of which were rights-related information requests. Approximately 2,300 were forwarded to the PIBA, and 2,300 of these were processed and closed upon completion, about 1,500 being redressed through the hotline, while another approximately 790 were forwarded for processing by the MOLSASS (the remaining complaints were closed for other reasons: the worker was not available via phone, the worker left the country, etc.).

Designated Social Workers in private agencies: The PIBA Procedure 9.2.0001 regarding Private Agencies for Brokering, Processing and Bringing Over Foreign Workers in the nursing care field – private agencies must employ a designated social worker, who must be registered in the MOLSASS' social worker registry, have at least three (3) years of professional experience, and possess professional skills relevant to this field, whose purpose is to maintain the existence of balance and correlation between the patients' needs and rights, and the needs and rights of the foreign caregivers. Among other things, the social worker must carry out home visits to any residence in which a foreign worker was placed to care for a patient, with the aim of detecting and finding solutions for any employment problems that may arise during the course of the employment period. The procedure states, among other things, that a social worker must visit the residence prior to placement, and a second time during the first month of employment. Furthermore, regular visits must be carried out at least once every six (6) months (according to the Visits Procedure these can be carried out by either a senior employee at the company or by a social worker). In addition, in cases where a risk arises of violence, sexual harassment, employment in functions other than providing nursing care for the patient, or in any other irregular event, the social worker must immediately submit a written report concerning said risks to the national social workers' supervisor, as well as to other relevant authorities.

Social workers supervisor: The PIBA employs a social worker who acts as a national supervisor in charge of the private agencies' social workers, which is responsible for

verifying their compliance with the conditions for qualifying as a private agency social worker, as well as for case management and counseling in cases where social workers encounter exceptional events during their work with their clients. The social worker may ask the designated agency social workers to undergo training in subjects pertaining to their work. In 2016, for example, a day seminar was conducted on the subject of worker-employer relations, in which over 100 social workers participated. This seminar focused on the rights and obligations of foreign workers in a 24/6 work structure.

Administrative enforcement

In many cases, complaints filed with the Permits Department (by the national supervisor, citizens, private agencies applying to us directly, the Worker's Hotline, etc.) are forwarded for further processing within an administrative enforcement framework – including holding a hearing to the employer, conducting a process of inquiry and investigation by the PIBA enforcement team, and issuing a decision in relation to the employer's permit (such as a decision to restrict, set conditions to, or abrogate the permit in serious cases).

A recent example is a private agency applied directly to the permits department and reported that a foreign worker told the agency that her employer regards her as "a friend," and not a caregiver, making her feel uncomfortable. The PIBA called the employer in for a hearing and simultaneously launched an inquiry concerning the case (gathering social worker reports concerning the patient, as well as questioning the foreign workers), leading to a decision to restrict the patient's permit to employing male-only foreign workers, out of a desire to protect female foreign workers from potential harm. The patient filed a petition against this decision, which was granted. The Population Authority appealed the petition at the Supreme Court, and the appeal was allowed, upholding the original decision (*The PIBA v. Menashe Levi, Ad. A. 2306-15, 19.5.2015*).

In 2016, as part of the administrative enforcement procedures carried out by the MOLSASS, 38 administrative employer hearings were performed in 2016, and 38 decisions were issued with regard to violations in the nursing care field.

The Ombudswoman for Foreign Workers' Rights

The Ombudswoman operates independently under the MOLSASS. The objective of the Ombudswoman is to further fight trafficking in persons by impeding unsafe work environments that could be grounds for exploitation, and in extreme cases, may in themselves amount to trafficking in persons. The Ombudswoman is responsible for receiving complaints and inquiries from foreign workers regarding violations of labor laws, monitoring employment conditions, providing foreign workers with information and advice on the application of various laws, providing information regarding their status and providing general information on labor rights. In 2016, the Ombudswoman replied to over 1,500 inquiries.

Health Care for Foreign Workers

Employers of foreign workers are obliged to provide a comprehensive health insurance for their employees throughout their employment period, and the employer's legal obligation applies regardless of the legal status of the employee in Israel. Upon arrival of foreign workers from abroad, and at every visa extension, the employer is required to prove that she/he has provided the worker with valid health insurance, and a summary of the policy in a language the employee understands must be attached to the labor contract provided to the worker. Violation of this provision is considered a criminal offence, punishable by substantial fines.

With regard to foreign residents, in January, 2013, the Ministry of Health opened a clinic in southern Tel Aviv-Jaffa for foreign residents whom do not receive state health insurance. The Clinic costs approximately 3.2 Million NIS (U.S \$ 842,105) to build. The clinic can treat about 100 patients a day. In 2015 for example, the clinic was visited by approximately 3,900 people. Persons without legal status including asylum seekers, constituted a third of the Clinic's patients, approximately 3,000 visits. Some of the medical services provided in the Levinski Clinic are: diagnosing and treating STD for men and women; short anamneses for pregnant women – women who are pregnant are tested for Syphilis; escorting new HIV positive patients for clarification of HIV status and referring them to the national program for follow-up and treatment. There are also obstetrics and gynecology services. When the need to hospitalize a patient rises, the patient is referred to a near hospital. The hospitalization can include surgeries, birth and when needed the neonatal intensive care unit (NICU)

services. The Clinic works in cooperation with the Tuberculosis and AIDS Department in the Ministry of Health and assists in referring foreign residents to different community services, such as assistance with psychotherapy and psychosocial problems. It also works in cooperation with the UNHCR and different Israeli NGOs.

