



STATE OF ISRAEL

Ministry of Justice

Annex No. II - Attached to the

17¹⁹th Periodic Report by the State of Israel before

The Committee on Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination

Concerning the

IMPLEMENTATION OF

**THE CONVENTION ON THE ELIMINATION OF ALL FORMS OF
RACIAL DISCRIMINATION**

Compiled by the Legal Counseling and Legislation Department (International Law),

Ministry of Justice

2017

Table of Contents

Part I - Case Law	3
Part II – Plans and Projects to Promote Understanding, Tolerance and Friendship among Nations	26
Part III – Additional Information on Government Resolutions.....	53

Part I - Case Law

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 2(B)(1)(II)

1. On March 2015, the High Court of Justice issued a ruling regarding the alleged ethnic profiling at security inspections at Israeli airports. In this case, the Association for Civil Rights in Israel (ACRI) petitioned against various security inspections that were conducted at Israeli airports based on ethnic origin. In its decision, the Court noted that while deliberating this case, it was informed by the respondents that as early as 2006, the Israeli Security Agency (ISA) together with the Israeli Airport Authority (IAA) began a wide internal examination regarding its security inspection method, with the aim of implementing changes that will eliminate any differences in these security inspections for all Israeli citizens. The Court thus allowed several extensions in order to examine and implement solutions to this matter. In 2014, the Court was informed that in March 2014, following several delays, the new security inspection system became operational. The respondents asked the Court to reject this petition since it is no longer applicable. The respondents further claimed that the Court should now allow a time period for examination of this new system on all passengers and airports in Israel, and noted they are committed to finding further technological solutions to reduce the harm caused by security inspections at airports. After an additional hearing on the matter, the Court rejected this petition. However, in light of the petitioner's contribution to the promotion of these important changes, the Court ruled on 30,000 NIS (7,500 USD) for petitioner's expenses (H.C.J. 4797/07 *The Association for Civil Rights Israel v. Israeli Airport Authority et. al.* (10.3.15)).

2. Further, on September 21, 2015, the Rishon-Le'Zion Magistrate Court ruled on two civil suits against Israil Airlines and Tourism (Defendant 1) and the IAA (Defendant 2) for demanding five Arab persons who were already sitting on a plane on a domestic flight from Eilat to Tel-Aviv, prior to take-off, to disembark the plane for security reasons. This demand was motivated by Defendant 1's desire to permit a Jewish passenger who was not on the passenger list to board. The plaintiffs based their suit, *inter alia*, on the *Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty*, the *Prohibition of Discrimination in Products, Services and in Entry into Places of Entertainment*

and *Public Places Law* 5761-2000, etc. The Court noted that both respondents failed to clarify the situation, both blamed each other while neglecting to question witnesses or submit any documents, and referred to security guidelines without presenting them.

The Court ruled that the plaintiffs were able to prove prohibited discrimination against them by the two respondents. The Court further noted that the actions of both respondents were contrary to the principle of equality which is anchored in the Israeli legal system as a basic constitutional right – a right that is protected by the *Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty* and recognized by previous court rulings. The Court stated that both respondents violated the *Prohibition of Discrimination in Products, Services and in Entry into Places of Entertainment and Public Places Law*, for discriminating against the plaintiffs based on their ethnic origin and disguising it as security considerations. The Court also noted that the respondents violated a *statutory duty* (Section 63 of *Torts Ordinance [New Version]* 5728-1968), by not respecting the constitutional right to equality in providing a public service, degrading the plaintiffs and violating their human dignity, contrary to the *Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty*. The Court determined that the respondents also violated the "duty of care" toward the plaintiffs in accordance with the *Tort Ordinance*. Defendant 1 was also found responsible for violating the principle of good faith while implementing a contract towards the plaintiffs (Section 39 of the *Contracts (General Part) Law* 5733-1973). In light of the above, the Court determined that the plaintiffs experienced a prohibited and humiliating experience, although they eventually boarded the flight so no actual harm was caused to them. Nonetheless, the Court granted compensation in the amount of 25,000 NIS (6,460 USD) to plaintiff No. 1 and 20,000 NIS (5,170 USD) to each of the other four plaintiffs. (*Rishon-Le'Zion Magistrate Court, C.s. 1230-07-13, Ayoub Abu-Sabit et. al. v. Israil Airlines and Tourism et. al.* (21.9.15)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 2(B)(3)(II) – (Translation into Arabic of planning documents filed under the *Planning and Building Law*)

3. An appeal was filed in the Supreme Court¹ in relation to the ruling of the Administrative Court, which rejected a petition requesting that the State be required to translate the documents of a plan concerning the establishment of a national park in Jerusalem, thus ensuring the ability of Arab residents to exercise their right to object to the plan. The notice on the submission of the plan had been published in both Hebrew and Arabic; however, the petitioners were not satisfied with this, and requested that all of the plan's documents be translated into Arabic.

On May 12, 2014, the Supreme Court ruled that the parties are required to submit a notice regarding "a proper arrangement that would take into account the practical needs of the citizens and residents who speak the Arabic language". The Court noted as an example that a practical solution would allow citizens and residents who speak Arabic to study, in a general manner, the contents of submitted city zoning plans, for example, by posting plan briefings on Internet websites.

In accordance with the State Attorney's Office's notice dated October 25, 2015, the outline that had been formulated in response to the Court's ruling, determines that the introduction of each plan would contain comprehensible explanatory notes containing the purpose of the plan, and shall enable a review of its main provisions. The translation requirement would apply only to plans covering an area exceeding 200 dunams within a local planning area, in which the Arabic-speaking population constitutes a minimum of 10% of the general population. In addition, the outline sets forth that various auxiliary documents would be posted on the Planning Authority's website, such as: "A permanent document translated into Arabic of the land designations' list and the color set for such", as well as a document of the "permanent parts of the plan's provisions [...] translated into Arabic, in which the headings and permanent fields appearing in the plans' provisions would be translated". On October 26, 2015, the Supreme Court approved the agreement reached between the parties. (Ad.P.A 758/13, *The Jerusalem Center of Human Rights et. al. v. The Jerusalem Planning and Building Committee* (26.10.15)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 2(B)(4)(II)

¹ Administrative Petition Appeal 758/13, *The Jerusalem Centre of Human Rights et. al. v. the Jerusalem Planning and Building Committee*.

3. On March 20, 2016, The Nazareth Labor Court ruled in favor of a Druze plaintiff who was employed as a sales and marketing representative at the "Shekem Electric" company, owned by the defendant. The plaintiff, who was fired by the defendant, claimed that his dismissal was based on racial discrimination. He noted, *inter alia*, that he suffered from racial remarks from the customers and from his manager. The company claimed the plaintiff was dismissed due to a grave disciplinary offense, and that the company was not aware of his ethnic origin. The company further denied the plaintiff's allegations regarding the nationalistic remarks and claimed that he never complained about this issue. The Court determined that the plaintiff was fired for racial reasons, contrary to Section 2 of *Equal Employment Opportunities Law* 5748-1988. The Court awarded the plaintiff compensation in the amount of 54,804 NIS (14,442 USD), and lawyer fees in the amount of 10,800 NIS (2,850 USD). (L.D. 16211-11-14, (*Nazareth Labor Court*) *Mansur Mansur v. Electra Consumer Products Ltd.* (20.03.2016)).

4. On January 24, 2016, the Haifa Regional Labor Court ruled in favor of an Israeli woman of Ethiopian origin who claimed that she was discriminated for her ethnic origin in violation of the *Equal Employment Opportunities Law*. The plaintiff worked at a company that provides human resources for cleaning services, and which also provided such services to the respondent company. According to the suit, in June 2013, both the plaintiff and her manager arrived at the respondent company's premises in order to show the plaintiff her new workplace. During the tour, they met with the wife of one of the respondent company's owners, who upon seeing the plaintiff, immediately and unequivocally noted out loud to the plaintiff's manager that she is unwilling to receive an Ethiopian employee. The owner's wife repeated this reluctance in two phone calls with the plaintiff's director general, in which she noted that "these persons" are not clean. These calls were recorded and presented to the Court. After hearing both sides, the Court noted that Section 2 to the *Equal Employment Opportunities Law* prohibits discrimination for reason of ethnic origin while hiring an employee. The Court noted that in this case it was proven that the refusal to hire the plaintiff was made due to her ethnic origin, without examination of her working skills, which amounts to discrimination of her ethnic origin. Due to the severity of this case, the Court granted compensation in the

amount of 50,000 NIS (12,800 USD) in favor of the plaintiff (Em.D. 37213-08-13 *Ta'aya Trappa v. Deree Air-Conditioning LTD* (24.1.16)).

5. On November 10, 2011, the Tel-Aviv-Jaffa Magistrate Court accepted a suit filed by a man claiming he was refused entry into a nightclub in Tel-Aviv due to his skin color. The Court determined that the club violated the *Prohibition of Discrimination in Products, Services and Entry into Places of Entertainment and Public Places Law*, since no rational reason regarding the refusal of entrance was given. Moreover, the respondents failed to prove that their business policy does not constitute practice of costumer discrimination on the grounds of race and/or origin, as prohibited by the Law. The Court stated that according to the Law, the club's owners are liable for the violation, since they did not prove they have taken reasonable steps to prevent discriminatory behavior at their place of business. The Court awarded the plaintiff compensation of 17,000 NIS (4,500 USD) (*C.M. 969-03-11 Jacob Horesh v. Tesha Bakikar LTD* (10.11.11)).
6. On September 23, 2011, the Hadera Magistrate Court accepted a suit filed by two men who claimed they were refused entry into a nightclub due to their skin color. The Court determined that the fact that the plaintiffs were prevented from entering the club, while their fair-skinned friend entered without delay, establishes the presumption of discrimination as set by the Law. The Court further stated that the respondents did not succeed in rebutting this presumption, yet their general entry policy was not questioned in the plaintiffs' claims. Therefore, the Court ruled that the plaintiffs are entitled to a compensation of 15,000 NIS each (4,050 USD) (*C.C 46945-05-10 Ziv Sayag et. al. v. Key Entrepreneurship Art of Recreation and Leisure LTD et. al.* (23.9.11)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 4(A)(III) and 4(D)

7. Israel has made a concerted effort to improve law enforcement in the West Bank and to put a stop to “price-tag” offences in the West Bank. Unfortunately, the recent deterioration in the security situation has resulted in a volatile environment that has contributed to the increase of ideologically-based offences within Israel. Both Jews and Arabs have been the victims of these despicable offences. One of the most egregious examples was the kidnapping and murder of a sixteen-year-old

Palestinian, Muhammed Abu Khdeir as “revenge” for the abduction and murder of three Israeli teenagers by Hamas terrorists in June 2014. Following an intensive investigation of Abu Khdeir's murder by the Police, the State filed an indictment in the Jerusalem District Court against three Israelis, two of whom were minors. On November 30, 2015, the Court convicted both minor defendants of the murder of Abu Khdeir. On February 4, 2016, the Court sentenced Defendant No. 2 (minor) to **life imprisonment**, an additional three years imprisonment to be served concurrently, and ordered him to pay compensation of 5,000 NIS (1,300 USD) to the family of another boy the three tried to kidnap and compensation of 30,000 NIS (7,800 USD) to Abu Khdeir's family. In addition the Court sentenced Defendant No. 3 (minor) to **21 years imprisonment**, one year suspended imprisonment and was ordered to pay compensation of 30,000 NIS (7,800 USD) to Abu Khdeir's family. On April 19, 2016, after reviewing psychiatric expert opinions provided by both sides, the Court ruled that defendant No. 1 was responsible for his actions. The Court therefore noted that defendant No. 1, Yosef Haim Ben David, was the initiator of these acts and convicted him for Abu Khdeir's murder, in addition to offences of kidnapping for the purpose of murder, assault causing grave bodily harm and attempted arson. On May 3, 2016, the Court sentenced Ben David to **life imprisonment, and an additional 20 years imprisonment to be served concurrently**. Ben David was also ordered to pay compensation of 20,000 NIS (5,260 USD) to the family of another boy the three had tried to kidnap and compensation of 150,000 NIS (39,500 USD) to Abu Khdeir's family. (*The Jerusalem District Court, S.Cr.C. 34700-07-14, The State of Israel v. Yossef Haim Ben David* (19.4.2016)).

8. On January 3, 2016, the Central District Attorney's Office filed an indictment with the Central District's Court, against two defendants: Amiran Ben-Uliel (Defendant No. 1), aged 21 and a minor (Defendant No. 2), aged 17. Amiran Ben-Uliel was indicted for three counts of murder - the murder of three members of the Dawabshe family (parents Sa'ed and Riham and Ali-Sa'ed, aged 18 months) in the village of Duma, the attempted murder of an additional family member (Ahmad Dawabshe, aged 4) and additional offences of attempted murder and arson committed with a racist motive. Defendant No. 2 was indicted for conspiracy to commit murder with a racist motive, malicious damage with a racist motive and additional offences,

including the arson of the Dormition Abbey. According to this indictment, following the murder of Malachi Rosenfeld by Palestinians in June 2015, both defendants conspired to take their revenge against Arabs and kill people. Defendant No. 1, made the necessary preparations, including the preparation of a bag with two bottles filled with flammable liquid, a lighter, a matchbox, gloves and black spray paint. On the relevant day he then went to meet defendant No. 2 in a specific location. However, since defendant No. 2 was not there, he decided to continue on his own. According to the indictment, defendant No. 1 tied a shirt around his head and donned his gloves; he then looked for indications of an inhabited house, sprayed "revenge" and "long live the messiah" on the house and threw an incendiary device into the house with the intent of killing its residents. This house was empty. Defendant No. 1 then immediately turned to the home of Sa'ed and Riham Dawabshe, carrying the second incendiary device. After unsuccessful attempts to open two windows, he managed to open the window of the bedroom in which the family was sleeping. Defendant No.1 then lit the incendiary device, threw it through the window and escaped, killing three family members and causing severe burns to Ahmad Dawabshe, aged 4. (*S.Cr.C. 932-01-16 The State of Israel v. Amiran Ben-Uliel et. al.* (The defendants are yet to be sentenced)).

9. On January 3, 2016, an additional indictment was filed against Yinon Reuveny, aged 20, and a 17 year old minor, for involvement in other terrorist incidents. (*Cr.C. 893-01-16 The State of Israel v. Anonymous et. al.* (The defendants are yet to be sentenced)).

Note that all four defendants in the cases mentioned in paragraphs no. 8 and 9 above were also indicted for membership in a terrorist organization. These two indictments are the outcome of a thorough investigation conducted by the ISA and the Israeli Police (Judea and Samaria District). The filing of the indictments was approved by the Attorney General and the State Attorney.

10. On August 28, 2015, an indictment was filed in the Jerusalem District Court (*Cr.C. 55372-08-15*) against two defendants (Avraham Gafni (Defendant No. 1) and a minor (Defendant No. 2)). According to the indictment, prior to August 13, 2015, the defendants and a third person, motivated by racism, animosity and hostility, conspired to spray paint racial/ethnic slurs next to encampments belonging to Arabs

residing on Route No. 458. According to the indictment, the three acquired spray-paint and the means for committing arson. On August 13, 2015, at around 02:00, they drove to an encampment belonging to Mustafa Ka'abaneh, and spray painted the word "revenge" on a nearby rock. After being discovered, the three returned to their car and drove away. Later that night, at around 03:00 they drove to an encampment belonging to Youssef Ka'abaneh, where they sprayed the words "revenge" and "administrative" on the path, with the aim of terrifying the residents and others. The defendants and the third person set fire to the encampment and drove away. As a result, the tent and its content were completely destroyed. The defendants were indicted for arson, conspiracy to commit a crime with a racial motive, threat, and obstruction of justice.

11. In July 2015, an indictment was filed in the Nazareth District Court (Cr.C.57576-07-15) against two defendants (Yinon Reuveni (Defendant No. 1) and Yehuda Asraf (Defendant No. 2)). According to the indictment, prior to June 17, 2015, Defendant No. 1 conspired with other persons, whose identity is unknown (hereinafter: "the others"), to set fire to the Church of the Multiplication of the Loaves and Fish in Nahum Village in order to harm sanctities of the Christian faith. Defendant No. 1 was charged with arson under aggravated circumstances, defacing real estate with a motive of hostility against the public, conspiracy for committing a crime, conspiracy for committing other offences, using a car in the commission of a crime, obstructing a police officer, and violation of a legal order. Defendant No. 2 was charged with providing means for the commission of a crime and conspiracy to commit other offences. On August 17, 2015, Defendant No. 1 was detained until the end of the proceedings against him.

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(B) (Amendments to the Prevention of Infiltration Law (Offenses and Jurisdiction) 5714-1954)

12. On September 16, 2013, the High Court of Justice ruled on a petition filed by several NGOs, regarding the constitutionality of Amendment No. 3 to the *Prevention of Infiltration Law (Offenses and Jurisdiction) 5714-1954*. The Amendment, which had entered into force in January 2012 as a temporary provision (for a period of three years until January 2015), had altered Section 30A of the Law,

such that a person who entered Israel illegally could have been held in detention for a period of up to three years, subject to certain exceptions. An extended panel of nine judges ruled that holding persons for such a long period of time constitutes a material violation of their rights, including liberty and dignity, as enshrined in the *Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty*. The Court determined that this violation does not meet the proportionality criteria contained within the limitation clause of the Basic Law, and therefore the amendment was held unconstitutional. The Court annulled Section 30A of the Law. Furthermore, the State was given 90 days to examine the possibility of releasing the 1,750 people held in detention pursuant to this section, on the basis of Section 13F of the *Entry into Israel Law* 5712 – 1952, which was deemed applicable to the situation (*H.C.J. 7146/12 Naget Serg Adam et. al. v. The Knesset et. al.*(16.9.13).

On December 10, 2013, the Knesset approved Amendment No. 4 to the *Prevention of Infiltration Law*, which was drafted, *inter alia*, following the above mentioned High Court of Justice's ruling. Amendment No. 4 was scheduled to be valid for a period of three years and was scheduled to expire on December 9, 2016.

Amendment No. 4 to the *Prevention of Infiltration Law* included two key changes: (a) It stipulated that a person who enters Israel illegally could have been held in detention for a period of up to one year, subject to certain exceptions. This section applies only to persons who entered Israel illegally after its enactment, as of December 10, 2013; (b) The establishment of "Holot" facility for persons who entered Israel illegally and were already in Israel when the new Section 30A came into existence. According to Amendment No. 4, the Border Control Commissioner is authorized to place such persons in the "Holot" facility; from which they are allowed to exit during the daytime; however they have a duty to report to the facility three times a day. Persons in the "Holot" facility are provided with adequate needs including health care and welfare.

On December 15, 2013 several NGOs and asylum seekers filed a petition to the High Court of Justice against the constitutionality of Amendment No. 4.

On September 22, 2014, an extended panel of nine judges of the High Court of Justice ruled in this further petition. A majority of six judges ruled that holding

persons for up to a year in detention constituted a material violation of their rights, including liberty and dignity, as enshrined in the *Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty*. The Court determined that this violation did not meet the proportionality criteria contained in the Basic Law, and was therefore unconstitutional. Consequently, the Court annulled Section 30A of the Amended Law, and ruled that the *Entry into Israel Law*, applies instead.

Furthermore, the Court, by a majority decision of seven judges, annulled Chapter 4 of the Amendment, which established the new "Holot" facility, and stated that it violates the rights enshrined in the *Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty* in a manner that does not meet the proportionality criteria contained in the Basic Law, and was therefore unconstitutional. This annulment is scheduled to take effect in 90 days. The duty to report to the facility every day at noon was also annulled with effect on September 24, 2014, since it violates the rights enshrined in the *Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty* in a manner that does not meet the proportionality criteria contained in the Basic Law, and was therefore unconstitutional (H.C.J. 8425/13 *Gabrislasy et. al. v. The Knesset et. al.* (22.9.14)).

On December 17, 2014 Amendment No. 5 to the *Prevention of Infiltration Law* entered into force. The Amendment includes three key changes: (a) it stipulates that a person who enters Israel illegally may be held in detention for a period of up to three months. This section applies only to persons who entered Israel illegally after its enactment, as of December 17, 2014; (b) the maximum period a person can be placed in "Holot" facility is 20 months. Persons placed in "Holot" need to report to the facility at night; the facility is closed at night (10.00 p.m.) and opens in the morning (6.00 a.m.). According to the Amendment, the Border Control Commissioner shall not order the placement of the following in "Holot" facility: a woman, a minor, a person above the age of 60, a parent who is responsible for a minor, a victim of a trafficking in persons offence and a person that the Border Control Commissioner is convinced that his/her placement in the "Holot" facility may damage his/her health due to his/her age, state of health including mental health, and there is no way to prevent such damage. The Amendment also includes initiated judicial review for disciplinary measures taken in cases of transferring a

person to detention; (c) Indirect amendments to the *Foreign Workers Law* 5761-1991 and the *Employment of Workers by Labor Contractors Law* 5766-1996.

On December 18, 2014 a petition filed by several NGOs, regarding the constitutionality of Amendment No. 5 was submitted to the High Court of Justice. On August 11, 2015, the Court with an extended panel of nine judges unanimously rejected most of the petition and ruled that this amendment is constitutional. The Court, in a majority opinion further ruled that the provision ordering a person who entered Israel illegally to reside in open facility is also constitutional, except for the provisions that set the holding period in the "Holot" facility for twenty months. The Court found that a period of 20 months is too long and therefore concluded that it was not proportionate. The Court gave the Knesset six months to Amend the in this regard. After annulling the 20 months period, the court had set twelve months period as the maximum time period until the next amendment on this issue. (H.C.J. 8665/14 *Assaf Aid Organization for Refugees and Asylum Seekers in Israel et. al. v. The Knesset et. al.* (11.8.15)).

On February 8, 2016, the Knesset enacted the *Prevention of Infiltration Law (Offenses and Jurisdiction) (provisional order)* 5776-2016, according to which, a person who enters Israel illegally who cannot be repatriated may be required to reside in the, "Holot" facility, for up to a maximum period of 12 months. This law also instructs that previous stay orders that were given for periods of more than 12 months will be reduced to 12 months period.

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(C)(1) (Electoral Threshold for Political Parties)

13. Two petitions were filed to the High Court of Justice against Amendment no. 62 to the *Knesset Elections Law* that raised the electoral threshold for political parties to be elected into the Knesset from 2% to 3.25%. The Court was requested to determine that such an amendment is unconstitutional and may lead to the exclusion of minority groups, particularly the Arab population, from the Knesset. The petitioners argued that the possibility that the Arab parties may form a unified list does not mitigate the harm caused, since it is wrong to force such a step upon the Arab parties due to the ideological differences between them, just as it is wrong to

do so in regard to other parties. The Court stated, *inter alia*, that representation of minority groups in the Knesset is of high importance, although the question which of the many minority groups is entitled to be represented in the Knesset, as a matter of constitutional obligation, is a complex one. However, the Court noted that certain minorities have been recognized by the Court as having a special status in Israel. One of these is the Arab population due, among other things, to its size and to the complex relations between this population and the Jewish majority in Israel. However, the Court decided to reject the petition stating, *inter alia*, that the petitioners were not able to demonstrate any harm caused to the rate of representation of minority groups, including the Arab population, since it was too early to predict the political outcome of the amendment to the electoral threshold. The Court further noted that at the time of the petition, the Arab parties had already decided to form a unified list, a step that according to the Court may negate any harm to the rate of representation of the Arab population. Please note that the outcome of the last Knesset elections indicate that the representation of the Arab population increased to 13 Knesset seats, the highest number of seats for this population until now.

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(C)(1) (Political Expression of Knesset Members):

14. In July 2014, two Arab police officers filed a complaint against MK Zoabi, according to which, during extensions to arrest hearings of Israeli-Arabs suspected of disturbance to public order arrested during demonstrations against operation "Protective Edge" at the Nazareth District Court, MK Zoabi verbally assaulted them and *inter alia*, said that "they should be used to wipe the floor with" and that "their face should be spit on". Subsequently, the Attorney General decided to open criminal investigation against MK Zoabi for suspicion of incitement to violence and insulting a public servant. The Attorney General's position was that in these circumstances, when these statements were directed at police officers due to the fact that they were Arab, it raises real suspicion of committing criminal offenses of incitement to violence and insulting a public servant. In February 2016, the Nazareth Magistrate Court sentenced MK Zoabi as part of a plea bargain and in accordance to her own admission to six months suspended imprisonment and 3,000

NIS (770 USD) for insulting a public servant. According to the indictment, the MK insulted the officers who carried out their duties, degraded them, and made them feel threatened. According to the plea bargain, MK Zoabi will submit an apology letter to the prosecution and the offence of incitement to violence will be stricken off the indictment. The Court noted, *inter alia*, that MK Zoabi's words were not a slip of the tongue or a single sentence but rather a type of speech that was carried out in front of a large audience, containing harsh and hurtful words towards the officers who were present at the scene (Nazareth Magistrate Court, Cr.C. 12957-01-16, *The State of Israel v. Hanin Zoabi* (7.2.16)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(D)(2)

15. On December 26, 2011, MK Sa'id Naffaa was indicted for illegal travel abroad to an enemy state, aiding approximately 280 persons in illegal travel abroad to an enemy state, and two counts of contact with a foreign agent. This indictment followed MK Naffaa's trip to Syria in September 2007, despite a refusal of the Minister of Interior to approve his trip. During his travel to Syria, MK Naffaa knowingly met twice with a foreign agent without a reasonable explanation. On January 26, 2010, following a long debate, the Knesset Committee decided to revoke MK Naffaa's parliamentary immunity. MK Naffaa claimed that the immunity provided to Knesset members applies to his case since he discussed political issues and not security issues with the persons he met.

On April 6, 2014 the Nazareth District Court convicted the then-former MK Naffaa (Mr. Naffaa was not re-elected to Israel's 19th Knesset in 2013) of one count of contact with a foreign agent and one count of travel abroad to an enemy state. In addition, the Court convicted the former MK of having aided the illegal travel to an enemy state. The Court, however, acquitted him of an additional count of contact with a foreign agent, stating such contact had not been proven beyond a reasonable doubt. The Court stated that the former MK had failed to provide a reasonable explanation for his contact with foreign agent, as required under Section 114(b) of Israel's *Penal Law* 5737-1977. On September 4, 2014, the Court sentenced former MK Naffaa to one year imprisonment and six months suspended imprisonment for a period of three years (*S.Cr.C. 47188/12/11 The State of Israel v. Sa'id Naffaa* (6.4.2014)).

Following this sentence, MK Sa'id Naffaa filed an appeal, claiming, *inter alia*, for parliamentary immunity and that his actions did not harm the State's security. The Court rejected the appeal, stating among other things, that by his actions the appellant harmed the State's security to a degree that justifies severe measures against him. The Court also rejected the appellant claims for inequality of law enforcement against him, and noted that the examples brought by the appellant in this regard were substantially different in their severity (Supreme Court Cr.A. 6833/14. *Sa'id Naffaa v. The State of Israel* (31.8.15)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(D)(3) (Eastern Neighborhoods of Jerusalem)

16. In the first case, the Court held that the Minister of Interior should differentiate between the criteria for the expiration of permanent residency and the criteria for regaining permanent residency. While it is within the authority of the Minister to revoke a permanent residency once a foreign citizenship has been acquired, when a person files a request for recovering a permanent residency, different criteria should be considered - for example: the reason that this person acquired a new foreign citizenship, whether that person has an affinity to Israel, how long he/she has been out of the country, etc. The Court held that the mere fact that a person holds a foreign citizenship does not automatically negate his/her right to reacquire the permanent residency. In this case, though the petitioner had been living in Belgium for almost nine years and holds a Belgian passport, in light of his affinity to Israel and the special circumstances of the case, the Court decided to return his residency (*AD.P 19473-10-13 Nabulsi v. The State of Israel*).
17. In a second case, the Court for Administrative Affairs ruled that the Ministry of Interior (MOI) should resume the permanent residency status of the petitioner, since there was no substantive ground before the Minister to revoke the residency. The Court stressed that if a permanent residency has been given after a careful examination by the Authority in the past, then in order to revoke it later, a higher threshold should be met (*AD.P 6146-03-13 Abu-Koba et. al. v. The Minister of Interior*).