The "**Gesher**" **clinic**, located in Tel Aviv-Jaffa, funded by the Ministry of Health, provides mental health services, including psycho-social support and medication to foreign residents.

In addition, the Ministry of Health operates "**Mobile clinic tours**" which *inter alia*, twice a month attends persons without legal status, asylum seekers and refugees who engage in prostitution.

Question 21 – Health

Infant Mortality

Studies show that about 2/3 of the gaps in infant mortality between Jews and Arabs in Israel result from the surplus mortality in the Arab population from congenital disorders. Thus, the MOH is devoting great efforts to addressing this issue in different ways. Such efforts include, *inter alia*, the following: In 2017, additional screening tests, among else for detecting genetic diseases in prevalence of 1:60 in the Arab and Druze populations, were added to the State-funded Health Care Basket (hereinafter: HCB) so it would be a free-of-charge test. Early discovery of such genetic disorders is significant due to its high frequency in the Arab and Druze population. In addition, the 2017 HCB was updated so it includes a very large variety of medicines and technologies of all medical fields: preventative medicine (carrier testing, skeleton, and genetic diseases), through the fields of obstetrics and gynecology.

In addition, Nuchal translucency and additional genetic tests were added the HCB of the *National Health Insurance Law*, which made these tests accessible to populations with limited means, including the Bedouin population.

The designated unit for *reducing health* disparities operates to reduce inequality in six (6) main channels: (1) Reducing gaps in economic accessibility to healthcare services; (2) reducing the effect of cultural differences on the use and quality of healthcare services; (3) Making sure that a sufficient number of high-quality, professional

healthcare providers is available in the periphery area. (4) Improving physical and technological infrastructure in the (geographically and socially) remote areas and periphery area; (5) Enhancing regulation and incentives to the HMOs to reduce health-related inequality; (6) Enabling available information concerning medical situations, accessibility and availability of healthcare services and other effective interventions to reduce health-related inequality.

As part of a National Program to Reduce Inequality in Health, more steps were taken:

- 31 new child-development local clinics were established in different remote areas, 16 of those in Arab localities, making services more accessible; Each family's health station file was computerized, to enable easy access to important and vital healthcare data, for assessing the healthcare status and improving its services.
- In 2014 the MOH established a program aimed to enrich bread with folic acid and other trace elements in the central bakery in Rahat, which supplies bread and pita-bread to about 25% of the Bedouin population in Israel.
- Israel's infant mortality rate continues to decrease from 6.3 between 1996 and 1999, to 3.1 deaths for every 1,000 live births in 2015. Among Jewish population, the infant mortality rate decreased even further to 2.2 in 2014 and 2.1 in 2015. Among the general Arab population, infant mortality rate is also decreasing steadily, although still higher than other populations, and stands at a rate of 6.2 in 2015 (compared to an average of 7.1 between 2005 and 2009). Among Muslims, the infant mortality rate is also decreasing and it stands at 6.5 deaths per 1,000 live births in 2014 (compared to 7.4 in 2010). Among Christians, the infant mortality rate is also decreasing and stands at 2.5 deaths per 1,000 live births in 2014 (compared to 2.8 in 2010). Among the Druze population, the infant mortality rate is also decreasing and stands at 3.4 deaths per 1,000 live births in 2015 (compared to 4.3 in 2013). According to the Ministry of Health, the infant mortality rate among Bedouins in 2014 was 11:1000, representing a decline compared to 2005 (15:1000). The gap between the populations stems from a number of factors, among them the high rate of consanguineous marriage which leads to a high rate of birth defects, religious prohibition against abortion even in medically recommended cases, as well as socio-economic differences and high rates of births among older women.

- Examining the reasons for infant mortality shows that the most common reason for infant mortality in the Jewish population is postnatal complication (1.3 per 1,000 live births), while among other religious groups the leading reason is, congenital diseases (2.5 per 1,000 live births).
- Unfortunately, larger mortality rates are found in remote areas, north and south while highest rates are in Arab villages, Druze and Bedouin. The rates show that mortality rate corresponds to the socio-economic rating of the towns in Israel. This issue is still a challenge and many efforts are invested to overcome it.

See Table No.21, Annex II.

Maternal mortality

Maternal mortality in Israel is relatively rare and in recent years the rate of maternal mortality remained generally low.

See Tables No. 22-23, Annex II.

Cancer prevention efforts

Prevalence of breast cancer among Israeli Women

New medicines and technologies with a total cost of 470 Million NIS (117.5 Million USD) will be added this year (2017) to the Israeli HCB, including about 230 Million NIS (57.5 Million USD) for oncological medicines. Those include medicines for treatment of metastatic cervical cancer (Avastin) and treatment of PSR ovarian cancer (Lynparza), with total costs of over 3 Million NIS (810,810 USD). In addition, endocrinologic treatments were approved for advanced breast cancer patients.