18. In another case rendered by the Court for Administrative Affairs, the Court denied the petition since the circumstances of the case had shown that the petitioner emigrated out of the State with the intention to make the USA his primary residence, and not for a particular goal of studying abroad. Thus, the petitioner failed to prove any affinity to Israel, as required for permanent residency (*AD.P 1627/09 Abed Elal v. The Population and Immigration Authority*).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(D)(4) (Same-Sex Marriages)

19. On April 19, 2016, the Jerusalem District Court convicted Yishay Shlissel of murder, six counts of attempted murder, and injury under aggravated circumstances. Shlissel was indicted for stabbing seven people at the gay pride parade held in Jerusalem in July 2015. The judges noted that Shlissel's actions were proven beyond reasonable doubt and were conducted with premeditated intent. On June 26, 2016, Shlissel was sentenced to life imprisonment for the murder offence, 30 years imprisonment for six attempted murder offences, one year imprisonment for violation of his conditional release, and compensation in the sum of 2.064 Million NIS (543,150 USD) (*S.Cr.C. 44539-08-15 The State of Israel v. Yishay Shlissel* (19.4.2016)).
20. In 2013, a same-sex female couple filed a request to be registered as parents and to recognize their joint parenting over their son - not by way of adoption, but rather through a judicial parenthood order, without the need of a social services review. The State objected to the expansion of the use in parenting orders to same-sex couples and stated that these order are to be used solely in adoption procedures. During the trial, the State retracted its objection but still demanded the involvement of social services in this process as a condition for the issuance of a parenting order. In the scope of this procedure, an opinion of the Attorney General was presented, in which he stated, *inter alia*, that although the preferred way or means in such cases is by use of an adoption order, the State does not object to the use of a judicial parenthood order. After deliberations, the Court issued the judicial parenthood order and noted that there is no need for social services review (*Tel Aviv-Jaffa Family Matters Court, F.C. 57740/12/13 Anonymous et. al v. The Attorney General et. al.* (1.3.15)).

21. In 2012, the Jerusalem Magistrate Court ruled in favor of a lesbian couple, which sued the Yad HaShmona Guest House for its refusal to provide venue for the couple's nuptial party. The guest house stated the couple's sexual orientation as grounds for its refusal and claimed that Yad HaShmona, the owner of the guest house, is a locality of Messianic Jews, which regard homosexual relationships as contradicting their religious beliefs. The Court held that the guest house meets the definition of "public place" under the *Prohibition of Discrimination in Products, Services and Entry to Public Places Law*. Therefore, the owners are prohibited from refusing to hold an event on grounds of sexual orientation. The Court addressed the balance between religious freedom and the prohibition of discrimination and rejected the defendants claim that this instance may be construed as an exception under Section 3(d)1 to the Law, which states that religious discrimination is permissible "where it is required by the character or nature of the... public place". The Court ruled that this exception should be interpreted carefully so as to allow discrimination only in limited situations, such as in public places of worship. The Court ruled that the appellants will be compensated with 30,000 NIS each (7,500 USD) that will serve both for restitution and for education and awareness raising to human dignity and equality (*C.C. 5901-09, Yaacobovitch et. al. v. Yad Hashmona Guest House and Banquet Garden et. al.* (3.9.12)). On June 17, 2014 the Jerusalem District Court rejected an appeal filed by Yad HaShmona. The Court stressed that the principle of equality was a fundamental principle of Israel's legal system and that the fact that the appellants did not allow a gay couple to get married in their facility is discriminatory, as it could lead to humiliation and can undermine human dignity (*C.A 5116-11-12 Yad HaShmona Guest House and Banquet Garden v. Yaacobovitch et. al.* (17.6. 14)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(D)(6) (Civil Burial)

22. On September 4, 2014, the Kfar Saba Magistrates Court issued its decision in two cases in which spouses of two deceased persons who wished to be buried in civil burial had to pay high burial fees, since no civil cemeteries were to be found in their place of residence. The Court noted, *inter alia*, that the State did not fulfill its legal obligation and was negligent, as no sufficient civil burial cemeteries were constructed, the civil burial cemeteries that were constructed are not in reasonable

distance from one another and no regional civil cemeteries are to be found. The Court also determined that the Ministry for Religious Services did not disseminated information regarding civil burial options to the public and ordered the Ministry to reimburse the plaintiffs (C.C. 29907-12-12, *Tzvi Ginsburg et. al. v. The Ministry of Religious Services* (4.9.14)).

23. On November 24, 2015, the mother of May Peleg, a transgender woman who ordered that her body be cremated after her death, filed an appeal to the Supreme Court, requesting the annulment of the Jerusalem District Court decision to honor this request to transfer Peleg's body for cremation. Note, that in the lower Court proceedings, the Attorney General presented an opinion in which he clarified that Peleg's will is not illegal and does not contradict public policy.

In its decision, the Supreme Court noted that the execution of the deceased's will is of utmost importance and therefore there is a need to examine if the relevant documents truly reflect Peleg's free will. After such an examination, the Court concluded that Peleg's will to be cremated was true and valid. The Court also noted that although Jewish religious law prohibits cremation, Israeli law does not negate a person's liberty to deviate from Jewish religious law in many cases.

The Court further noted that, as was presented before the lower court, according to the opinion of the Attorney General, there is no legal prohibition regarding cremation. The Court expressed its opinion that it would be preferable if this sensitive issue was regularized by legislation, however, in the absence of a law that obligates burial or prohibits cremation, there are no grounds to prevent cremation. Thus, the Court noted that Peleg's will should be respected (*C.Ap. 7918/15 Anonymous v. Gal Friedman et. al.* (24.11.2015)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(D)(6) (Protection of Holy Sites)

24. Please refer to Page 5 above in regard to Cr.C.57576-07-15.

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(D)(7) (Freedom of Opinion and Expression)

25. On February 18, 2016, the Rehovot Magistrate Court convicted a defendant for seditious act, possession of a publication that incites to violence or terror, and possession of racist publication. On March 17, 2016, the defendant was sentenced to 24 months imprisonment. The defendant created, edited, and held a document that contained clear incitement and called upon the commission of acts of violence, causing physical damage or damage to property against Arabs, and contained guidance on how to execute them. In addition, the document included encouragement for the persecution, hostility, violence and strife between the Jewish and Arab populations. This document was meant to be distributed among a Jewish extremist population, and therefore created a real possibility that such acts will be implemented (Cr.C. 675-08-15, *The State of Israel (North District Attorney's Office) v. Moshe Haim Orbach* (17.3.16)).
26. Also, in February 2016, The Jerusalem Magistrate Court convicted a person for three counts of incitement to racism (Section 144B(a) to the *Penal Law* 5737-1977). According to the indictment, from May 2015 until October 2015, the defendant exploited his position by giving religious speeches and lessons to a small audience at Al Aqsa mosque, administering five summer camps for about 80 children between the ages of 5 to 16 since 2008, in which he taught religious lessons including one about martyrs, as well as giving religious lessons to a small audience in Jerusalem. The defendant did so in order to disseminate racial ideas and incite others to commit violent acts against Jews and Israeli security forces. According to the indictment, these speeches and lessons were filmed and later uploaded to an internet website. After examining the defendant's lessons and hearing both sides, the Court convicted the defendant on three counts of incitement to racism. However, after balancing the defendant's words with freedom of speech and freedom of religion, the Court acquitted the defendant from two counts of incitement to violence. The defendant was sentenced to 11 months imprisonment and six months suspended imprisonment for a period of three years from the date of his release (C.C. 29733-11-15 *The State of Israel v. Haled Mougrabi* (14.3.2016)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(E)(1) (Employment - The Equal Employment Opportunities Commission)

27. On March 31st 2016, the Tel Aviv-Jaffa District Labor Court ruled on a lawsuit filed by an Israeli-Arab who was employed as a driver by "Albar", a car rental company, who was then fired. The plaintiff claimed that "Albar" fired him on a discriminatory basis due to his ethnic origin and place of residence. The company claimed that the justification for the plaintiff's dismissal was workforce reduction. The plaintiff claimed that due to the behavior of the respondent towards him, he is entitled to compensations based on unjustified dismissal for racial reasons, intentional publication of slander, privacy violation, and based on the failure to conduct a hearing in accordance with the law. The Court ruled that the company did not reach the necessary burden of proof in order to prove that the plaintiff's dismissal did not involve any prohibited discrimination. When considering the compensation, the Court noted, *inter alia*, that the level of humiliation experienced by the plaintiff was high, although he was considered by the respondent's representatives to have been an excellent employee. The Court also noted that according to Section 10(a) (1) *Equal Employment Opportunities Law*, compensation may be awarded even if no damage was proven. In this case, the Court ruled compensations of 80,000 NIS (21,000 USD) and 16,000 NIS (4,200 USD) legal expenses (*Tel-Aviv District Labor Court 40543-03-14 Ihab Nofel v. Albar Car Fleet Ltd.* (31.03.2016)).
28. In another case, on October 23, 2012, the Tel Aviv-Jaffa Regional Labor Court ruled on a claim of a young Israeli citizen of Ethiopian origin alleging he was discriminated against due to his ethnic origin in violation of the *Equal Employment Opportunities Law*. The plaintiff sought work at a private firm (A.A. Moked 101 LTD), however, when he arrived to the job interview, the manager did not interview the plaintiff, and explained that there was no current need for additional employees. The plaintiff asked his friends to apply for the same job, all of whom were summoned for interviews, and after several days, one of his friends was hired. The Court ruled that the plaintiff experienced discriminatory behavior due to the facts that he had the relevant qualifications for the position, he came to the job interview which was arranged in advance by a phone call in which he was not rejected by the manager, the other applicants who were not of Ethiopian origin received different and preferential treatment, and due to the changes in the respondent's versions regarding the reason that the plaintiff was not interviewed. The Court decided that the respondent demonstrated an attitude of indifference and contempt in regards to

the feeling of discrimination that could have also been experienced by any other reasonable candidate of the plaintiff's origin, a feeling that might have been prevented if the respondent had acted differently (such as scheduling another interview, or interviewing the plaintiff in order to enter him into its database for other relevant positions, etc.). The Court stated that this behavior by the respondent gave rise to the existence of discriminatory behavior. The Court added that the respondent's indifference not only demonstrated the existence of discrimination, but also indicated aggravated circumstances in causing the discriminating result. The Court noted that discrimination against the Ethiopian population required utilizing a strong policy against employers who discriminate against workers or applicants from Ethiopian origin, thus providing recognition to their aspiration for equality. The Court awarded the compensation in the sum of 95,000 NIS (25,000 USD) (Em.C. 9690/09 *Abebe Itzhak v. A.A. Moked 101 LTD* (23.10.12)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 5(E)(3) (Planning for the Bedouin Population)

29. As part of a land arrangement procedure in the northern Negev area that began in 1971, Appellant No. 1 (deceased) claimed ownership to six land lots. The State also claimed ownership to these lots and based its claim on the fact that the lots were located in areas that were expropriated by it in 1954 in accordance to the *Land Acquisition Law (Authorization of Activities and Compensation)* 5713-1953 (hereinafter "the *Acquisition Law*"). The arrangement procedure in regards to these lots was never finalized, and in 2006, the heirs of Appellant No. 1 (Appellants no. 2-16) filed six petitions to the Be'er-Sheva District Court in order to receive ownership of these lots. The Court dismissed these claims, noting that land expropriation was duly carried out in accordance with the *Acquisition Law* and that the plaintiffs failed to prove their claims in relation to title of the plots that were the subject matter of the claim. The Court ordered that the land referred to as Blocks 400367, 400371, and 400369 were to be registered in the name of the Development Authority (a government agency created in 1951 to manage the lands acquired by the State, in accordance with the *Acquisition Law*), whereas the land known as Blocks 400526 and 400527 were to be registered in the name of the State of Israel

(C.C. 7161/06, *Suleiman Mahmud Salaam El-Uqbi (deceased) et. al. v. The State of Israel* (15.3.12)). An appeal was filed to the Supreme Court.

On May 14, 2015, the Israeli Supreme Court, presiding as a Court of Civil Appeals, rejected the appeal on the above-mentioned decision of the Be'er-Sheva District Court.

The Court rejected the appellants' claims in regards to the validity of the 1954 expropriations that were carried out in accordance with the *Acquisition Law* and stated that there was no reason to intervene in the lower Court's decision to register the State and the Development Authority as the owners of these lands.

The Court, however, further examined whether the appellants had any other rights or benefits with respect to these lands, which entitled them to alternative land or compensations in accordance with Section 3 of the *Acquisition Law*.

The appellants claimed that the lands with respect to which they claimed ownership were "Mirie" type lands – land owned by the State in which certain usage rights were given to a private person (Section 1 to the *Ottoman Land Law*). After reviewing the relevant laws and evidence presented by the appellants, the Court noted that not only had the appellants not acquired any rights on the lands which they claimed ownership to, but that they did not present any evidence that proved that the lands in question were in fact "Mirie" type lands.

Following a detailed examination, the Court held that the lands in question were "Mawat" lands, i.e.: barren land owned by the State that and not allocated for the use of any person (Section 1 to the *Ottoman Land Law*) in which, according to the relevant legislation, no rights can be acquired even by way of limitation – an alternative claim that was presented by the appellants.

Thus, the Court rejected the appeal. The Court further noted that it was not an issue of dispute that the rights of the Bedouin population to the Negev lands is a wide issue worthy of a solution that will be acceptable by all parties (C.Ap. 4220/12 *Sliman Mhammad El-Okby (deceased) et. al. v. The State of Israel* (14.5.15)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 6

30. On July 12, 2015, the Tel Aviv-Jaffa Magistrate Court ruled on a suit of a plaintiff who claimed that he was discriminated against due to his dark color and Middle Eastern appearance while he attempted to enter a dance club and was twice rejected. The Court noted that discrimination based on color and Middle Eastern appearance is similar to racial discrimination and stated that the plaintiff proved he was discriminated against, in contrast to the *Prohibition of Discrimination in Products, Services and in Entry into Places of Entertainment and Public Places Law*. The Court stated that such discrimination should be eliminated and denounced, and awarded the plaintiff compensation in the total amount of 60,000 NIS (15,800 USD) (Tel Aviv-Jaffa Magistrate, Civ.C. 35199-09-13 Court Ben Moshe v. A.B.C. Rotchild Ltd. et. al. (12.7.15)).
31. On February 1, 2016, the Court ruled in favor of three plaintiffs who filed a civil suit claiming that they were discriminated against based on their ethnic origin, in violation to Section 3 of the *Prohibition of Discrimination in Products, Services and in Entry into Places of Entertainment and Public Places Law*. The plaintiffs claimed that due to their Middle Eastern appearances they were denied entry into a dance club, and when they asked for the reason of refusal the hostess used an ethnic pejorative as an answer. The Court ruled that the plaintiffs proved that they were discriminated against based on their ethnic origin, violating the *Prohibition of Discrimination in Products, Services and in Entry into Places of Entertainment and Public Places Law*. The Court awarded each of the plaintiffs compensation in the amount of 8,000 NIS (2,100 USD) and additional expenses in the amount of 8,000 (for all the plaintiffs) (Jerusalem Magistrate Court, Civ.C. 17534-01-14 Ben Nachum et. al. v. Alega Dance Bar Ltd. et. al. (1.2.16)).
32. On March 20, 2015, the Court ruled in favor of a plaintiff who filed a suit claiming he was discriminated against due to his dark skin and Middle Eastern appearance when he was denied entry into a dance club, while his friends with lighter skin color were allowed to enter. After hearing all the witnesses, the Court noted that the plaintiff was discriminated against in violation of Section 3 of the *Prohibition of Discrimination in Products, Services and in Entry into Places of Entertainment and Public Places Law*. The Court noted that discrimination is an unacceptable phenomenon, especially with regards to entry into clubs and public

places, and it has to be opposed and eliminated. The Court ruled compensation of 50,000 NIS (14,700 USD) and expenses in the amount of 6,000 NIS (1,580 USD) in favor of the plaintiff *Tel Aviv-Jaffa Magistrate Court E.Civ.C. 45828-04-14 Elad Nachum v. Perach Yachsey Tzibur VeYazamut Ltd.* (20.3.15)).

Judicial Decisions Relating to Article 7(B) (Sport Activities)

33. In a recent Supreme Court decision, the Court was asked to rule on two appeals concerning the possibility of issuing a removal order against a person who violated the Law while attending a soccer game abroad. In this case, on July 23, 2015, the Jerusalem Magistrate Court issued a restraining order against several persons for various time periods after they had disturbed public order during a soccer game that took place in Belgium - a disturbance that included making obscene gestures toward the fans of the other team and lighting torches and throwing them into the field. Following these actions, the Israeli Police filed a request for restraining orders against several fans of the Israeli team who were present at that game and who had participated in the public disorder. The Magistrate Court further ordered that these persons were to report to a police station near their place of residence during their teams' soccer games and ordered them to sign guarantees to ensure the fulfillment of these orders.
34. These persons appealed this decision to the Jerusalem District Court, where their appeals were separated into two cases. In *Ot.Cr.R. 7317/15*, the Court rejected the appeal and affirmed the restraining order. Here, the District Court stated that the Appellant did not claim that the soccer game abroad was not considered a sports event in accordance with the Law and that the Appellant acted in a way that gave rise to a suspicion that his attendance at a sports event will lead to public disorder. In the second case (*Ot.Cr.R. 7634/15*), however, the District Court accepted the appeal and annulled the restraining orders, stating that a sports event in the context of the Law includes only events that take place in the State of Israel, and therefore it is impossible to issue a restraining order based on the law for an event that took place abroad.
35. The Appellant in the first case appealed the District Court's decision in his regard, and the State appealed the Court decision in the second case. The Supreme Court,

after hearing all sides, determined that according to the purpose of the Law, it is impossible to attribute to the legislator the intent to restrict the term "sport event" only to events that take place in Israel. The Court added that the Law's purpose is to provide an answer to the phenomenon of violence in sports by instructions that are preventive by nature. Since the purpose of a restraining order is to prevent future threat posed by a person against whom such an order has been issued, the Court ruled that the interpretation of "sport event" is not limited to events that took place only in Israel. The Court stated, however, that issuance of a restraining order based on behavior that took place abroad required a careful and individual examination of the circumstances, in a way that balances the interest of public order against the interest of the individual (*Ot.Cr.R. 7317/1, Maor Meir Kadosh et. al. v. the State of Israel et. al.* (7.2.16)).

Part II – Plans and Projects to Promote Understanding, Tolerance and Friendship among Nations

Programs to Promote Understanding, Tolerance and Friendship among Nations and Populations - Relating to the Report's Introduction

1. The "Peres Center for Peace" launched in 2002 a program titled "Twin Schools for Sport and Peace" in which Israeli (Jewish and Arabs) and Palestinian children and youth ages 10 to 18 meet during sport events that are intended, among other things, to promote values of teamwork, acceptance of others, coexistence and peace. Each year about 1,500 pupils participate in this program throughout Israel.
2. The Bible Lands Museum in Jerusalem operates several programs to encourage respect, coexistence and tolerance between Jews and Arabs in Israel. These programs provide opportunities to meet and learn about each other's culture and heritage in a calm and constructive atmosphere. Among these programs are: "Future Meets the Past" in which thousands of kindergartens children of Jerusalem's eastern neighborhoods visit the museum and participate in enriching activities that provide the opportunity to learn about the Jewish culture; the "Character of Abraham" program provides Arab and Jewish pupils with the opportunity to meet one another

and study about the similarities and differences in Judaism and Islam. In addition, following requests by kindergarten teachers from the eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem, in 2012, the museum launched a special 10-meeting program aimed at providing these teachers with better tools for teaching young children of tolerance and coexistence. In light of the success of this program, dozens of kindergarten teachers applied to participate in this program in 2015-6 school year and the program still continues.

Project Towards the Preparation of Updated Planning Schemes for Arab Localities - Relating to Article 2B(2)(II) (Planning Scheme for the Arab Population)

3. The objectives of the project noted in the Report are:
 - Improvement of the quality of life in the localities, including a significant proliferation in residential areas, employment areas, open spaces, public facilities, and suitable infrastructure in order to address the long-term needs of the localities.
 - The regulation of the planning situation, in order to meet the needs of the localities and their integration in the surrounding area.
 - The provision of a planning basis towards the integration of the minorities' localities in the socio-economic development of the Israeli society in general.
4. In May 2016, the Committee for the Promotion of Preferable Areas for Housing decided on the deposition of a building plan for a new neighborhood in the Arab city of Taibe that will include 2,300 housing units, in addition to employment and commerce areas in a total area of 30,000 square meters. This is one of the largest building plans for the Arab population in recent years.
5. Also in May 2016, the MOI approved the recommendation of a municipal border committee, according to which the municipal locality of Sakhnin will receive an additional area of about 2,100 dunams that is required for its expansion and reallocated from the land of its neighboring regional municipality of Misgav.
6. As of December 2016, 131 of 133 Arab localities have approved outline plans. Of these 133 localities: 71 have approved updated outline plans (from 2004 and

onward); 17 have new outline plans undergoing statutory approval. It is expected that in the next two years, the approval procedures will be completed. New outline plans are in the process of being prepared for an additional 21 localities, including updating three of the above mentioned approved plans. Outline plans for 12 additional localities is scheduled to begin during 2017. Note that these updated outline plans, excluding those scheduled to be prepared in 2017, comprise 96% of the Arab population in the said 133 localities.

7. As of December 2016, 95 of the aforementioned outline plans for the Arab localities were promoted by the National Planning Administration. The rest of the plans are promoted by the local authorities, local councils or other governmental administrations.
8. The outline plans promoted by the MOI have added, on average, 70% to the localities' existing development lands, in addition to existing areas within the locality which are approved but not yet developed.
9. The vast majority of the outline plans allow for a larger population than the population prediction for the relevant planning period.
10. In order to allow the construction of a large number of residential units in a short period of time, the Planning Administration is currently conducting a pilot study, in which it is promoting detailed planning in two Arab localities with several planning challenges (such as the need to divert national infrastructures etc.). This is in addition to the above-mentioned approval of outline plans.
11. In accordance with Government Resolutions No. 2332 (of December 14, 2014) and 959 (of January 10, 2016), concerning the Development and Empowerment of the Druze and Circassian Localities for the Years 2016-2019, which include the preparation of detailed plans for localities of these populations, the Planning Administration is promoting such detailed plans concerning private lands in 13 localities.
12. One of the common reasons for delays in approving outline plans – in both Jewish and Arab localities - is lack of infrastructure at the regional level (such as sewage system, etc.). This issue was addressed in Government Resolution No. 208 of July 2015 which included a decision to promote a regional sewage master plan.

Implementation of the Outline Plans

13. The implementation of the outline plans is carried out by detailed plans, which are to be promoted by each and every locality. Since many of the Arab localities find it difficult to promote the needed detailed plans, and since these plans are crucial towards obtaining building permits, the National Planning Administration has taken upon itself to initiate a pilot of detailed planning, granting budget and professional support for promoting 45 detailed plans in 12 Druze localities. A similar project is to be carried out for other Arab localities.
14. The position of the National Planning Administration is that lack of an updated outline plan should not delay approving a detailed plan that is compatible with the national planning policy. Thus, in the majority of the localities lacking approved updated outline plan, detailed plans were and are promoted in order to issue building permits.

Inter-Ministerial Team Charged with Forming an Action Plan to Deal with Racism against Persons of Ethiopian Origin - Relating to Article 2C

15. This team is comprised of senior officials (Deputy Director General or branch managers) of the ministries specified in Government Resolution No. 1300, in addition to representatives of the Civil Service Commission, Israeli Police, the Equal Employment Opportunities Commissioner, representatives of the industrial sector, and representatives of the Ethiopian population.
16. The team's main tasks are: monitoring – locating and developing tools for securing information on cases and events against persons of Ethiopian origin for their color or origin, including the internet and social media; treatment – forming operation procedures for cases of racism and/or discrimination, including means to decrease and eradicate such cases and increase deterrence; and change of public mind – forming means to increase the presence of members of the Ethiopian population in places of influence in the public arena.
17. On July 31, 2016, the team presented the Prime Minister with the outcome of this work – a report concerning the elimination of racism against the Ethiopian population in Israel. This report includes 53 recommendations to be implemented

by various Government Ministries. Among the main recommendation are the establishment of a new governmental unit within the Ministry of Justice (MOJ) for the coordination of the fight against racism and the appointment of a person that will serve as a focal point and will be in charge of the fight against discrimination and racism in every Government Ministry. On August 1, 2016, the Ministerial Committee for the Advancement of the Integration into the Israeli Society of Israeli Citizens of Ethiopian Origin approved a decision in which it adopted the team's recommendations (as specified in Annex A to the Decision) and decided to implement several steps, including: noting the Attorney General's statement, according to which, he sees great importance in the fight against racism in general and specifically with dealing racism against persons of the Ethiopian population; noting the Minister of Public Security's statement, announcing that he took the necessary measures to eliminate racism and guided his Ministry to operate in accordance with the plan formed by the Police on this matter; the establishment of a new governmental unit within the MOJ for the coordination of the fight against racism; the appointment by the Minister of Justice of an independent public commission that will assist and consult the coordination unit; the appointment of a person that will serve as a focal point and will be in charge of the fight against discrimination and racism in every Government Ministry, free legal representation in claims of discrimination in regard to entry into public places, positive representation of persons of the Ethiopian population in the public sphere – including public places and the media and creation of a faster mechanism for placement of persons of Ethiopian decent with academic degrees in the public service. According to this decision, the new Unit to be established in the MOJ will be in charge of supervising the implementation of the inter-ministerial team's recommendations, receiving complaints concerning discrimination and racism and forwarding them to the relevant authorities, including safeguarding the handling of this complaints, composing an annual report regarding the unit's responsibilities, examinations of required legal amendments etc. In addition, the MOJ' Director General is required by this decision to report to the Ministerial Committee for the Advancement of the Integration into the Israeli Society of Israeli Citizens of Ethiopian Origin on the implementation of the abovementioned recommendations.