In Israel, as in many countries around the world, breast cancer is the most common cancer among women of all population groups. 16% of the new cancer cases each year are attributed to breast cancer (approximately 4,000 cases). Breast cancer often appears on a genetic background, with clear risk of belonging to a family with a history of the disease.

In 2013, breast cancer constituted 33% of invasive cancer cases in of women in Israel. Out of 4,617 cases of breast cancer, 4,024 were Jewish women (86%), 420 were Arab women (9%), and 217 women from other groups (5%). The number of women who

were diagnosed with *in situ* breast cancer in 2013 is 536; out of which, 90% of them are Jewish women, and 10% of other religious groups.

There are 28,823 women who live in Israel and were diagnosed with breast cancer between the years 2009-2013 (who recovered or are still coping with the disease). Out of which, 21,266 who were diagnosed with *invasive* breast cancer, and 2,557 who were diagnosed with *in situ* breast cancer.

The rate of survival of breast cancer is 87% for Jewish women and 78% for Arab women (for a relative examination period of five (5) years).

Prevalence of cervical cancer among Israeli Women

Cervical cancer is the third most common cancer in women in the world. This cancer type is not common in Israel, and the disease's incidence rates are among the lowest in the western countries.

In addition, the relative five (5) years survival rates for invasive cervical cancer have increased over the years; for Jewish women diagnosed between the years 1991-1995 the rate was 63.4%, and has increased to 67.2% for those diagnosed between the years 1996-2000, and to 71.4% for those diagnosed between 2001-2006.

The relative five (5) years survival rate was 71.5% for Arab women diagnosed between the years 1996-2000, and 65.9% for those diagnosed between the years 2001-2006. However, these differences are immaterial given the low numbers they represent.

Between the years 1980-2012, the incidence rates for Jews are higher than those for Arabs. In both population groups, an increase is apparent since 1980 until the early 90s, and later, the rates remain steady. For example, in 2012, 231 Israeli women were diagnosed with invasive cervical cancer: 188 Jewish women (81%), and only 19 Arab women (8%).

Prevalence of ovarian cancer among Israeli Women

Ovarian cancer constitutes about 2.5% of all new diagnosed cancer cases among women every year in Israel, and is responsible to over 5% of total mortality from cancer among women every year. One of the reasons for that it that in two thirds (2/3)

of the patients, the disease is diagnosed in the metastasis stage, mostly, since it has no special symptoms or signs, and has no appropriate screening test. This is why women in high risk are recommended to be under proper medical supervision, which may save their lives.

Incidence and mortality rates are higher in Jewish women, compared to Arab women. Mortality rates from ovarian cancer are in a declining trend in Jewish women since the mid-90s; in Arab women the declining trend started in the mid-2000s.

The situation in Israel is similar to that in the world in the sense that decrease in incidence is at least partly attributed to reducing the use of alternative hormonal treatment, and perhaps also to the increase in use of contraceptive pills. Decrease in mortality rates originates, at least partly, from decrease in incidence rates of the disease.

Prevention Efforts

Many efforts are taken to prevent those kinds of cancer:

Breast cancer: Women are entitled to the most current breast cancer treatment. Early detection using screening programs was proven to decrease breast cancer mortality and enabling a change in the course of the disease. Accordingly, since early 90s, the Israel Cancer Association together with the MOH and all HMOs are running the national early detection program for breast cancer. The program is intended for women of ages 50-74, and includes one (1) mammography test every two (2) years. In addition, specific programs for high-risk patients are available. For women over 40 with certain medical history, an annual mammography is recommended. MOH guidelines from December 4, 2016, sets the criteria for screening examination (once in two (2) years for age 50-74, and for women in potential risk groups once a year from age 40) and require hospitals and HMOs to report on the number of women that are referred to and undergo screening; this, in order to examine the screening efficiency (after comparing with the numbers of diagnosed patients). Also note, that response to the breast cancer survey program was included as one (1) of the quality parameters for measurement of HMOs; they demonstrate almost equal response between the Jewish and Arab population.

In 2014, as an organizational strategy, significant resources were dedicated to developing the use of geographic information system (GIS) for mapping and developing programs to improve treatment of breast cancer among disadvantaged populations. This includes, *inter alia*, the Program for Early Detection of Breast Cancer, which is aimed to detect in which regions there is lower accessibility or reluctances to mammography test, and to adjust the mammography service availability and distribution accordingly.

Cervical Cancer: Prevention: In 2013, the MOH initiated the program for prevention of cervical cancer; as part of this program, girls are given vaccination for the HPV at the 8th grade. In 2015, the program was expanded to include vaccinations to boys. Furthermore, an integral part of this Prevention Program is to teach about safe sexual relations and the possible ways that HPV can be spread. Schools also have education programs on safe sex and related issues (for further information see question 17).

Early detection: An early detection of cervical cancer is possible by PAP Smear. This test is included in the HCB for women in the age of 35-54. A national survey recently conducted by the MOH shows that 44.7% of women above the age of 21 in Israel reported performing a Pap Smear in the three (3) years preceding the survey.

Ovarian Cancer: MOH guidelines from 2012 instructs that women with relevant genetic or family background should undergo genetic counselling, and according to the results of that, if they are at potential risk group for ovarian cancer, need to take periodic tests starting from age 25, every six (6) months.

The number of new patients in 2013 was 361 (2.5% of all new incidents in women). Of these, 316 were Jewish patients, 31 were Arab patients and 14 patients were of other populations. The incidence rate in 2013 was 7.54/100,000 among the Jewish population and 4.88/100,000 among Arab population. The highest incidence rate in 2013, was registered in the 75+ age group, 34.9/100,000 in the Jewish population and 27.9/100,000 among the Arab population. The disease diagnosis is known for 75% of all new patients in 2013, of those: 12.6% were diagnosed with locally distributed tumor (early stage), 21.2% were diagnosed with regionally distributed tumor (adjacent tissue and/or lymphatic nodes) and 66.2% were diagnosed with metastatic tumor. In regard to trends in the period between 1990 and 2013, in Jewish women there was a steady trend at the early 90s' and continued decrease in ovarian cancer incidence since

the mid-90s, while among Arab women, there was an increase until the early 2000s and since then the trend is relatively steady.

For more information on cancer prevalence, see Table No.24, Annex II.

For information regarding life expectancy, see Table No.25, Annex II.

Question 22

Employment – Bedouin Population

Steps Taken to Increase the Rate of Employment among the Bedouin Population

Employment Centers for the Bedouin population - Ryan Centers

The Government and the American Jewish Joint Distribution Committee have jointly decided to create unique employment guidance centers in the Bedouin localities. These centers assist in enhancing the number of employed persons, aid in the creation of small businesses and enterprises, provide professional training and guidance for entrepreneurs and financial solutions and will hopefully lead to change in employment-related perceptions and norms in the Bedouin population, including encouraging the employment of women while providing them with specialized training. The first employment center was opened in Hura in April 2010. The center provides, *inter alia*, professional training, guidance for entrepreneurs, financial solutions for small businesses, daycare solutions and empowerment for women who seek employment.

As of November 2015, there were eight (8) employment guidance centers ("Ryan Centers") that provide labor assistance, guidance and placements in all of the Bedouin localities including two (2) that were opened in 2015 in the Neve Midbar and Al-Kasum Regional Councils. The construction of an additional center is currently conducted in Kuseife.

In 2015, the Ryan centers handled 2,855 new employment applicants, 1,683 of whom were assisted in the placement in positions of employment. Between 2012 and 2014, these centers handled 4,538 new applicants (over 50% of whom were women) and assisted in the placement of 62.5% of them. Also, 86% of the men and 66% of the women who found employment with the assistance of these centers continued to be

employed a year later. Most of these employees were hired for full-time positions. Between 2012 and 2015, the average participation rate of women in this program was 51%. These centers hold a list of possible employers, which currently includes several hundred businesses and firms that assist in the placement of Bedouin employees.

Professional training – the MOEI operates several tracks of vocational training including day trainings that are funded almost fully by the Ministry (except a small obligation fee); business courses conducted both by the Ryan centers and by private colleges and business entities in the Negev area; vocational training vouchers that enable the employment service and the Ryan centers to provide an applicant with a voucher that subsidizes a vocational training of her/his choice within the business entities that provide such training; an additional option is vocational training conducted by employers in the workplace. In 2015, 646 persons (38% of them were women) attended these courses that included: welding, office management, medical cosmetics, computerized graphics, dental assistance, public vehicle driving, bookkeeping, bakery and more. Additionally, in 2015 about 900 persons, both men and women, attended workshops and seminars aimed at providing information and preparation for entry into the labor force. An additional 130 persons, both men and women, attended triple workshops that include Business Hebrew lessons, computer skills, empowerment and preparation for entry into the labor force. In 2015, the total operational cost of these vocational centers was approximately 20 Million NIS (5.26 Million USD). In addition, the MOEI operates seminars and classes for education completion.

The MOEI operates three (3) technological high-schools for Bedouin pupils between the ages of 15 and 18 in Hura, Rahat and Segev-Shalom. In 2015, 1,090 pupils, both male and female, attended these schools.

Moreover, the Ministry of Science and Technology Training Institute operates a special practical engineering learning course. In 2013 and 2014, a total of 98 Bedouin students graduated these studies, a third of them were women. In 2015, an additional 73 students graduated these studies. This course is conducted in four (4) regional colleges in the Negev, and the students can choose the specific course of study. This learning course includes a full scholarship, monthly income scholarship and transportation fees, personal tutoring during the studies and placement assistance

following graduation (an average sum of 40,000 NIS (10,500 USD) per student per year) for Bedouin students who meet the relevant requirements.

The MOEI also operates vocational guidance and assistance program for those who wish to enter *higher education institutions*. This program includes tutoring and guidance before, during and after integration into higher education studies, enhancement courses in Hebrew and English, preparation courses for the psychometric test (higher education admission exam), assistance in enrolling to the chosen institution, preparation workshops to the academic world, and more. In 2015, 410 Bedouin students participated in this program, during which 14 psychometric test courses and six (6) Hebrew courses were conducted. Of these participants, 120 registered to higher education institutions for the upcoming academic year.