Police Relations with the Arab Population - Relating to Article 5B
(Security of the Person)

18. The Israeli Police carries out a regular annual work plan for strengthening and improving relations with the Arab community. During 2014-2015, a focused organizational effort was conducted on this issue in accordance with the plan - within which the following activities have been carried out with representatives of the Arab community:
 - 18.1. Routine contact with the leaders of the Arab population including in times of emergency, both proactively as well as on a regular basis, at all ranks.
 - 18.2. Commanders at the various levels meet regularly with representatives of the Arab population in their domains in order to present various police operations, attain their perceptions, as well as coordinate expectations.
 - 18.3. In Jerusalem, ongoing relations are maintained with the Waqf Administration and leaders of the Christian communities for maintaining public order at holy places. In addition, ties are maintained with dignitaries and public figures of the various Arab neighborhoods.
 - 18.4. The previous police commissioner proactively met with representatives of the Arab population (mostly authority heads and representatives of the committee of Arab authority heads and, at times, entities of the monitoring committees) once every few months, as well as depending on various events.
 - 18.5. The Traffic Department holds meetings and operations with representatives of the Arab community in order to better cope with traffic issues and traffic accidents.
 - 18.6. Police designated Advisors for Arab Affairs maintain routine communication channels with various tiers of the Arab population in order to learn of civil and social mindsets and needs (even those that are not the responsibility of the Police). Meetings are held routinely in order to address various issues; coordinating events involving large audiences for which the Israeli Police requires special preparations, special events, holidays celebrated by the Arab population in Israel (Muslim and Christian), ceremonial events etc.

- 18.7. Community models at districts – promotion of many community initiatives and projects unique to the Arab populations (for example: imam forums, prevention of the use of firearms at weddings, mediation, trainings at schools).
- 18.8. Police community days – all stations operating in Arab localities are required to hold a quarterly Community Police Relations Unit Day.
- 18.9. Community and Arab leadership meeting with the police command in the Southern District (a pilot program) led by the "City without Violence" headquarters at the Ministry of Public Security and the Ben Gurion University – the convention had been held in January 2015 and dealt with the issue of personal security in the Bedouin localities.
- 18.10. Booklets in Arabic regarding civil rights were distributed at the Citizen Service Centers at police stations.
- 18.11. Strengthening the ties with the Arab media stations – for relaying information and updates.

Police Relations with the Ethiopian Population - Relating to Article 5B (Security of the Person)

- 19. The Israeli Police has drawn a detailed plan for solidification of the trust of the Ethiopian population and reducing sensitive incidents. The plan includes, among other things:
 - 19.1. Training of Israeli Police officers on matters of policing in a multi-cultural community.
 - 19.2. Recruitment of persons of the Ethiopian population, their promotion and placement - raising the number of community members serving in the Police, augmenting the number of Amharic speakers at the police emergency line (100), thus making police services more accessible to the community.
- 20. **Operations at Police Stations** – this program includes better integrating representatives of the Ethiopian population. The program will be implemented in 26 police stations that have been selected due to their proximity to large Ethiopian population centers. One of the main goals is to create an ongoing dialogue with representatives of the Ethiopian population in order to coordinate activity

expectations, identify issues that require attention or treatment, and relay information in real time regarding emergencies. The activities will be carried out in collaboration with the Ethiopian population's leadership, the local authorities and NGOs, and an integrated forum will be established.

21. **Personal Cameras Pilot** – In August 2016, the Israeli Police began a pilot program involving personal body cameras attached to police personnel, in order to increase transparency regarding daily police operation, objective recording of incidents and in order to reduce clashes between police personnel and citizens. The Pilot is being carried out in accordance with a Police procedure and due regard is given to aspects of privacy, the use of gathered material as evidence, data protection etc. This pilot is due to end on February 2017. The study accompanying the pilot has not yet been completed. However, current findings **generally indicate** a decline in the use of force in police-citizen encounters with regard to **the entire population in Israel** and not just with regard to one specific population or another. The pilot does not examine findings with regard to specific populations and therefore it will not be possible to draw conclusions in this regard.

Steps Taken by the Central Elections Committee in order to Increase Voting Rate - Relating to Article 5C (Campaign to Increase Voting Rate)

22. The Central Elections Committee invests many resources in awareness campaigns, through the various media channels and social networks, in order to encourage voting. As evidence, the voting rate for the 20th Knesset stood at 72.34% - an increase of **4.57%** compared to the voting rate for the 19th Knesset. This voting rate is the highest voting rate since the elections for the 15th Knesset held in 1999.
23. Transportation to the ballot boxes' locations – transportation to the ballot boxes is carried out in accordance with Section 18 of the Parties Financing Law 5733-1973. The arrangement instructs that certain rides using public transportation, for the purpose of voting, is to be funded by the State Treasury. In recent elections, notices of the free transportation were posted in five languages (Hebrew, Arabic, Amharic, Russian and English) at the regional committees' offices, the Israel Post Offices, and the central stations of public transportation across the country. Notices had also been posted in all daily and weekly newspapers during the period prior to the

distribution of transportation tickets. The transportation tickets had been distributed at post offices, major bus stops and train stations across the country, as well as through the Student Union.

24. Campaign to encourage voting – the Central Elections Committee has produced a number of videos (infomercials) as part of a campaign aimed at encouraging voting for the 20th Knesset. These infomercials were presented by all radio stations, Television channels, and disseminated using various social media networks (such as YouTube, etc.) The videos were broadcasted several times on various broadcasting channels, including official news and entertainment channels, channels designated for specific populations (such as Channel 9 in Russian and television channels broadcasting in Arabic and Amharic), in order to reach all populations and as many voters as possible. To this end, the Committee had allocated a substantial part of its budget. Hereinafter are several examples of videos presented during this campaign:

- 24.1. A campaign titled "Complaining Police" had been produced, with the Participation of the President of the State of Israel. The aforesaid infomercials were posted on YouTube with subtitles in Arabic².
- 24.2. A video called "The Power of a Vote" was produced to demonstrate the process of elections to the Knesset and illustrate its importance. The video has versions with subtitles in Hebrew (for the hearing impaired), English, Russian, Amharic and Arabic³.
25. In addition, the E-Government Division in collaboration with the Central Elections Committee developed a special mobile application titled "Behiron 2015" prior to the elections for the 20th Knesset. The application assists in finding the location of the ballot box according to the voter I.D. number, provides the lists of candidates running for the 20th Knesset, and displays results in real time. The application has been developed in Arabic as well and has been available both for Android and IOS operating systems.

² https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EDHzZ_fMH7k
https://www.youtube.com/watch?t=60&v=Y_OE9LRZTvw
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=R-d8s1gy8nU>

³ <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PF0NR5sUjRw> – Arabic
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dmy62OeKilM> – Russian

26. Notice to the voters from the Honorable Justice Salim Joubran, Chairman of the Central Elections Committee for the 20th Knesset – on the eve of the elections was broadcasted both in Hebrew and Arabic
27. Website – the websites of the Central Elections to the 19th Knesset Committee and the Central Elections to the 20th Knesset Committee were translated into Arabic and English. Also, on the Hebrew websites, information pages had been posted in the following languages – Arabic, English, Russian, Amharic, Spanish and French, as well as a unique page in plain language for voters with intellectual disabilities⁴.
28. Political Campaign Advertisement- campaign advertisements on behalf of the parties are broadcasted in many languages for voters' convenience, in accordance to Sections 15 and 15A of the *Elections Law (Propaganda Methods)* 5719-1959. In practice the advertisements are broadcasted, as selected by the parties, in Hebrew, English, Arabic, Russian and Amharic.
29. **Accessibility** - a budget was allocated to provide assistance to local authorities towards improving the accessibility of polling stations to people of restricted mobility when making them accessible requires only minor adjustments. Please note that as of March 2016, 28% (2,938 out of 10,461) of the polling stations were accessible to persons with disabilities in comparison to 15.7% in 2011).

Steps Taken to Increase the Rate of Employment among the Arab Population - Relating to Article 5E(1) (The Right to Employment)

30. Increasing the employment rate in Israel among all population groups is a primary objective of the Government and of the Ministry of Economy and Industry (MOEAI) in particular. Hereinafter is information about Government actions to increase the employment rate among the Arab population (for both men and women):
31. Ryan Employment Centers - as of May 2016, there are 21 such centers operating in Arab localities to provide vocational training and placement assistance, with a budget of 200 Million NIS (52.6 Million USD) for a period of five years. Since their establishment, these centers have served about 17,000 applicants (60% of

⁴ <https://www.knesset.gov.il/elections19/heb/home.aspx>
<http://www.bechirot20.gov.il/election/Pages/HomePage.aspx>

whom are women), of which approximately 10,000 men and women were assisted in finding employment.

32. Daycare centers, nurseries and after-school programs - Education facilities for children aged 0-3 are highly significant for the reintegration of women into the labor market. To that end, a subsidy of 65 Million NIS (17.1 Million USD) per year exists for placing children into such programs. Additionally, in 2014 the Ministry initiated a new method of resource allocation for the planning and building of daycare facilities, clearing hurdles for the construction of daycare centers in Arab localities. For example, certain Arab local authorities are now not required to match funding, for the budget allocated by the authority in order to rent land or facilities.
33. During 2014-2015, the following budgets were allocated for Arab authorities:
 - 260 classrooms (in about 80 daycare centers) were established, at the cost of 10.3 Million NIS (2.7 Million USD).
 - 42 daycare centers were established, at the cost of 21.5 Million NIS (5.6 Million USD).
34. Professional Training - During 2014, professional training has been given to thousands of Arab applicants within the framework of morning and evening courses using the voucher system. With the voucher program alone, each year about 1,000 training course vouchers are provided to Arab applicants, 60% of whom are women.
35. Encouraging Entrepreneurship as well as Small and Moderate Size Businesses - In recent years the Ministry allocated significant budgets for assistance to businesses and entrepreneurs from the Arab population. About 1,400 Arab women participated in the "Initiating a Business" program facilitated by the Agency for Small and Medium-Sized Businesses' called the "Ma'of" field units.
36. In addition, three business centers designated for the Arab community were established in Yarka, Shefa-'Amr and Nazareth at the cost of 4.5 Million NIS (1.2 Million USD) for a period of three years. Also, hundreds of Arab entrepreneurs and business owners participated in business programs, funding channels and business accelerators provided by the Agency for Small and Medium-Sized Businesses.

37. Development and Establishment of Industrial Zones - By the end of 2016, the Ministry intends to construct and expand 37 industrial zones that serve the Arab populations both in the North and the South. The development of these zones enables entrepreneurs to obtain subsidized land lots (40% to 75% of the development cost) for establishing a business. Please see Table No. 5 in Annex No. I to this report for details concerning investments by the MOEAI regarding industrial zones at Arab local authorities (2006-2014) and Table No. 6 for details concerning the MOEAI's Investments in industrial zones in which Arab localities are partners (2006 – 2014).
38. Integration of the Arab population into the high-tech industry - On January 1, 2015, the MOEAI began operating a three-year program for the integration of 1,000 Arab university and college graduates in sciences and technology fields into the high-tech industry, with a budget of 10 Million NIS (2.6 Million USD).
39. The Agency for Small and Medium-Sized Businesses – This agency is responsible for providing a wide range of assistance with programs aimed at promoting such businesses and new entrepreneurs. The Agency, through its Ma'of field units, places an emphasis on providing services to all populations, including the Arab population, *inter alia*, by adjusting and creating specific assistance tools for the Arab population.
40. The Ma'of field units – these units include about 35 offices spread country-wide, including in Arab localities such as: Umm al-Fahm, Yarka, Taibe, Rahat, Shfar'am and Nazareth. During the upcoming work year, branches will be opened in Sakhnin and Baqa al-Gharbiyye as well. The Arab population also receives such services in offices that serve the general population such as in Be'er-Sheva, Haifa, Jerusalem, Ramla, etc. During the first six months of 2015, approximately 635 entrepreneurs from among the Arab population had been granted assistance services by the "Ma'of" units with a total cost of about 3.9 Million NIS (1 Million USD). In addition, over 280 business owners received assistance with a total cost of about 2.45 Million NIS (650,000 USD). The total budget that had been designated for activities within the Arab population for the 2016 year is 25 Million NIS (6.6 Million USD).

41. The Assistance Services specially designed for the Arab population include: personal business guidance; consulting in a wide variety of fields including such as import, export, sales, regulation, industrial design and information systems; assistance in obtaining funding, including assistance in filling out forms required by various financial sources, preparation for business meetings, aiding the business throughout the application filing process; training activities in necessary areas such as management, financial management, marketing and sales, internet marketing, Facebook, etc.
42. Additional assistance tracks including the "Initiating a Business" track – one of the leading assistance tools for entrepreneurs intending to establish new businesses thus creating new employment opportunities. The e-commerce track – an innovative program for businesses that brings about an increase in sales and financial stability for the businesses, etc.
43. Public procurement: a national project scheduled to begin the upcoming year. The project is intended to increase the number of small and medium-sized businesses among the Arab population that provide services and products to the public sector. The estimated cost of this program is one Million NIS (260,000 USD).
44. Employment of Arab teachers - The Ministry of Education (MOE) has invested a designated budget of approximately 5,000,000 NIS (\$1,250,000 USD) towards the implementation of a program aiming to place 500 Arab teachers into predominantly Hebrew-speaking schools by 2020. Other governmental and philanthropic sources are expected to invest another 3,000,000 NIS (\$750,000 USD) into this initiative during 2016. As of September 2016, there were 588 Arab educators teaching math, English, and science in Hebrew-speaking schools (an increase of 40% compared to only 420 such teachers three years ago).

Steps Taken to Increase the Rate of Employment among the Bedouin Population - Relating to Article 5E(1) (Employment among the Bedouin Population)

Employment Centers for the Bedouin population

45. Ryan Centers - The Government and the American Jewish Joint Distribution Committee have jointly decided to create unique employment guidance centers in

the Bedouin localities. These centers assist in enhancing the number of employed persons, aid in the creation of small businesses and enterprises, provide professional training and guidance for entrepreneurs and financial solutions and will hopefully lead to change in employment-related perceptions and norms in the Bedouin population, including encouraging the employment of women while providing them with specialized training. The first employment center was opened in Hura in April 2010. The center provides, *inter alia*, professional training, guidance for entrepreneurs, financial solutions for small businesses, daycare solutions and empowerment for women who seek employment.