Projects to Reduce Unemployment

Employment tracks - In order to encourage employment among the minority populations, a factory or entrepreneurial business in the industrial, services or tourism fields, which employs at least four (4) new employees from the Bedouin or the Jewish ultra-Orthodox population in the Negev, would be entitled to a reimbursement of 15% - 20% of these workers' monthly wages for a period of five (5) years. The employer would also be reimbursed for the costs of organized transportation to and from the workplace, up to a total of 3,000 NIS (U.S. \$811) per worker, annually.

Daycare centers - due to the importance of daycare centers for the reintegration of working mothers into the labor market, in 2013 the MOEAI approved 95% of the requests for financial support from local councils in Lakiya, Tel-Sheva, Kuseife, Hura, and Segev-Shalom. In 2014, daycares for the children of 660 working Bedouin mothers were subsidized in these localities.

Furthermore, by virtue of Government Resolution No. 3708, the MOEI's Investment Center operates employment programs in an effort to integrate new Bedouin workers into the workforce. These programs are based on the Ministry's Director General's Order No. 4.17.

This Director General's Order is aimed to promote the employment of populations with low participation in the workforce. The Arab population (including the Bedouins) is

included in this program. Assistance is provided through the competitive allocation of funds for specific businesses as defined in the Director General's Orders, and which intend to establish or to expand a business in any part of the country, so long as at least 90% of their employees (and with regard to an expansion, at least 90% of the newly-employed workers) are members of a population with low workforce participation levels. Businesses seeking to receive this assistance must commit to employ workers for a period exceeding 30 months, with a minimum number of employees and a minimum salary level established by law. Those entitled to the competitive allocation receive a partial subsidy for the monthly salary costs of the employees throughout the 30 month period.

The Director General's Order gives preference to the employment of Bedouins from the Negev and establishes a lower minimum number of workers (compared to other populations) to qualify for assistance, requests that include employment schemes in which at least 60% are of certain populations - and among them Bedouins - receive priority, and are examined prior to other requests.

Industrial Parks

Park – "Idan Ha-Negev" (The Negev Era) spreads over 4,500 dunams and is managed and operated by the three (3) local authorities which established it – the Bnei-Shimon Regional Council, the Rahat municipality and the Lehavim local council. The park was established with an investment of 20 Million NIS (5.3 Million USD) and the MOEAI has allocated an additional 25 Million NIS (6.7 Million USD) for the second stage of development. Moreover, Government Resolution No. 3708 allocated an additional 68 Million NIS (18.5 Million USD) to further develop the park. This industrial park includes areas for industry, commerce, the construction of a hospital, college and public buildings. As of April 2015, the lots in the northern area of the park (about 500 dunams) were marketed to about 50 entrepreneurs and they are now in various stages of development. 65% of these entrepreneurs are Bedouins from the Negev who wish to establish factories that will employ local young Bedouins in order to lower the relatively high unemployment rates among the Bedouin population.

The first factory in "Idan Ha-Negev," SodaStream, has already begun operations and currently employs 850 workers (about 25% of them are Bedouin employees). An

additional important factory, "Kargal," also began its operation in the park. The park's management is working to train and absorb Bedouin employees, both men and women, with the Employment Service Bureau in Rahat and Ryan Centers.

The Government has also allocated 40 Million NIS (10.9 Million USD) for the advancement of the joint industrial and employment zone at the Shoket Junction - a 4,000 dunams employment zone. The employment zone's municipal rate incomes will be divided between Bnei-Shimon, Meitar, Hura and Lakiya. As of June 2015, this joint industrial park was in advanced planning stages and construction works are expected to begin later in 2016.

The MOEI is also working (as part of Government Resolution No. 3708) in Segev-Shalom, Ar'ara and the Neve Midbar Regional Council (in the localities of Bir Hadaj and Abu Krinat). In Abu Krinat, development works for the establishment of an industrial zone that will encompass an area of 100 dunams are nearly complete. The Regional Council recently began the marketing of the lots in the industrial park that have been developed for entrepreneurs. The land and deployment costs are subsidized at a rate of 85%. Furthermore, the development works of an industrial park that will encompass an area of 100 dunams in Bir Hadaj has begun and the Regional Council finalized the preparation of a tender for the development of this area. The MOEAI also financed the planning and zoning for two (2) similar industrial parks in Umm Batin and Al-Seid. The Segev-Shalom industrial area encompasses 495 dunam, of which 170 have been developed. One of the anchor factories in this area, which takes up 70 dunams, is a chicken product factory which employs 1,200 employees, of which 700 are Bedouin women and 300 are Bedouin men. This factory is due to expand by an additional 10 dunams and is expected to employ an additional 300 workers, many of them of the Bedouin population. The other businesses in this industrial area employ an additional 350 employees.

Furthermore, the *Encouragement of Capital Investments Order (Determination of Development Areas)* 5763-2002 was amended in order to strengthen the Arab localities, including the Bedouin communities. There are currently seventeen (17) planned industrial areas in the Southern district, seven (41%) of which are located in Bedouin towns – Rahat, Segev-Shalom, Hura, Abu Krinat, Bir Hadaj, Umm Batin and Al-Seid.

Center for Nurturing Entrepreneurship

As part of the implementation of Government Resolution No. 3708, the Bedouin Branch in the Agency for Small and Medium-Sized Businesses conducted ten (10) entrepreneurship and empowerment courses in 2013 and two (2) courses during the first half of 2014. In addition, in cooperation with the "Koret Fund," the Authority provided micro loans for Bedouin and Arab women. In 2015, 20 Million NIS (5.26 Million USD) were allocated as micro-loans for this population.

The total budget designated for the encouragement of business entrepreneurship, under Government Resolution No. 3708, is 14 Million NIS (3.8 Million USD) to be implemented over 2012-2016.

Since the establishment of the Ma'of corporation in Rahat in June 2014, several improvements have taken place where the unit operates with a program more suitable for the Bedouin population, enjoys greater resources and personnel, and the tools that serve this unit have also been improved. The unit currently provides services towards mapping the customer's needs, providing both general and financial advice, training and guidance, holding conferences, and operates an ongoing project titled "initiation of a business". The office staff has been expanded and includes services adapted also to gender sensitivities. The unit is examining further fields of action such as the establishment of a business forum, assistance to farmers, etc.

In view of the difficulties and the unique nature of this population, the Ma'of field units have adapted their assistance mechanisms and work procedures to the characteristics of the population. The Bedouin localities in southern Israel were defined as "distant periphery", thus allowing for the operation of smaller groups in training sessions and courses, as well as for greater subsidies.

In 2015, as part of the implementation of Government Resolution No. 3708 the Ma'of field unit in Rahat provided consulting services, trainings, workshops, seminars and special programs to 420 entrepreneurs and small businesses (with up to 100 employees) of the Bedouin population.

Women's Entrepreneurship

In the framework of the Ma'of field units, women entrepreneurship is promoted. Such activities include training days for women in the various localities focusing on opening and managing a business, providing advice in the various aspects of business operation, etc. These activities are conducted in cooperation with the Ryan centers. The director of business services for Bedouin women invests great efforts in assisting women in opening small businesses. The director visits the homes of the women who attend the training days and seek assistance in opening a business. These visits are conducted in order to identify potential women participants in a special course on business management.

Access to Health – Bedouin Population

Mother and Child Health Care Stations ("Tipat Halav") in the Bedouin Localities

These stations provide counseling, pregnancy follow-ups, vaccinations, screening tests, and health promotion programs. There are 47 mother and child healthcare stations located in the southern district, 27 of which (57%) were designated for the Bedouin population. As of April 2016, in the southern district there were 128 positions of mother and child healthcare nurses, 73 positions of which (57%) were designated for clinics that serve the Bedouin population specifically. As of April 2016, 66 of these 73 positions were filled (90%) and there was a very limited shortage of nurses.

Mobile services to the Bedouin localities

There are eight (8) transportable clinics, specifically designed to reach the farthest regions of Bedouin communities, a service which does not exist for the distant Jewish localities in the Negev. In addition, there is a mobile vaccination service that locates families who do not visit the health clinics and provides complete vaccination and preventive services at or close to the families' homes, another service which is not provided at all to the Jewish population. Additionally, a network of family health stations operates within the HMOs in the district.

Promoting Health Services within Bedouin localities

According to Government Resolution No. 2397 titled "Government plan for the empowerment and socio-economic strengthening of the Bedouin localities in the Negev for the years 2017-2021 (See in the Report under Question 22), the MOH is allocating three (3) Million NIS (750,000\$) for improving health services to the Bedouin population. Government Resolution No. 922 addresses strengthening the Bedouin localities in the north. The program's operation began in 2016 and will continue until 2020. The program focuses on promoting the health of residents in those localities, including family healthcare clinics and Mother and Child Health Care Stations. The program is at its preliminary performance stages; to this day, a master plan was created and a meeting held with the Bedouin authorities to plan the optimal adjustment of the program to the local needs.

Promoting Health Services within the Druze and Circassian localities

This program was established under Government Resolution No. 59 (June 7, 2015). The program's operation began in 2016 and will continue until 2020. This program focuses on promoting health of residents in those localities, including building and renovating family healthcare clinics and Mother and Child Health Care Stations.

Access to health within the Bedouin localities in the Negev

Following Government Resolution No. 3708, (September 11, 2011), 90 Million USD were allocated for the issues of society and community and healthcare services were expanded.

- Today, there are 47 family health stations in the Southern District, out of which, 27 stations (57%) service Bedouin population.
- In the Southern District, 174 public health nurses are employed, out of those, 97 nurses work in the Bedouin community and 77 nurses in the Jewish community.
- Nurses working the Bedouin community as of April 2016:
 - Meuhedet HMO: in the Southern District there are 178 nurses, out of those, six (6) nurses in Bedouin localities: in Segev-Shalom, Lakiya, Tel Sheva and Aru'ar.