46. As of November 2015, there were eight employment guidance centers ("Ryan Centers") that provide labor assistance, guidance and placements in all of the Bedouin localities including two that were opened in 2015 in the Neve Midbar and Al-Kasum Regional Councils. The construction of an additional center is currently conducted in Kuseife.
47. In 2015, these Ryan centers handled 2,855 new employment applicants, 1,683 of whom were assisted in the placement in positions of employment. Between 2012 and 2014, these centers handled 4,538 new applicants (over 50% of whom were women) and assisted in the placement of 62.5% of them. Also, 86% of the men and 66% of the women who found employment with the assistance of these centers continued to be employed a year later. Most of these employees were hired for full-time positions. Between 2012 and 2015, the average participation rate of women in this program was 51%. These centers hold a list of possible employers, which currently includes several hundred businesses and firms that assist in the placement of Bedouin employees.
48. **Professional training** – the MOEAI operates several tracks of vocational training including day trainings that are funded almost completely by the Ministry (except a small obligation fee); business courses conducted both by the Ryan centers and by private colleges and business entities in the Negev area; vocational training vouchers that enable the employment service and the Ryan centers to provide an applicant with a voucher that subsidizes a vocational training of his/her choice within the business entities that provide such training; an additional option is vocational training conducted by employers in the workplace. In 2015, 646 persons (38% of them were women) attended these courses that included: welding, office

management, medical cosmetics, computerized graphics, dental assistance, public vehicle driving, bookkeeping, bakery and other courses. Additionally, in 2015 about 900 persons, both men and women, attended workshops and seminars aimed at providing information and preparation for entry into the labor force. An additional 130 persons, both men and women, attended triple workshops that include vocational Hebrew lessons, computer skills, empowerment and preparation for entry into the labor force. In 2015, the total operational cost of these vocational centers was approximately 20 Million NIS (5.26 Million USD). In addition, the MOE operates seminars and classes for education completion.

49. The MOEAI operates three technological high-schools for Bedouin pupils between the ages of 15 and 18 in Hura, Rahat and Segev-Shalom. In 2015, 1,090 pupils, both male and female, attended these schools.
50. Moreover, the Ministry's Science and Technology Training Institute operates a special practical engineering learning course. In 2013 and 2014, a total of 98 Bedouin students graduated these studies, a third of them were women. In 2015, an additional 73 students graduated these studies. This course is conducted in four regional colleges in the Negev, and the students can choose the specific course of study. This learning course includes a full scholarship, monthly income scholarship and transportation fees, personal tutoring during the studies and placement assistance following graduation (an average sum of 40,000 NIS (10,500 USD) per student per year) for Bedouin students who meet the relevant requirements.
51. The MOEAI also operates vocational guidance and assistance program for those who wish to enter higher education institutions. This program includes tutoring and guidance before, during and after integration into higher education studies, enhancement courses in Hebrew and English, preparation courses for the psychometric test (higher education admission exam), assistance in enrolling to the chosen institution, preparation workshops to the academic world, and more. In 2015, 410 Bedouin students participated in this program, during which 14 psychometric test courses and six Hebrew courses were conducted. Of these participants, 120 registered to higher education institutions for the upcoming academic year.

Projects to Reduce Unemployment

52. **Employment tracks** - In order to encourage employment among the minority populations, a factory or entrepreneurial business in the industrial, services or tourism fields, which employs at least four new employees from the Bedouin or the Jewish Ultra-Orthodox population in the Negev, would be entitled to a reimbursement of 15% - 20% of these workers' monthly wages for a period of five years. The employer would also be reimbursed for the costs of organized transportation to and from the workplace, up to a total of 3,000 NIS (U.S. \$811) per worker, annually.
53. **Daycare centers** - due to the importance of daycare centers for the reintegration of working mothers into the labor market, in 2013 the MOEAI approved 95% of the requests for financial support from local councils in Lakiya, Tel-Sheva, Kuseife, Hura, and Segev-Shalom. In 2014, daycares for the children of 660 working Bedouin mothers were subsidized in these localities.
54. Furthermore, by virtue of Government Resolution No. 3708, the MOEAI's Investment Center operates employment programs in an effort to integrate new Bedouin workers into the workforce. These programs are based on the Ministry's Director General's Order No. 4.17.
55. This Director General's Order is aimed to promote the employment of populations with low participation in the workforce. The Arab population (including the Bedouins) is included in this program. Assistance is provided through the competitive allocation of funds for specific businesses as defined in the Director General's Orders, and which intend to establish or to expand a business in any part of the country, so long as at least 90% of their employees (and with regard to an expansion, at least 90% of the newly-employed workers) are members of a population with low workforce participation levels. Businesses seeking to receive this assistance must commit to employ workers for a period exceeding 30 months, with a minimum number of employees and a minimum salary level established by law. Those entitled to the competitive allocation receive a partial subsidy for the monthly salary costs of the employees throughout the 30 month period.
56. The Director General's Order gives preference to the employment of Bedouins from the Negev and establishes a lower minimum number of workers (compared to other populations) to qualify for assistance, requests that include employment

schemes in which at least 60% are of certain populations - and among them Bedouins - receive priority, and are examined prior to other requests. Furthermore, a higher subsidy level has been established with regard to the employment of male Bedouins.

Industrial Parks

57. Park – "Idan Ha-Negev" (The Negev Era) spreads over 4,500 dunams and is managed and operated by the three local authorities which established it – the Bnei-Shimon Regional Council, the Rahat municipality and the Lehavim local council. The park was established with an investment of 20 Million NIS (5.3 Million USD) and the MOEAI has allocated an additional 25 Million NIS (6.7 Million USD) for the second stage of development. Moreover, Government Resolution No. 3708 allocated an additional 68 Million NIS (18.5 Million USD) to further develop the park. This industrial park includes areas for industry, commerce, the construction of a hospital, college and public buildings. As of April 2015, the lots in the northern area of the park (about 500 dunams) were marketed to about 50 entrepreneurs and they are now in various stages of development. 65% of these entrepreneurs are Bedouins from the Negev who wish to establish factories that will employ local young Bedouins in order to lower the relatively high unemployment rates among the Bedouin population.
58. The first factory in "Idan Ha-Negev," SodaStream, has already begun operations and currently employs 850 workers (about 25% of them are Bedouin employees). An additional important factory, "Kargal," also began its operation in the park. The park's management is working to train and absorb Bedouin employees, both men and women, with the Employment Service Bureau in Rahat and Ryan Centers.
59. The Government has also allocated 40 Million NIS (10.9 Million USD) for the advancement of the joint industrial and employment zone at the Shoket Junction - a 4,000 dunams employment zone. The employment zone's municipal rate incomes will be divided between Bnei-Shimon, Meitar, Hura and Lakiya. As of June 2015, this joint industrial park was in advanced planning stages and construction works are expected to begin later in 2016.
60. The MOEAI is also working (as part of Government Resolution No. 3708) in Segev Shalom, Ar'ara and the Neve Midbar Regional Council (in the localities of

Bir Hadaj and Abu Krinat). In Abu Krinat, development works for the establishment of an industrial zone that will encompass an area of 100 dunams are nearly complete. The Regional Council recently began the marketing of the lots in the industrial park that have been developed for entrepreneurs. The land and deployment costs are subsidized at a rate of 85%. Furthermore, the development works of an industrial park that will encompass an area of 100 dunams in Bir Hadaj has begun and the Regional Council finalized the preparation of a tender for the development of this area. The MOEAI also financed the planning and zoning for two similar industrial parks in Umm Batin and Al-Seid. The Segev Shalom industrial area encompasses 495 dunam, of which 170 have been developed. One of the anchor factories in this area, which takes up 70 dunams, is a chicken product factory which employs 1,200 employees, of which 700 are Bedouin women and 300 are Bedouin men. This factory is due to expand by an additional 10 dunams and is expected to employ an additional 300 workers, many of them of the Bedouin population. The other businesses in this industrial area employ an additional 350 employees.

61. Furthermore, the *Encouragement of Capital Investments Order (Determination of Development Areas)* 5763-2002 was amended in order to strengthen the Arab localities, including the Bedouin communities. There are currently seventeen planned industrial areas in the Southern district, seven (41%) of which are located in Bedouin towns – Rahat, Segev Shalom, Hura, Abu Krinat, Bir Hadaj, Umm Batin and Al-Seid.

Center for Nurturing Entrepreneurship

62. As part of the implementation of Government Resolution No. 3708, the Bedouin Branch in the Agency for Small and Medium-Sized Businesses conducted 10 entrepreneurship and empowerment courses in 2013 and two courses during the first half of 2014. In addition, in cooperation with the "Koret Fund," the Authority provided micro loans for Bedouin and Arab women. In 2015, 20 Million NIS (5.26 Million USD) was allocated as micro-loans for this population.
63. The total budget designated for the encouragement of business entrepreneurship, under Government Resolution No. 3708, is 14 Million NIS (3.8 Million USD) to be implemented over 2012-2016.

64. Since the establishment of the Ma'of corporation in Rahat in June 2014, several improvements have taken place where the unit operates with a program more suitable for the Bedouin population, enjoys greater resources and personnel, and the tools that serve this unit have also been improved. The unit currently provides services towards mapping the customer's needs, providing both general and financial advice, training and guidance, holding conferences, and operates an ongoing project titled "initiation of a business". The office staff has been expanded and includes services adapted also to gender sensitivities. The unit is examining further fields of action such as the establishment of a business forum, assistance to farmers, etc.
65. In view of the difficulties and the unique nature of this population, the Ma'of field units have adapted their assistance mechanisms and work procedures to the characteristics of the population. The Bedouin localities in southern Israel were defined as "distant periphery", thus allowing for the operation of smaller groups in training sessions and courses, as well as for greater subsidies.
66. In 2015, as part of the implementation of Government Resolution No. 3708 the Ma'of field unit in Rahat provided consulting services, trainings, workshops, seminars and special programs to 420 entrepreneurs and small businesses (with up to 100 employees) of the Bedouin population.

Women's Entrepreneurship

67. In the framework of the Ma'of field units, women entrepreneurship is promoted. Such activities include training days for women in the various localities focusing on opening and managing a business, providing advice in the various aspects of business operation, etc. These activities are conducted in cooperation with the Ryan centers. The director of business services for Bedouin women invests great efforts in assisting women in opening small businesses. The director visits the homes of the women who attend the training days and who seek assistance in opening a business. These visits are conducted in order to identify potential women participants in a special course on business management.

Information on Government Actions to Increase the Employment Rate among the Ethiopian Population - Relating to Article 5E(1) (Promotion of the Ethiopian Population in the Labor Market)

68. In 2015, the MOEAI carried out professional training activities, as well as vocational training and follow-up activities, which included:
69. Employment centers - Pursuant to Government Resolution No. 4624 of May 13, 2012, the Ministry, together with the JDC, operates a four-year program for integration and promotion of the Ethiopian population into the labor market with a total budget of 15 Million NIS (4 Million USD). The goal of the program is to promote employment by providing education and training in various professional fields.
70. Allocation of vouchers for professional trainings - The vouchers system allows people to select a professional training course that matches their skill set, as the tuition is funded by the voucher. The budget of the vouchers for the Ethiopian population stands at 920,000 NIS (242,000 USD), for about 120 people in a variety of professions and occupations.
71. Group professional trainings - A number of professional training courses were held in the fields of computers and high-tech, as well as for construction-related professions. During 2015, a total of three training cycles were held at the cost of 600,000 NIS (158,000 USD) for approximately 60 participants.
72. Promoting excellence in the placement of university and college graduates - This program provides tools and skills that will train university and college graduates for employment that will suit their qualifications and experience. Among the activities carried out within this program are English language workshops, labor market skills workshops, and workshops in preparation for interviews. This program's total budget is 450,000 NIS (118,500 USD) for approximately 60 participants.

Designated Health Services and Infrastructures for the Bedouin Population - Relating to Article 5E(4)

73. In the framework of Government Resolution No. 3708 (of September 11, 2011) which specifies a plan for the economic development of the Bedouin population in the Negev, 90 Million NIS (24.3 Million USD) was allocated for the issues of society and community which includes the health field.
74. some of the main projects involve: increasing the number of Bedouin women mediators employed in the program for the reduction of infant mortality rate; continued research to map genetic diseases which are unique to the Bedouin population; enriching flour with folic acid for the benefit of pregnant women; establishing healthcare centers within the largest schools in the Bedouin population; implementing the national plan "Healthy, Active City", and promoting health and sustainability within existing frameworks in Hura and Lakiya.
75. Health clinics and medical services – As of April 2016, there are 60 health clinics providing for the Bedouin population in the Negev, including independent physicians who work with these clinics and provide services. Medical services are also available outside the Bedouin localities, such as in Be'er-Sheva, Yeruham, Arad, Dimona, Omer, Mitzpe-Ramon, etc.
76. The General Health Fund operates a clinic in Rahat that is open during evenings, nights, and over the weekend.
77. Clinics in unauthorized Bedouin villages located throughout the Negev are all computerized, air conditioned, and equipped according to the standards followed by all the Health Funds (HMOs) in the country.

Health Care

78. Immunization coverage - The figures show that the rate of immunization coverage regarding Bedouin children is over 90%, similar to the general population. In addition to vaccination in the Mother and Child Health clinics, a mobile immunization team by the Ministry of Health (MOH) provides home immunizations to infants in Bedouin families living in the Bedouin diaspora. In addition, 2014 figures show that the rate of immunization coverage regarding influenza among the Bedouin population significantly surpass that rate among the general population (41.8% and 31.3% respectively).