- Leumit HMO: in the southern part of the Southern District (up to Gedera in the north) there are 91 nurses, out of those, 12 nurses working with the Bedouin population.
- Maccabi HMO: 202 nurses work in the Southern District, out of those, six (6) in Bedouin localities.
- Clalit HMO: approximately 400 nurses in the Southern District, out of those, 76 in Bedouin localities- that is, almost 20%.
- In September 2015, 31 members of the Bedouin population graduated with a diploma in nursing.
- As of April 2016, there are 60 health clinics providing for the Bedouin population in the Negev, including independent physicians who work with these clinics and provide services. Medical services are also available outside the Bedouin localities, such as in Be'er-Sheva, Yeruham, Arad, Dimona, Omer, Mitzpe-Ramon, etc.
- The General Health Fund operates a clinic in Rahat that is open during evenings, nights, and over the weekend.
- Clinics in unauthorized Bedouin villages located throughout the Negev are all computerized, air conditioned, and equipped according to the standards adhered by all the Health Funds (HMOs) in the country.

Nursing education

- The MOH is making continues efforts to recruit and fill all nurses' positions within the Bedouin Diaspora, including by providing financial incentives. Currently, all Mother and Child Health Care Stations' nursing positions have been filled, though there is still a mild shortage of positions for school nurses in the Bedouin population. The nurses are trained, among other things, on issues that are specifically important for the Bedouin population.
- Within the Designated Nursing program for the Bedouin population in the Ashkelon Nursing Collage, affiliated with Barzilai Hospital, which is in the Southern District of Israel, 31 students graduated in September 2015 and proceeded to the licensing exam; 27 students were due to graduate in September 2016 and proceed to the licensing exam.

In universities, colleges and nursing schools, approximately 50% of the students, on average, are of the Arab population, including Bedouins.

Recent Legislation amendments regarding health care

On July 7, 2014, the Government amended the *Patient's Rights Law* 5756-1996 to include prohibition of discrimination in providing medical treatment for reasons of age (unless required for medical reasons).

Also in 2014, the Government enacted, *inter alia*, the *Supervision on the Quality of Food and Proper Nutrition in Education Institutions Law* 5774-2014 which obligates the State to supervise the nutritional values of all foods served and sold in educational institutions. Of the 500 schools that participate in the MOE's healthy schools program, 30% are schools that serve the Arab population. In addition, of the 250 kindergartens that participate in this program, 62 (25%) are located in Arab localities.

Immunization coverage - The rate of immunization coverage of Bedouin children is over 90%, similar to the general population.

Question 23

Female prisoners - “Neve Tirtza” Women Prison – prominent findings of the official review visit by the Public Defender's Office (PDO)

A significantly favorable change has occurred in the prison is that almost all prisoners are integrated within a treatment/educational/occupational program. Treatment services have increased and further treatment groups have opened. Alongside the treatment groups, the educational services have also increased and they are also supported by outside volunteers; likewise, the occupational services have also expanded.

The varied groups include, *inter alia*, a group for victims of sexual offenses. Four (4) groups are currently operating concurrently at the prison in collaboration with the Association of Rape Crisis Centers in Israel (ARCCI); “Mentor” groups – a treatment project for discharged prisoners - aimed at facilitating discharged prisoners’ entry back into society and the community; vocational training courses. In addition the prison has an impressive production center in which the prisoners receive financial

remuneration according to a specific output agreed upon in advance with the center's work providers (generally packaging and sewing work) and an education center, where all the classrooms are equipped with air-conditions, tables, chairs and the necessary teaching aids. The center also has the prison's main library that contains a wide variety of books in several languages (Hebrew, Russian, Arabic, French, Spanish etc.). Furthermore, the center also has a large yard which is used for activities during the day and also in the afternoons. Also, from time to time professional handball trainers come to train the prisoners.

The Official Visitors concluded by stating that *"we were impressed that the Neve Tirtza Prison sees itself not only as having confidence in public safety and in deterring criminal offenses from society while implementing deterrence and reward considerations, but also to a great extent, trust in the return of prisoners to society as normative citizens with the tools to deal with the problems that led them to carry out Offenses, while providing tools that will significantly reduce the risk of recurrence of offenses. There is no doubt that the prison's various goals are understood by the staff of Neve Tirtza and are implemented in the field, and it is to be hoped that similar conduct will be implemented in all the prisons in Israel"*.

Programs for Disadvantaged Populations by the MOLSASS

During 2016, the Individual and Family Welfare Service, a unit of the MOLSASS, had focused on operating two (2) main programs at the cost of 19 Million NIS (5.13 Million USD). These programs, "Eshet Hail" (Woman of Valor) and "Employment for Wellbeing", are operated nationwide and include 93 groups at 80 local-authorities across the country.

"Eshet Hail" - integrating women in the inter-cultural transition within the employment domain. The "Eshet Hail" program is operated by the MOLSASS together with the Minorities Economic Development Authority at the Prime Minister's Office (the Ministry of Social Equality), Tevet (JDC Israel) and in collaboration with additional Government Ministries. The program is operated and managed by the "Be-Atzmi" NGO, following a tender, while working closely together with the Department of Social Services in the local authorities.

The program aims to assist women from traditional societies towards successful integration in work places, by increasing their motivation to be employed, developing “employability”, providing tools and skills for integrating and succeeding in work. In addition the women receive counseling and guidance for professional, occupational and educational development. The women are given support as well as personal and group assistance.