79. The Ministry's mobile immunization team mentioned above, together with a computerized tracking system, allows the Ministry to identify infants who are overdue for their immunizations and to send one of the mobile immunization teams to immunize them.
80. Nurses Serving the Bedouin Population - As of April 2016, there are 871 employed nurses who treat patients of all populations in the southern district. 100 of these nurses (11.5%) specifically serve the Bedouin population. The nurses receive supplementary training on issues that are specifically pertinent to the Bedouin population. The Ben-Gurion University has offered a nursing degree program geared to students from the Bedouin population. As of September 2015, 31 Bedouin students graduated from this program and an additional 27 are in their final year of study. Furthermore, as of April 2016, there were two ongoing Nursing Diploma Programs being taught at the Nursing School affiliated with Barzilai Medical Center in Ashkelon. As of April 2016, Arab students, including Bedouins, are 50% of the students studying nursing in universities, colleges and nursing schools and they enjoy scholarships like any other student. The MOH has made many efforts to recruit and fill all nursing positions within the Bedouin diaspora, including by offering financial and other incentives. Because of the turnover of nurses serving the Bedouin population, the Ministry is making continuous efforts to educate and recruit more nurses for this population.
81. Mother and child healthcare stations – As of April 2016, there are 47 mother and child healthcare stations located in the southern district, 27 of which (57%) are designated for the Bedouin population. As of April 2016, in the southern district there were 128 positions of mother and child healthcare nurses, 73 positions of which (57%) are designated for clinics that serve the Bedouin population specifically. As of April 2016, 66 of these 73 positions were filled (90%) and there was a very limited shortage of nurses.
82. Schools nurses - As of April 2016, there were 44.75 positions for school nurses in the southern district. Of these, 35 positions (78.2%) were designated for schools of the Bedouin population, and these positions have been filled.
83. Recent developments - In 2014, the Government approved Resolution no. 2025 in which it undertook to establish, between 2015 and 2019, six medical centers that

will provide medical assistance during night hours and on weekends (when regular clinics are closed) in the Negev area - among them in Ar'ara, Rahat and Kuseife and one that will serve the residents of Lakiya, Hura, and neighboring localities. The total budget for this issue is 18.5 Million NIS (4.8 million USD). The centers in Hura and Rahat are expected to be opened during 2016.

84. According to this Resolution, the Government decided to establish a steering committee headed by the MOH Director General, for the establishment of a new hospital in the Negev area. The budget for this purpose was set on 15,000 Million NIS (3.9 Million USD) for the years 2015-2016.
85. In addition, according to this Resolution, the MOH will renovate the mother and child healthcare stations in the relevant localities (including Bedouin localities) during the years 2015-2020 with a total budget of 40 Million NIS (10.5 Million USD).

Eradication of the Brucellosis Disease in the Negev

86. In recent years, there has been increased human contraction of the Brucellosis disease ("Malta Fever") in Israel, with a high rate of the cases among Bedouins living in the Negev. Brucellosis is a cattle-related disease that may be contracted by humans.
87. In 2014, the Veterinary Services of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development began operating a multi-year plan (2014-2019) dedicated to eradicating this disease among herds throughout the Negev. Within this plan, it had been decided to map out all of the herds in the Negev, fully subsidize vaccinations, as well as raise the awareness of the breeders and the population at risk. After collecting relevant data, it had been decided to remove infected animals from the herds and financially compensating the breeders, *ex gratia* (as most do not meet the criteria for compensation set out in the *Animal Diseases Ordinance (New Version)* 5747-1985).
88. In October 2015, the Ministry began implementing a pilot program in the city of Rahat and its adjacent area (about 500 herds) with a budget of 5 Million NIS (1.3 Million USD). This program is in its final stages, and appears to be successful.

89. Recently, the Israeli Government has approved an additional budget of 50 Million NIS (13 Million USD) for 2016 in order to eradicate the disease, and it was decided to gradually expand the plan all through the Negev. Indeed, 2015 findings reveal a decrease of approximately 30% in human Brucellosis incidence.

Health Services Dedicated to Migrants, Persons Who Entered Israel Illegally, and Foreign Workers - Relating to Article 5E(4)

90. The MOH operates several services dedicated to providing health services to migrants, persons who entered Israel illegally, and foreign workers – as detailed hereinafter:
91. **General Health Clinics** - which provide preventive medical services for infants, children and pregnant women, including provision of routine vaccinations. The MOH grants foreign migrants and workers with a basket of preventive health services which includes: supervision on growth and developments of babies and toddlers, and provision of routine vaccinations within mother and child healthcare stations. The service is provided free of charge, as received by all Israeli citizens. In the Tel Aviv-Jaffa area, most of the foreign workers and immigrants' children receive these services in the southern neighborhoods near their main places of residence. Additional stations operate in the cities of Bnei Brak, Beit Shemes, Jerusalem, Arad, Eilat and others.
92. **The Tel Aviv-Jaffa "Terem" clinic** - is funded by the MOH and is operated by the "Terem Emergency Medical Centers" firm. It provides primary medical care, including doctor examinations, and laboratory and imaging services (x-ray and ultrasound). A volunteer clinic with specialists in various areas also operates within this clinic.
93. **'Gesher' clinic for mental health in the community** - operates in Jaffa and provides mental health services, including psycho-social assistance and pharmaceutical treatment.
94. **The Lewinsky clinic** - this clinic operates in Tel Aviv-Jaffa and is tasked with raising awareness about, as well as the detection and treatment of, persons with sexually transmitted diseases. The clinic also operates a mobile unit which provides health services to homeless persons and prostitutes.

95. **Additional services** - are provided by NGOs and assistance organizations which provide medical services, such as the Clinic of Physicians for Human Rights (PHR) in Jaffa that provides preliminary medical treatment by volunteer doctors.
96. **Treatment for persons with tuberculosis** - is provided by the Tel Aviv-Jaffa Center for Tuberculosis and Treatment of Tuberculosis. Affected persons may be hospitalized, if needed, in "Shmuel Ha'rofe" Hospital.
97. **Urgent hospitalizations in hospitals** - the *Patient's Rights Law* 5756-1996 determines that each person in need of medical care is entitled to receive it according to the law and conditions set forth by the healthcare system in Israel. In case of medical emergency, any person is entitled to urgent medical treatment which is not conditioned on a preceding payment. The hospitals that provide this service to persons who have entered Israel illegally and reside in Tel Aviv-Jaffa are: Tel Aviv Sourasky Medical Center, the Wolfson Medical Center and Sheba – Academic Medical Center Hospital. Most service inquiries are to general and children emergency rooms and to the women and maternity wards.
98. **Health insurance to migrants' children until the age of 18 and unaccompanied minors** - after giving birth, mothers are entitled to register their children for the "Meuhedet" health fund and receive medical insurance by the State for 120 NIS (32 USD) per month. Upon such registration, the children are entitled to the complete health services basket, similar to any insured Israeli resident (excluding treatments abroad).
99. **Intervention program for African families lacking legal status** – family health care clinics in the city of Ashdod operate a specially designed program concerning health and parenthood, which is culturally adapted to families originating in Africa.
100. **Health Services available for persons staying in the "Holot" facility** - The health services provided in "Holot" facility include general free-of-charge medical treatment, primary medical care available six days a week, as well as medical care provided in cases of emergency by paramedics. Moreover, there is a physician on-call 24 hours a day, available for consultation with the medical team. The facility provides pharmaceutical treatment, laboratory examinations, etc. Further medical care is provided by the Soroka Hospital in Be'er-Sheva which provides hospitalization services, imaging services, and more. Treatment of tuberculosis is

provided by the Center for Tuberculosis Control and Prevention in Be'er-Sheva, and treatment of mental health is provided in a mental health center in Be'er-Sheva.

Programs to Foster Democracy and Tolerance – Relating to Article 7

101. The MOE has made a concerted effort to advance principles of democracy and coexistence in its curriculums, and through this educational approach, works to combat all forms of discrimination. In recent years, the Ministry has formulated several educational programs regarding democracy, tolerance and co-existence, which are intended, inter alia, to combat all forms of discrimination. hereinafter are short descriptions of these programs:

101.1. Tolerance, Prevention of Racism, and Coexistence Program – is a multi-year program suited for all ages and populations in Israel and focuses on education of tolerance, acceptance of the "other," coexistence and the prevention of racism. The program's goals aim to develop a combined Israeli-civilian identity, commitment for coexistence, tolerance and democratic values.

101.2. Living Together Program – an educational program facilitating meetings between Jewish and Arab pupils, with the aim of working together for the benefit of both local populations. The pupils are prepared for these meetings where they get to know one another, work together on planning and implementing activities, and learn about coexistence, tolerance, understanding the "other," etc. in 2015-6, 178 elementary schools and 189 intermediate and high schools (12,776 and 5,558 pupils respectively) took part in this program. In addition, 54 kindergartens, 173 elementary schools and 360 intermediate and high schools conducted Arab-Jewish meetings in the frame of this program.

101.3. From Holocaust to Human Rights Dialogue – this program emphasizes the importance of democracy and democratic values such as human rights and pluralism. As part of this program, Jewish and Arab pupils meet to learn and constructively dialogue about World War II and the Holocaust.

101.4. Bridge Among Cultures – The MOE has developed a new program in which Arab pupils will study Hebrew from kindergarten level to the 12th grade. The aim of this program is to enable better economic and social integration of

members of the Arab population in the community. In addition, in the frame of this program Jewish pupils will also study Arabic in the 5-6th grades.

- 101.5. "Ya Salam" – a program to promote coexistence and equality through joint Hebrew and Arabic classes in both Jewish and Arab schools. An additional similar program titled "Let's Talk" exposes Jewish pupils to the Arabic language and culture, inter alia, by integrating Arab teachers into Jewish schools.

Programs to Foster Democracy and Tolerance for teachers – Relating to Article 7

102. The MOE formulated training programs for teachers, aimed at assisting them in effectively introducing human rights, equality, tolerance, coexistence to their pupils. Among the programs offered are: seminars on the fight against racism, human dignity, human rights, etc. The Ministry also allocated an additional 100 teaching hours to schools that wish to promote coexistence and/or democratic values. Hereinafter are several examples:

- 102.1. Education Against Racism – training for teachers and the entire education staff on how to deal with expressions of racism, how to educate against racist expressions, how to develop and compose a teaching plan on these issues, and how to best implement these into schools and classrooms, etc. This program is aimed for pupils in intermediate and high schools.
- 102.2. Me and "The Other" – a training program aimed at training teachers on the use of educational contents and programs about tolerance, acceptance while deepening their understanding about violence within Israeli society and ways of fighting it. The program provides teachers, and thereby their pupils, with tools to deal with conflicts and diversity in Israeli society, prevent violence, and with knowledge regarding human rights and democratic values. This program is aimed for teachers and pupils in intermediate and high schools.
- 102.3. "Key to the Heart" Program – this program focuses on teaching children from 4th grade and up about the culture, society, history, faith and language of the Jewish and Arab populations. The program nurtures democratic values, respect, tolerance, openness, critical thinking, and empathy, while providing

concrete examples of implementing these values into daily life and in the context of the Jewish-Arab partnership. As part of this program, meetings between pupils from Jewish and Arab schools are facilitated throughout the year – both in order to meet and get to know "the other" and in order to work on and promote a joint community project. Currently this project is conducted in 20 schools in the mixed Jewish-Arab city of Ramla in central Israel.

- 102.4. Training of Kindergartens Staff in Acre on Tolerance and Coexistence – this program trains staff to educate children between the ages of three and six on studying and playing together, coexistence, and tolerance. This program is available for pupils and the children's parents.
- 102.5. Living Together through Art – a nationwide program that trains art teachers from both Jewish and Arab schools on how to write a teaching plan for children in 5th and 6th grades on tolerance towards others. As part of this program, Jewish and Arab pupils meet in order to produce joint works of art under professional supervision. These works are later displayed in four museums. An additional similar program is titled "Dialogue and Identity" also aimed for children in the 5th and 6th grades.
- 102.6. Israeli Hope – a program led by the Ministry, with the participation of the Israeli President and the Lautman fund, aimed at acknowledging schools that have made significant contribution to education partnership and commitment to integration in Israel. 119 schools participated in this program in 2015.

Part III – Additional Information on Government Resolutions

Government Resolution No. 208 on Facilitating Housing Issues for the Arab population - Relating to Article 2B(2)(II) (Facilitating Housing Issues)

1. In July 2015, the Government approved Government Resolution No. 208 that includes a set of recommendations based on a comprehensive report analyzing housing issues in Arab localities. This Resolution includes close to 40 sections dealing with the promotion and advancement of various aspects concerning housing in Arab localities, including, among other things: Promoting detailed planning and facilitating its approval, specifying measures to increase suitable land

for housing development, facilitating registry issues especially in built areas, increasing the number of independent Arab building and planning committees and strengthening them.

Government Resolutions No. 1480, 922, 2365 and 1052 on empowerment, development and socio- economic strengthening of the Bedouin localities - Relating to Article 2B(4)(III) (Facilitating Housing Issues)

2. On June 2, 2016, following extensive work carried out by the Authority, the Government approved Resolution No. 1480 titled "Government plan for the empowerment and socio- economic strengthening of the Bedouin localities in northern Israel for the years 2016-2020." The total budget for this comprehensive program is estimated at more than one Billion NIS (270.3 Million USD) over five years. This Resolution addresses key issues, among them: development and upgrading of public institutions in the plans' target localities; development and upgrading of public infrastructures, including religious sites and buildings, funeral homes and cemeteries; establishment of additional social services bureaus providing enhanced services; improvement of these localities preparedness for a state of emergency; upgrading and improving water and sanitation infrastructures; improvement of transportation safety and infrastructures; development of tourism capabilities; encouragement and support for small businesses; establishment of additional vocational guidance and assistance centers; construction of additional education institutions and day care centers and providing additional teaching hours and educational activities for this population; expansion of the science and technology activities available to this population; encouragement of participation in the National Civil Service; provision of assistance to discharged soldiers of this population; improvement of personal security; establishment of a Bedouin heritage center in northern Israel, and more. Approximately 15 Government Ministries and other professional bodies share these tasks. The Authority's work on this subject included: field visits and working sessions with members of the Forum of Bedouin Authorities' Leaders - with the participation of relevant Government Ministries; the hosting of two professional seminars with the participation of representatives from the Government Ministries involved in the process and professionals from the local

authorities, in order to determine the principles and define measures for the program; the preparation a planning file for each Bedouin authority in the north, addressing its future needs regarding physical infrastructures, the social and educational fields, and more. This plan strives to improve the socio-economic situation of the Bedouin Authorities and advance their integration into Israeli society, as well as to better utilize their great potential.