During 2016, a tour had been held at two (2) local authorities of the Arab community, attended by high-level officials from the MOLSASS and the Ministry of Finance, as well as representatives of other public authorities and participants in the program.

A one-day seminar had been held for all of the coordinators and administration staff on the issue of domestic violence.

As to January, 2017, a total of 2,386 women participate in the program within 70 groups operating in 65 local authorities nationwide, within the framework of the present tender. Additionally the program operates at three (3) urban employment centers, in direct contact between the authority and the association). 57% of the women are employed in part time job. The persistence rate is 89% - encompassing the percentage of participants who remained in one (1) workplace for at least six (6) months.

The program "Employment for Wellbeing" which aims to help with economical-occupational rehabilitation of families had been developed by the Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs and Social Services, together with the “Be-Atzmi” NGO, which has won the tender for its operation since 2010. The program is designed for families in which at least one (1) of the spouses has been unemployed over the last six (6) months or is under-employed. Presently it operates at 20 local authorities as part of the current tender. Additionally the program operates at two (2) urban employment centers, in cooperation with "Be-Atzmi".

Approximately 25 families in each of the groups are granted the guidance of an occupational social worker, who works in collaboration with the family's social worker and the staff at the Department of Social Services. The participants benefit from individual and intensive group assistance for duration of 6-18 months. The guiding includes workshops for acquiring tools and skills for integrating into the labor

market, as well as managing the family budget. Additionally, a flexible services' package is available to each family, for assisting in financing employment-supporting solutions, such as: professional training, required professional equipment, arranging care for the children, etc.

As of November, 2016, out of the 420 participants in 20 different towns in the program during that year, the rate of integration in work stands at 70%.

Question 24

State Attorney's Office Guideline – "*Prosecution Policy in Cases of Failing to Comply a Judicial Order For Granting a Gett*"

On 10 November 2016, the State Attorney's Office issued State Attorney's Guideline No. 2.24 which regulates the prosecution and punishment policy in respect of failure to comply with a judicial order of the Rabbinical Court regarding granting or receiving a divorce. Though the Rabbinical Court does not have the authority to dissolve the marriage, and can only recommend granting a divorce. In rare circumstances, and in accordance with the Jewish Law ("Halacha"), the Court can apply sanctions on spouse who refused to grant divorce (also known as, 'Gett'). The Court has the option to issue an order requiring divorce ('*Obliging Gett*') and to apply indirect sanctions which will make the life of the spouse who refuses to grant a divorce harder. If the spouse violates the Court's order and still refuses to grant a divorce, the Court has the option to issue an order compelling divorce by applying direct sanctions on the husband ('*Compelling Gett*'), including civil imprisonment.

The State Attorney Guideline applies when the spouse violates the Rabbinical Court *Obliging Gett* Order and the Court thus may issue a *Compelling Divorce* Order; in such situation, the Prosecution should consider to indict the spouse who refuses to grant a divorce, on charges of violation of lawful order in accordance with Section 287(b) of the *Penal Law*. Initiating criminal procedures against the spouse who refuses to grant divorce, serve three (3) purposes: labeling the spouse, who refuses to grant divorce, as a criminal offender who harms public interests and values; ensuring justice is made with the perpetrator and achieving the objectives of criminal punishment in terms of retribution and deterrence, due to harm caused to the woman,

and because the damaged the governmental authority that issued the order; and the general deterrence of men who may potentially refuse to grant a divorce, thereby reducing the number of women who are "Agunot" (women whose husbands refuse to grant them a divorce).

In order for the divorce to be valid not be considered "*forced divorce*" according to the Jewish Law and therefore invalid, initiating an investigation and indicting the spouse who refuses to grant a divorce, is conditioned upon three (3) cumulative conditions: (1) The Rabbinical Court issued *Compelling Divorce* Order; (2) 60 days have passed since the issuing of the compelling divorce order and still the divorce has not been granted; (3) the Prosecution has held a consultation with the legal advisor of the Rabbinical Courts prior to initiating criminal procedures, in order to prevent "forced divorce". As for the circumstances that should be considered in the decision whether or not to indict, the Prosecution will consider, *inter alia*: the extent of time that the spouse refuses to grant the Gett, the implications and damages caused to the other spouse due to the refusal.

In addition, the Prosecution will consider indicting third parties that are involved in the encouragement of refusal, aiding, or solicitation, under the approval of the District Attorney.

If the spouse who refuses to give a Gett continues to refuse even after a criminal procedure was initiated, the Prosecution should consider indicting the refuser again with the relevant aggravating circumstances: the extent of time of the refusal, indications that it is done for revenge or exploitation, the existence of additional offences that complement the Gett refusal.

Once an investigation was initiated, the Prosecution is instructed to ask for a stay of exit order, to prevent the suspect from escaping abroad.

Furthermore, the Guideline instruct the Prosecution, that if a person is convicted in an offence of violation of lawful order in accordance with the *Penal Law*, the Prosecution should ask the Court to sentence the refuser to a substantial imprisonment period.

Due to the high sensitivity and complexity of this issue, each District Attorney is instructed to appoint a designated attorney that would handle these cases with expertise in this field.