3. On December, 31, 2015, the Government approved Resolution No. 922 titled "Government activities for the development of minority populations for the years 2016-2020." In this Resolution, the Government decided to promote and implement a five-year plan (2016-2020) that will include economic integration of the Arab, Druze, Bedouin, Christian and Circassian populations in Israel. This Resolution aims at promoting and conducting improvements in several fields: Education - improving the teaching quality, promoting educational programs for scholastic achievements, allocation of budget for informal education and extra-curriculum activities etc.; Transportation infrastructures - improving public transportation, pavement of new roads in Arab localities, a pilot program for the training of Arab women as public transportation drivers and linguistic accessibility in Arabic; Commerce and trade - expansion of industry and employment parks, allocation of at least 50% of the employment track budget to population with low participation rates, allocation of at least 10% of the assistance budget of the foreign trade administration for the promotion of industrial activity of the Arab population in foreign markets etc.; Employment - establishing additional Ryan centers (employment guidance centers) for the Druze and Circassian populations, and an allocation of 200 Million NIS (52 Million USD) for the operation of these centers for the years 2017-2020 etc.; Public security - it was decided to establish additional police stations and increase the number of police personnel in Arab localities; Higher education - increasing the rate of Arab students studying for their first degree to 17% by 2021. This Resolution contains additional fields of operation and promotion, including: Housing, Health and more. The Ministry of Social Equality is charged with supervision and implementation of this plan.
4. On December 21, 2014, the Government approved Resolution No. 2365 titled "Government plan for the development of Minority Localities (including Arab, Bedouin, Druze and Circassian local authorities) in 2015." This Resolution aims,

inter alia, at improving transportation infrastructures, both internal and external roads and public transportation; improving water and sewage infrastructures; development of tourism infrastructures; finalizing the development of industrial areas; vocational training and support of micro hi-tech companies; construction of sports halls and courts; improving personal security and service to citizens including the "City without Violence" Program. **The total budget for this plan is 664 Million NIS (174.73 Million USD) for 2015.** Note that programs which began under this plan in 2015 are still in progress. This plan is a part of a multi-annual plan for socio-economic development in minorities' localities.

5. On December 15, 2013, the Government approved Resolution No. 1052 titled "Multi-year plan for the development and strengthening of the Druze localities in the Golan for the years 2014-2017." This Resolution aims at strengthening the Druze population living in the Golan Heights in various fields, including: education - construction of additional classrooms and kindergartens, development of education programs for all ages, including plans of preparation for higher education, enrichment and extra-curriculum activities, teachers training etc. with a total budget of 54 Million NIS (14.2 USD), promotion of additional employment opportunities and reinforcement of social services (with a total budget of 13 Million NIS (3.4 Million USD)), improvement of health services and infrastructures, completion of outline plans for these localities with a budget of 8 Million NIS (2.1 Million USD), establishment and maintenance of religious sites and structures (10.4 Million NIS (2.73 Million USD)), and improvement of transportation infrastructures (80 Million NIS (21 Million USD)). Additional fields of operation include: upgrading industrial zones, rehabilitation of old neighborhoods, etc.

Government Resolutions No. 1300, 324, 609 and 1107 - Relating to Article 2C (Advancement of the Ethiopian Population Integration into the Israeli Society)

6. On February 9, 2014, the Government approved its Resolution No. 1300 in which it mandated the Ministry of Aliyah and Immigrant Absorption (MOAIA), together with other relevant Ministries, to recommend a new policy for the advancement

and promotion, to the greatest extent, the integration of Israeli citizens of Ethiopian origin into Israeli society. According to this Resolution, such policy will be formed, inter alia, by a multi-sectorial consultation process that includes the relevant ministries, authorities and bodies in the Government, civil society organizations, the business sector, municipalities and local authorities and other individuals and groups. The Government assigned the relevant Ministries General Directors to appoint a senior official in each Ministry that will lead this work.

7. On July 31, 2015, the Government approved its Resolution No. 324 in which it adopted the steps (milestones) for Governmental policy for the advancement and promotion, to the greatest extent, the integration of Israeli citizens of Ethiopian origin into Israeli society. These milestones were formed through a multi-population consultation process following Government Resolution No. 1300. According to this Resolution, the relevant Ministries will prepare detailed plans for the integration of Israeli citizens of Ethiopian origin into Israeli society, which will be combined with a unified Governmental plan. In addition, according to this Resolution, the MOAIA will handle only citizens of Ethiopian origin that are in Israel less than 15 years, and the rest of the Ethiopian population will be handled by the relevant Ministries, similar to every other Israeli citizen.
8. On October 29, 2015, the Government approved Resolution No. 609 in which it approved the detailed plans of the Ministries of Education, Health and Social Affairs and Social Services. These plans include the required measures for success at the end of this four-year plan (2016-2019), and the relevant budget.
9. On February 4, 2016, the Government approved Resolution No. 1107 in which it approved the detailed plans of the Ministry of Defense, the Israeli Defense Force (IDF), the MOEAI, and the Civil Service Commission. These plans also include the required measures for success at the end of this four-year plan (2016-2019), and the relevant budget.

Government Resolutions No. 1402 - Relating to Article 5B (Security of the Person)

10. In April 10, 2016, the Government approved its Resolution No. 1402, titled "improvement of personal security in the Arab population and the Security in

Jerusalem. In the frame of this resolution, the Government assigned the Ministries of Public Security and Finance to promote a five-year program for the years 2016-2020, that will include the establishment of new police stations in Arab localities that lack such stations, reinforcement of existing police station in Arab localities and operational units, recruitment of additional 2,600 police personnel with a total cost of two Billion NIS (526.3 Million USD). In June 2016, following the approval of this Resolution and of Resolution No. 922 (mentioned above), an Administration headed by Major General Jamal Hakrush was established. The Administration is tasked with improvement of Police services rendered to the Arab population, inter alia, by recruitment of Police personnel of the Arab population, and increasing the number of Muslim policemen and women by 7-10% and with establishment of new police stations in Arab localities. The Administration is aiming to begin the recruitment of the first 200 Muslim policemen and women by the end of 2017. The new stations are to be established in the following localities: Majd al-Krum, Acre, Tamra, Maghar, Sakhnin, Kafr Kanna, Iksal, Jisr az-Zarqa, Baqa al-Gharbiyye and Qalansawe, however this list not final and the final locations will be determined according to operational parameters as well as cooperation with the heads of these localities' chairpersons. The additional eight Stations that will be reinforced include: Shfar'am, Nazareth, Umm al-Fahm, Taibe and Rahat. The Police is also investing great efforts in raising the number of Arab police officers, inter alia, in order to strengthen the cooperation of the Arab population with these police stations. According to the Minister of Public Security, the implementation of this plan will improve the personal security and life quality of the Arab population and is intended to decrease crime rates and violence throughout Israel.

Government Resolutions Relating to Public Transportation for the Bedouin Population - Relating to Article 5D(1) (Public Transportation Services in Bedouin Localities)

11. On September 11, 2011, the Government adopted Resolution No. 3708 which established a plan to promote the economic growth and development of the Bedouin population in the Negev (hereinafter: the "Development Plan"). The Development Plan is a detailed plan, budgeted at 1.2 Billion NIS (324.3 Million USD) over five years (2012-2016) and is allocated among other things, to

employment and education-supportive infrastructure, primarily transportation (276.5 Million NIS (75 Million USD)).

12. On September 23, 2014, the Government approved Resolution No. 2025 and thus resolved, among other things, to promote transportation in the Negev area, both for the benefit of the general population and for the specific needs and benefit of the Bedouin population. The Resolution includes, *inter alia*, the connection of the City of Rahat to interstate Highway no. 6, paving of roads, construction of public transportation terminals, construction of intersections, planning and construction of a new railway station and its connection to the main tracks, improvement of entry roads to and from the national roads network, etc. The total budget for these projects was set at 300 Million NIS (78 Million USD) for the years 2015-2020.
13. Between 2012 and 2016, the Ministry of Transportation and Road Safety prepared several plans for transportation projects with the participation of the Bedouin population. These plans were presented to the population and were prioritized according to their needs. The following are several examples of projects that were implemented in 2014:
 - 13.1. Segev Shalom – in 2014 work on an entry road took place and an entry road to Neighborhood E was completed.
 - 13.2. Lakiya – an access road to Al-Ma'araj school was budgeted and completed.
 - 13.3. Hura - an access road to A-Salam school was budgeted and completed.
14. In 2015, there were 26 bus routes serving the various Bedouin localities in the Negev area with a total of 546 daily circuits and 3,039 weekly circuits.
15. In Hura there is currently one inter-locality bus route which passes through the locality's main roads. The paving of roads in additional neighborhoods is nearing completion, which will then allow the bus line to serve the entire locality. Similar works are currently under way in Kseifa and Ar'ara
16. Since the approval of Resolution No. 3807, many bus routes have been added, among them routes that connect Bedouin localities to Be'er-Sheva and other main cities, thus connecting these localities with employment and higher education facilities.

17. Northern Bedouin localities - In 2011, Government Resolution No. 3211 (May 15, 2011) approved a multi-year plan (2011-2015) for the development of the Bedouin population in northern Israel, to the amount of NIS 350 Million (92.1 Million USD). According to the plan, nearly 90 Million NIS (23.7 Million USD) was invested in paving and upgrading transportation infrastructures in the northern Bedouin communities.

Government Resolution Relating to National Health Policy - Relating to Article 5E(4) (National Health Policy)

18. On September 23, 2014, the Government resolved to allocate 100 Million NIS (26 Million USD) for the development of health services in the Negev (Resolution No. 2025).
19. In addition, on December 8, 2011, the Israeli Government approved Resolution No. 3921 in which it approved the National Program for the Promotion of Active and Healthy Lifestyle that leads the national effort to promote health, healthy nutrition habits and physical exercise of all Israeli residents. This program is conducted with the cooperation of other Government Ministries, local authorities, health funds and civil society organizations
20. The program's goal is to create an environment that allows the Israeli population to preserve its health and correct bodily weight by healthy nutrition and physical activity in order to decrease the rate of chronic illnesses. This program's aim is to increase the number of persons performing regular physical activity as recommended by the WHO (for children at least 60 minutes per day and for adults at least 150 minutes per week). According to the program's main principles, every person has the right to a healthy and active life, to an environment that allows it, and to the right to influence the implementation of this right on the personal, communal and public levels. This program created many cooperations, initiatives and links between the national and local public sectors as well as the business sector.

Government Resolution No. 3148 of April 2011, regarding Special Education Frameworks Serving the Bedouin Population- Relating to Article 5E(5)

21. In accordance with Government Resolution No. 3148 of April 2011, the establishment of the three-part rehabilitation complex for Bedouin children with special needs in Tel-Sheva still continues. As of April 2016, part one of this complex is fully operational and provides education services to 270 Bedouin children. It comprises of eight kindergarten classrooms, a school with ten classrooms for children with mobility and/or moderate mental disabilities, and an elementary school with ten classrooms for children with mental disabilities. The second part of the complex will include a rehabilitative daycare center, health and rehabilitation center, a center for art therapy treatment, and a research unit under the auspices of the Ben-Gurion University. The construction of the second part has been delayed due to financial reasons. The third part of the complex will include two post-elementary schools and a sports center. One of these schools was approved for construction. In total, 550 children will attend this three-part complex upon its completion.

Government Resolutions Regarding Education for the Arab Population - Relating to Article 5E(5) (The right to Education and Training)

22. Government Resolution No. 2861 of February 13, 2011 in which the Government approved a four-year program (2011-2014) intended to promote the economic development and advancement of the Druze and Circassian populations by investing mainly in employment, education, infrastructure and transportation. The program's total budget is 680 Million NIS (184 Million USD).
23. Government Resolution No. 3211 of May 15, 2011 in which the Government approved a five-year program (2011-2015) intended for the economic development and advancement of the Bedouin population residing in northern Israel by investing mainly in employment, education and transportation. The program's total budget is 353 Million NIS (95.4 Million USD).
24. In Government Resolution No. 1775 of June 29, 2014 the Government approved a program aimed at strengthening personal safety and for the social and economic advancement of the entire Jerusalem population. In the context of this Resolution, several decisions were made concerning matters of occupational and higher education, including improving accessibility to higher education and decreasing

dropout rates among the Arab population in the eastern neighborhoods of Jerusalem. An inter-ministerial steering committee was established, jointly headed by the Director General of the Prime Minister's Office and the Ministry of Jerusalem and the Diaspora. The program's total budget was set at 200 Million (52 Million USD) NIS for the years 2014-2018, of which an estimated two-thirds of that sum was dedicated for social and economic development.

25. Following these programs, the MOE took upon itself to implement in the upcoming years various programs aimed at improving the achievements of Arab pupils and students, including by strengthening their academic learning skills. In addition, the Ministry operates educational programs aimed at assisting them in finding employment and developing successful career lives, in 50 high schools in the Arab population, which, *inter alia*, expose the pupils to academic life, academic possibilities and future employment opportunities, such as by meetings with Arab academic staff members in higher education institutions. The Ministry is working toward the establishment of 60 psychometric centers that will operate in high schools in the Arab population. For further information concerning Students in Universities, by Degree, Gender and Population Group, please see Table No. 13 in Annex No. I attached to this report.